
TRIVENT
PUBLISHING


TRIVENT
medieval

Religious Horror and Holy War in Viking Age Francia

Matthew Bryan Gillis

Renovatio – Studies in the Carolingian World, Volume 1

Religious Horror and Holy War in Viking Age Francia
Matthew Bryan Gillis
eISBN 978-615-6405-21-0
Renovatio – Studies in the Carolingian World, Volume 1
Series ed. Matthew Bryan Gillis
Responsible publisher: Teodora C. Artimon
ISSN 2786-3107
https://trivent-publishing.eu/67-renovatio

First published in 2021 by Trivent Publishing

Trivent Publishing
1119 Budapest, Etele ut 59–61
Hungary

For more information, visit our website: http://trivent-publishing.eu

RENOVATIO
STUDIES IN THE CAROLINGIAN WORLD

TABLE OF CONTENTS

PREFACE

This brief volume launches Trivent Publishing's new series, *Renovatio* – Studies in the Carolingian World. Since the early medieval Franks' ideas of religious horror and holy war have not yet received much scholarly attention, a book about them seemed a likely beginning for a series seeking to offer fresh interpretations and perspectives about this formative period in medieval Europe. My investigation explores how authorities in western Francia from the 880s through the 920s used the rhetoric of religious horror to cast Christian soldiers and nobles, who robbed the poor and the church, as monsters that devoured human flesh and drank human blood. Such horror served as a form of spiritual weaponry in the clergy's attempts to correct and condemn wayward military men. This study, therefore, unearths long-forgotten Carolingian thought about the dreadful spiritual reality of internal enemies during the era of the Viking attacks. I would suggest that this religious horror serves as a gateway into some of the Franks' most disturbing perceptions about the church's cosmic struggle against sin and evil. Simultaneously, however, such horror informed a new understanding of Christian heroism that developed in relation to the wars fought against the Northmen invaders. This vision of heroic soldiers, which included military martyrs, culminated in ideas about holy war against the pagans that foreshadowed later medieval Crusading thought. Thus Carolingian religious horror and holy war together belonged to a body of ideas about the spiritual, unseen side of the church's conflict against what it identified as evil, diabolical forces.

Nevertheless, the reader might ask: Why horror? Why monsters? Are approaches to and theories about these things useful for historians? Monsters could certainly serve many purposes in medieval texts. For instance, such rhetoric and imagery, whether intending to be frightening or humorous, were extremely effective at establishing the boundary between allegedly wholesome and degenerate peoples, denying or undermining the humanity of those deemed monstrous.[1] Forms of medieval monster theorizing in this way informed European prejudices and ideas of race.[2] Yet I would argue that horror possessed other uses too. Biblical scholars have demonstrated the importance of monsters, negative emotions, gory imagery and disturbing rhetoric in Scripture, which served to correct believers by revealing the grim results of human wickedness and immorality.[3] Horror thus had the power to return an audience to faith and humility before God. Ancient Roman epic and histories were equally not short of gruesome images and frightening rhetoric that showed evil's terrible effects upon the world.[4] Research on these biblical and Roman writings resonates with the findings of modern theorists, such as Julia Kristeva, who identifies literary horror's cathartic powers.[5]

[1] On medieval monsters generally, see Jeffrey Jerome Cohen (ed.), *Monster Theory: Reading Culture* (Minneapolis, 1996); id., *On Giants: Sex, Monsters, and the Middle Ages* (Minneapolis, 1999); John Block Friedman, *The Monstrous Races in Medieval Art and Thought* (Syracuse, 2000); and Bettina Bildhauer and Robert Mills (eds.), *The Monstrous Middle Ages* (Toronto, 2003), esp. 1-27.

[2] Geraldine Hen, *The Invention of Race in the European Middle Ages* (Philadelphia, 2018).

[3] Timothy Beal, *Religion and its Monsters* (New York, 2002); and Amy Kalmanofsky, *Terror All Around: The Rhetoric of Horror in the Book of Jeremiah* (New York, 2008).

[4] Aline Estèves, *Poétique de l'horreur dans l'épopée et l'historiographie latines* (Bordeaux, 2020).

[5] Julia Kristeva, *The Powers of Horror: An Essay on Abjection*, trans. Leon Roudiez (New York, 1982), 1-31.

Nonetheless, all of these ancient works were very much historical, since they spoke to audiences in terms that were both troubling and timely in their particular circumstances.[6] This study maintains that Carolingian authors and moralists likewise adopted horror in their writings—often borrowing directly from biblical texts—in order to unveil sin's dangers to individual Christians as well as the church and realm as a whole during the Viking attacks. The historical study of monsters and horror, therefore, enables us to identify these strategies and to assess their significance, including an articulation of holy war nearly two centuries before the Crusades that focused on protecting Francia from both internal and foreign enemies rather than waging war in the distant Holy Land.

The study is presented in four parts. Each part focuses on a particular set of religious horror sources that offer new insights into the Carolingian responses to soldier robbers during the Northmen's assaults. The book's alternative, essay-style approach suggests historical and intellectual connections rather than making a more traditional argument. The first segment introduces Carolingian religious horror, focusing especially on an attempt by the short-lived King Carloman II to condemn his realm's sinful soldiers as monsters in 884. Part Two examines the clergy's use of prayers to protect the church against such enemies and its curses for destroying them. Here we especially see the weaponization of horror rhetoric, imagery and emotions against these internal foes. Part Three moves in a different direction. The investigation centers on Abbo of Saint-Germain-des-Prés' new vision of Christian heroism in his epic poem about the Northmen's siege of Paris, 885-886. In this case, aspects of religious horror enabled him to divulge the spiritual side of war against the pagans. Finally, the book's last section demonstrates how Abbo drew from these different

[6] Andrew Tudor, "Why Horror? The Peculiar Pleasures of a Popular Genre," in *Horror, The Film Reader*, ed. Mark Jancovich (New York, 2002), 47-56, examines horror's historicity.

traditions to reveal the workings of the church's cosmic warfare on a vaster scale in his sermons from the 920s. He unveiled that monstrous soldiers might convert back to Christ to wage God's war against the pagans, or else they revealed themselves to be the walking damned, reprobates-in-the-making, creatures beyond redemption. According to his scheme, Christian soldiers would either be the church's greatest heroes or its most despised foes and persecutors. While, as already indicated, the topics discussed in this book prefigured some later medieval developments, they are considered here in their Carolingian context as a unique historical tradition worthy of study in its own right.

PART ONE

"AND THE BLOOD OF OUR BROTHERS
DRIPS FROM OUR MOUTHS"

KING CARLOMAN II'S MONSTERS & CAROLINGIAN RELIGIOUS HORROR

KING CARLOMAN II'S MONSTERS & CAROLINGIAN RELIGIOUS HORROR

In the upheaval of the Viking Great Army's invasions of the regions from the Loire to the Rhine (879-892), pagan pirates were not the only terrors facing the Franks.[7] In March 884, at the royal palace of Ver, King Carloman II of western Francia

[7] Walther Vogel, *Die Normannen und das fränkische Reich bis zur Gründung der Normandie (799-911)* (Heidelberg, 1906), 260-359 provides a narrative of the Great Army's invasions of the Frankish realms. For more recent work on the Vikings in the Frankish world, see Albert D'Haenens, *Les invasions normandes en Belgique au IXe siècle: Le phénomène et sa répercussion dans l'historiographie médiévale* (Louvain, 1967); Horst Zettel, *Das Bild der Normannen und der Normanneneinfälle in westfränkischen, ostfränkischen und angelsächsichen Quellen des 8. bis 11. Jahrhunderts* (Munich, 1977); Pierre Bauduin, *Le monde franc et les vikings, VIIIe-Xe siècle* (Paris, 2009); Carroll Gillmor, "War on the Rivers: Viking Numbers and Mobility on the Seine and Loire, 841-886," *Viator* 19 (1988), 79-109; ead., "Aimon's *Miracula Sancti Germani* and the Viking Raids on St. Denis and St. Germain-des-Prés," in *The Normans and their Adversaries at War*, ed. Richard Abels and Bernard Bachrach (Woodbridge, 2002), 103-128; and the following essays by Simon Coupland: "The Rod of God's Wrath or the People of God's Wrath?" *The Journal of Ecclesiastical History* 42 (1991), 535-554; "From Poachers to Gamekeepers: Scandinavian Warlords and Carolingian Kings," *Early Medieval Europe* 7 (1998), 85-114; "Frankish Tribute Payments to the Vikings and their Consequences," *Francia* 26 (1999), 57-75; "The Vikings on the Continent in Myth and History," *History* 88 (2003), 186-203; "The Carolingian Army and the Struggle Against the Vikings," *Viator* 35 (2004), 49-70; and "Holy Ground? The Plundering and Burning of Churches by Vikings and Franks in the Ninth Century," *Viator* 45 (2014), 73-97.

"mournfully and with vexation" warned his bishops, abbots, counts, judges and faithful followers of a terrible threat to the kingdom.[8] A "poison" had spread far and wide throughout the realm so that many were "infected and corrupted in body and mind by this most criminal and fatal disease."[9] The contagion was "the evil of robbery and plundering"—the worst of "the ensnaring sins and overflowing malice of perverse men."[10] To thwart this menace, King Carloman renewed the statutes against robbery of the holy fathers and his royal predecessors.[11] He also condemned the infected sinners as flesh-eating, blood-drinking horrors haunting the kingdom in this prophetic voice:[12]

> They do not recognize what Paul says, rather what God almighty says through him: 'The rapacious will not possess the kingdom of God' [I Cor 6:10], and not what the Apostle says elsewhere, that if we

[8] "287. Karolomanni capitulare Vernense. 884. March," ed. Alfred Boretius and Victor Krause, *MGH Cap.* 2 (Hannover, 1897), 371-375, here 371: "graviter et moleste." On Carloman II's brief reign, see Horst Lösslein, *Royal Power in the Late Carolingian Age: Charles III the Simple and His Predecessors* (Cologne, 2019), 89-101, 236-324 and 268-271; and Félix Grat, Jacques de Font-Reaulx, Georges Tessier and Robert-Henri Bautier, *Recueil des actes de Louis II le Bègue, Louis III et Carloman II: rois de France (877-884)* (Paris, 1978), xxxvi-lvi.

[9] "287. Karolomanni capitulare Vernense. 884. March," ed. Boretius and Krause, 371: "Siquidem ita passim longe lateque hoc venenum diffusum et dispersum est, ut quasi libere iam male abutantur omnes infecti et corrupti corpore et anima hoc tam sceleratissimo atque mortifero morbo…"

[10] "287. Karolomanni capitulare Vernense. 884. March," ed. Boretius and Krause, 371: "malum rapinae et depraedationis" and "peccatis impedientibus et malitiis perversorum hominum exuberantibus…"

[11] "287. Karolomanni capitulare Vernense. 884. March," ed. Boretius and Krause, 371.

[12] On the tradition of sermons being given at synods, see Maximilian Diesenberger, *Predigt und Politik im frühmittelalterlichen Bayern: Karl der Große, Arn von Salzburg und die Salzburger Sermones-Sammlung* (Berlin, 2015), 94-105.

devour and consume ourselves, that is we pillage, we soon come to naught [Gal 5:15]. Therefore, it is fulfilled in us, rather through us, what God Almighty censures through the Prophet Isaiah saying: 'Everyone will devour the flesh of his own arm' [Is 9:20], that is he will ravage the fortune of his brother. For he devours the flesh of his own arm and drinks the blood of his own arm, who takes away the fortune of his neighbor, whence his flesh must be sustained. For indeed it is no wonder, if the pagans and outer nations have dominion over us and take away our transitory goods, while everyone takes away from his neighbor forcefully that by which he ought to live. Therefore, it justly befalls us, what almighty God warns through the Prophet Isaiah: 'Woe, you who plunder, will you also not be plundered?' [Is 33:1] Truly we rob our brothers, and therefore the pagans rightly rob us and our property. How, therefore, can we securely march against our enemies and those of God's holy church, when 'the plunder of the poor is enclosed within our house?' [Is 3:14] And not only is it revealed within our house, but also it commonly happens that some proceed against the foe with a belly full of booty. How can we completely conquer our enemies, when the blood of our brothers drips from our mouth, and our hands are full of blood and our arms weighed down by the weight of suffering and robbery, weakening all of the strength of our mind and body? Our prayers are not received by God, because the clamors and weeping and deep sighs of the poor, the orphans and widows overcome and surpass our prayers, which made heavy by the bloody flesh of our brothers become

> hoarse, lacking the melodiousness of the sound of virtues."[13]

Notice how the troubling biblical image ripens here into full-blown horror. King Carloman explains that the passages from Paul and Isaiah describe robbers, whose crimes not only harm the realm's poor, but also—as revealed through the interpretation of additional verses from Isaiah—permit the pagans to defeat and plunder the Christians. The punishment uncannily sprouts from the crime itself. Then the image grows gruesome: one envisions sinful Christian soldiers, whose

[13] "287. Karolomanni capitulare Vernense. 884. March," ed. Boretius and Krause, 371-372: "…non recogitantes hoc, quod Paulus dicit, immo Deus omnipotens per ipsum: 'Rapaces regnum Dei non possidebunt,' neque illud, quod alibi apostolus ait, quia, si nosmetipsos comedimus et consumimus, id est depraedamur, cito deficiemus. Completur ergo in nobis, immo per nos, quod omnipotens Deus per Esaiam prophetam improperat dicens: 'Unusquisque carnem brachii sui vorabit,' id est substantiam fratris sui diripiet. Carnem enim brachii sui devorat et sanguinem brachii sui bibit, qui substantiam proximi sui tollit, unde caro sustentari debuit. Non est autem mirum, si pagani et exterae nationes nobis dominantur nobisque bona temporalia tollunt, dum unusquisque proximo suo per vim tollit, unde vivere debet. Ideo iuste convenit nobis illud, quod omnipotens Deus per Esaiam prophetam minatur dicens: 'Vae qui praedaris, nonne et ipse praedaberis?' Nos vero praedamur fratres nostros, et idcirco pagani merito nos nostramque substantiam depraedantur. Quomodo igitur securi poterimus pergere contra inimicos sanctae Dei ecclesiae et nostros, cum 'rapina pauperis inclusa est in domo nostra?' Et non solum domi reclusa est, verum etiam plerumque evenit, ut pleno ventre rapina in hostem quidam proficiscantur. Sed quomodo poterimus inimicos nostros devincere, cum sanguis fratrum nostrorum ab ore nostro distillat, et manus nostrae plenae sunt sanguine et brachia pondere miseriarum et rapinarum gravantur totaque virtus animi corporisque debilitatur? Preces nostrae a Deo non recipiuntur, quia clamores et ploratus altaque suspiria pauperum et orphanorum, pupillorum atque viduarum praeoccupant et praeveniunt preces nostras, quae crudis carnibus fratrum nostrorum gravatae raucitudinem acceperunt nullam sonoritatem virtutum habentes." For a previous translation see Barbara Rosenwein, "Feudal War and Monastic Peace," *Viator* 2 (1972), 129-158, here 149-150.

mouths run with human gore as they hoarsely pray for victory and whose weakened, blood-stained arms bear the fruits of their crimes as they march towards slaughter and defeat at the hands of an equally wicked, foreign foe. Meanwhile, the clamor of their poor victims rises up to God, drowning out their prayers for victory.[14] The audience could readily imagine that once their own monstrous troops were destroyed, the malicious invaders would be free to pillage and devastate the kingdom's people and property. The sermon's subsequent conclusion further emphasized how the soldiers' sins endangered both their souls and the realm. For robbers, who threatened the health and survival of the poor through hunger and cold, were theologically speaking murderers, who must return the stolen gains, do penance, flee the evil of robbery, and love their neighbors, "because otherwise we can neither resist our enemies nor possess God's kingdom."[15]

What was at stake here in King Carloman's preface was no less than Christianity's cosmic war against sin, evil and diabolical forces. The king and his supporters had been fighting the Northmen invaders since 879 when, after King Louis the Stammerer's death, "a lamentable and ruinous discord arose among the Franks" and brought the Vikings to the realm.[16] Counted among the king's chief advisors present at Ver in 884 were Hugh "the Abbot" and his archchancellor Bishop Gauzlin of Paris, two noblemen whose long careers involved serving the

[14] On the clamor of the poor, see Lester Little, *Benedictine Maledictions: Liturgical Cursing in Romanesque France* (Ithaca, 1993), 17-26 and 72-85.

[15] "287. Karolomanni capitulare Vernense. 884. March," ed. Boretius and Krause, 372: "quia aliter neque inimicis nostris poterimus resistere neque regnum Dei possidere."

[16] *Annales Vedastini*, s.a. 879-884, ed. Bernhard von Simson, *MGH scriptores rerum Germanicarum in usuam scholarum separatim editi* 12 (Hannover, 1909), 45-46, here esp. s.a. 879, 44: "miserabilis et excidiosa inter Francos orta est dissensio." On this source, see the forthcoming translation and commentary by Eric Goldberg.

realm and fighting the Northmen.[17] These leaders and their king formed part of a tradition of ancient and medieval Christians who understood themselves to be engaged in an ongoing struggle against evil, which involved not only the lamentable persecution and suffering of Christians, but also their punishment when their sins incited divine wrath. [18]

[17] Lösslein, *Royal Power*, 263-271. Based on his reading of Carloman's charters, Eric Goldberg, "Hincmar of Reims, Carloman II, and the *De ordine palatii*," (unpublished paper), identifies the following people as present at the council: the bishops of Bourges, Châlons, Marseille, Narbonne, and Paris, Carloman's chancellor Bishop Gauzlin of Paris, Abbess Adalgarda of the Holy Cross, as well as Hugh "the Abbot" and Count Theodoric of Vermandois. The author kindly thanks Eric for sharing his paper. For the charters, see *Recueil des Actes*, nos. 72-76, ed. Félix Grat, 185-198. On Gauzlin's career, see *Recueil des Actes*, ed. Grat et al, lxii-lxv; regarding Gauzlin's family, see Karl Ferdinand Werner, "Adelsfamilien im Reich Karls des Großen," in *Vom Frankenreich zur Entfaltung Deutschlands und Frankreichs: Ursprünge—Strukturen—Beziehungen. Ausgewählte Beiträge* (Sigmaringen, 1984), 22-81, here 76-81; and id., "Gauzlin von Saint-Denis und die westfränkische Reichsteilung von Amiens (März 880). Ein Beitrag zur Vorgeschichte von Odos Königtum," in *Vom Frankenreich zur Entfaltung Deutschlands und Frankreichs: Ursprünge—Strukturen—Beziehungen. Ausgewählte Beiträge* (Sigmaringen, 1984), 157-224. On Hugh "the Abbot," who was abbot of Saint-Germain (Auxerre), Noirmoutiers and Saint-Martin at Tours, see Janet Nelson, *Charles the Bald* (New York, 1992), 177-179 and 190-191; Werner, "Gauzlin von Saint-Denis," 395-462; and Édouard Favre, *Eudes. Comte de Paris et roi de france (882-898)* (Paris, 1893), 7-11.

[18] Key works include: Michael McCormick, *Triumphal Rulership in Late Antiquity, Byzantium and the Early Medieval West* (Cambridge, 1986); Judith Perkins, *The Suffering Self: Pain and Narrative Representation in the Early Christian Era* (New York, 1995); Daniel Boyarin, *Dying for God: Martyrdom and the Making of Christianity and Judaism* (Stanford, 1999); David Bachrach, *Religion and the Conduct of War, c. 300-c. 1215* (Woodbridge, 2003); Michael Gaddis, *There is No Crime for Those Who Have Christ: Religious Violence in the Christian Roman Empire* (Berkeley, 2005); Thomas Sizgorich, *Violence and Belief in Late Antiquity: Militant Devotion in Christianity and Islam* (Philadelphia, 2009); Matthew Gabriele, *An Empire of Memory: The Legend of Charlemagne, the Franks, and Jerusalem before the*

Carolingian Christians were expected to mourn and repent their sins in order to find reprieve from chastisement in the present and hopefully to escape eternal damnation in Hell.[19] They were also to glorify and praise God and the saints for delivering them from the enemy in the here and now; furthermore, military leaders and their forces, who defeated the enemy, were glorified and praised along with the divinely-granted victory, while those who failed received censure.[20] The

First Crusade (Oxford, 2011); Jay Rubenstein, *Armies of Heaven: The First Crusade and the Quest for Apocalypse* (New York, 2011); Katherine Allen Smith, *War and the Making of Medieval Monastic Culture* (Woodbridge, 2011), esp. here 9-38; Susanna Throop, *Crusading as an Act of Vengeance, 1095-1216* (Farnham, 2011); Laury Sarti, *Perceiving War and the Military in Early Christian Gaul (ca. 400-700 A.D.)* (Leiden, 2013); James Palmer, *The Apocalypse in the Early Middle Ages* (Cambridge, 2014); Philippe Buc, *Holy War, Martyrdom, and Terror: Christianity, Violence, and the West* (Philadelphia, 2015); Cecilia Gaposchkin, *Invisible Weapons: Liturgy and the Making of Crusade Ideology* (Ithaca, 2017), 22-64; and Boris Gübele, *Deus vult, Deus vult. Der christliche heilige Krieg im Früh- und Hochmittelalter* (Ostfildern, 2018).

[19] On the penance and pollution in the Carolingian world, see especially Abigail Firey, *A Contrite Heart: Prosecution and Redemption in the Carolingian Empire* (Leiden, 2009); 61-110; Mayke de Jong, *The Penitential State: Authority and Atonement in the Reign of the Louis the Pious* (Cambridge, 2009); 185-213; Rob Meens, *Penance in Medieval Europe, 400-1050* (Cambridge, 2014), 101-139; and Matthew Bryan Gillis, *Heresy and Dissent in the Carolingian Empire: The Case of Gottschalk of Orbais* (Oxford, 2017), 19-20 and 83-87.

[20] Bachrach, *Religion*, 32-63; Mary Alberi, "'Like the Army of God's Camp': Political Theology and Apocalyptic Warfare at Charlemagne's Court," *Viator* 41 (2010), 1-20; Mary Garrison, "The *Missa pro principe* in the Bobbio Missal," in *The Bobbio Missal: Liturgy and Religious Culture in Merovingian Gaul*, ed. Yitzhak Hen and Rob Meens (Cambridge, 2004), 187-205; Bernard Bachrach, *Early Carolingian Warfare: Prelude to Empire* (Philadelphia, 2001), 147-159; Renie Choy, *Intercessory Prayer and the Monastic Ideal in the Time of the Carolingian Reforms* (Oxford, 2017), 170-171; McCormick, *Eternal Victory*, 342-62 on Francia; and Coupland, "The Rod of God's Wrath," 547-550. On the cult of saints in the Carolingian

emotional dynamic involved in the process of correction—the lamentation and humble repentance for sins followed by a joyful celebration of protective holy powers—was integral to the spiritual transformation of individual believers and the church as a whole. In this sense, the theology of chastisement and correction was wedded to the emotions of penance and panegyric in order to achieve both earthly deliverance and ultimate salvation in what might be called a particular kind of Carolingian "emotional community."[21]

Much of what appeared in King Carloman's preface accorded with previous Carolingian thinking about robbers and the Northmen from the 840s through the early 880s. Scholars have demonstrated how the unfolding of Christian conflicts with the Vikings was often less than straightforward, since Frankish rulers and their supporters not only fought against the foreigners, but also regularly negotiated with them, created alliances to their mutual benefit, and even granted them Christian lands to protect and settle.[22] Nevertheless, religious leaders in the divided Frankish realms argued that Christian sins angered God, who provoked violent and bloody pagan attacks as a form of chastisement and correction.[23] Archbishop Hincmar of Rheims (845-882) shaped much of this discourse in

period see Thomas Head, *Hagiography and the Cult of Saints: The Diocese of Orleans, 800-1200* (Cambridge, 1990), 20-57.

[21] Barbara Rosenwein, *Emotional Communities in the Early Middle Ages* (Ithaca, 2006); and ead., *Generations of Feeling: A History of Emotions, 600-1700* (Cambridge, 2015), esp. 3-10 where she reiterates her earlier approach. See also my "Pleasures of Horror: Florus of Lyons's *Querela de divisione imperii*," in *Carolingian Experiments*, ed. Matthew Bryan Gillis (Turnhout, forthcoming) for a different spiritual response to the horrors of the 840s.

[22] Lösslein, *Royal Power in the Late Carolingian Age*, 261-294; Bauduin, *Le monde franc et les vikings*; and these essays by Simon Coupland: "From Poachers to Gamekeepers," 85-114; "Frankish Tribute Payments," 57-75; and "The Carolingian Army," 49-70.

[23] Coupland, "The Rod of God's Wrath," 537-540; and Zettel, *Das Bild der Normannen*, 185-197.

the western Frankish kingdom through his numerous writings and his direction of episcopal councils, all of which formed a relentless program of reform for the realm.[24] Meanwhile, other authors lamented the Christian immorality and faithlessness that seemed not only to cause pagan assaults on their people, churches and monasteries, but also prevented their armies from resisting and defeating the attackers.[25] In particular, Carolingian reformers identified the secular elites' and soldiers' robbery and oppression of the poor, the church and its dependents as the worst of their crimes, declaring at the Council of Quierzy, 857 and thereafter that such offenders were guilty of the double crime of sacrilege (*sacrilegium*) and murder

[24] Jean Devisse, *Hincmar archevêque de Reims, 845-882*, 3 vols (Geneva, 1975), here vol. 1, 526-548; Elisabeth Magnou-Nortier, "The Enemies of the Peace: Reflections on a Vocabulary, 500-1100," in *The Peace of God. Social Violence and Religious Response in France around the Year 1000*, ed. Thomas Head and Richard Landes (Cornell, 1992), 58-79, here 64-67 and 74-77; and Geoffrey Koziol, *The Peace of God* (Leeds, 2018), 20-24. Particularly significant church councils include: "11. Meaux-Paris, June 845 and February 846," ed. Wilfried Hartmann, *MGH Conc.* 3 (Hanover, 1984), 61-132; "38. Quierzy, 14 Febr. 857," ed. Wilfried Hartmann, *MGH Conc.* 3 (Hannover, 1984), 383-398; "3. Tusey, 22 October-7 November, 860," ed. Wilfried Hartmann, *MGH Conc.* 3 (Hannover, 1998), 12-42, esp. 12-13; and "10. Pîtres—Soissons, June 862," ed. Wilfried Hartmann, *MGH Conc.* 3, (Hannover, 1998), 90-122, esp. here 96-100. See also Goldberg, "Hincmar of Reims," who identifies Hincmar's influence in the 884 capitulary.

[25] Coupland, "The Rod of God's Wrath," 547-553; id., "Holy Ground," 73-97; and Zettel, *Das Bild der Normannen*, 189-195. Examples include: *Translatio sancti Germani Parisiensis*, ed. Charles de Smedt, Guilleme van Hooff and Joseph de Backer, *Analecta Bollandiana* 2 (1883), 69-98; Haimo, *De miraculis Sancti Germani*, *PL* 126: 1027-1050, who revised the earlier *Translatio sancti Germani Parisiensis* in the early 870s and added additional material; Bishop Hildegar of Meaux, *Vita Faronis episcopi Meldensis*, ed. Bruno Krusch, *MGH SRM* 5 (Hannover, 1890), 184-203, here esp. cc. 122-13, 199-203; and Paschasius Radbertus, *Expositio in lamentationes Hieremiae*, 4.2, ed. Bedae Paulus, *CCCM* 85 (Turnhout, 1988), 281-282.

(*homicidium*), whose punishment was excommunication.[26] King Carloman had already outlawed robbery a year before in February, 883, though apparently with little success.[27] Accordingly, his capitulary of 884 called upon a robber to make financial satisfaction and to perform public penance "so that he might satisfy God and the church, which he harmed;" if a bishop found that his summons went unheeded by the perpetrator, then the former was to "strike him with his pastoral rod, that is the sentence of excommunication" until he should make proper satisfaction and possibly be restored to the community.[28] In this sense, King Carloman sought the correction of the monstrous robbers plaguing his realm along the same spiritual lines that authorities had been using since the Viking attacks began in earnest in the 840s.

Carolingian thinkers were not the first to wrestle with the problems of robbery and civil discord as revealed by scripture and evident in the world. The church fathers had focused on the problem of quarreling in general in relation to Galatians 5:15: "Because if you are biting and eating each other, see that you are not devoured by each other."[29] Jerome, for instance, interpreted it as a warning "lest we take away from each

[26] "38. Quierzy, 14 Febr. 857," ed. Hartmann, 383-398, in particular the *Collectio de raptoribus*, 392-394; and Magnou-Nortier, "The Enemies of the Peace," 64-65, who identifies *Decretales pseudo-isidorianae et capitula Agilramni*, ed. Paul Hinschius (Leipzig, 1863), 78, 97, 118, and 144 as Hincmar's source for such ideas.

[27] "286. Karolomanni capitula Compendii de rapinis promulgata. 883. Febr. 22," ed. Alfred Boretius and Victor Krause, *MGH Cap.* 2 (Hannover, 1897), 370-371. On the earlier history of sacrilege in the Carolingian world, see Michael Glatthaar, *Bonifatius und das Sakrileg: Zur politischen Dimension eines Rechtsbegriffs* (Frankfurt am Main, 2004), esp. 1-41.

[28] "287. Karolomanni capitulare Vernense. 884. March," cc. 4-6, ed. Boretius and Krause, 373, here esp. c. 5: "ut Deo et ecclesiae satisfaciat, quam laesit" and "…feriat illum pastorali virga, hoc est sententia excommunicationis…"

[29] Gal 5:15: "Quod si invicem mordetis et comeditis/ videte ne ab invicem consumamini."

other."[30] In a similar vein, Augustine read the same passage as a warning against conflict and litigation: "You quarrel with each other, you take away from each other, you cast aspersions at each other."[31] Yet Gregory of Tours identified the passage's significance to violence and robbery in a very specific historical way. While he indicated that the task of the historian was to record "the wars of kings with hostile nations, of martyrs with pagans, of the churches with heretics," nevertheless he regretted in his prologue to Book Five of his histories that contemporary rulers waged civil wars and destroyed one another instead of fighting against foreign enemies as King Clovis had done.[32] The kings of Gregory's day—though wealthy from their ancestor's wars—broke the peace and coveted each other's property, so that Gregory warned: "Beware, I ask, what the apostle said: 'If you are biting and eating one another, see that you are not devoured by one another."[33] Then he warned them that civil wars and discord had destroyed earlier kingdoms, showing them here how they would end up unless they abandoned their servitude to greed:

---

[30] Jerome, *Commentarii in Epistolam Pauli Apostoli ad Galatas*, ed. Giacomo Raspanti, *CCSL* 77A (Turnhout, 2006), 177: "ne detrahamus invicem." Regarding Isaiah, however, Jerome, *Commentarii in Esaiam*, IV, ix, 21, ed. Marc Adriaen, *CCSL* 73 (Turnhout, 1963), 130-133, here 132-133 focused on Israel's greed and self-destruction, and then turned to a tropological interpretation of heretics corrupting and perverting the realm's youth.

[31] Augustine, *Enarrationes in Psalmos*, lxxiii, 16, ed. Eligius Dekkers and Johannes Fraipont, *CCSL* 39, 2nd ed (Turnhout, 1990), 1015 interpreted Gal 5:15: "Litigatis cum invicem, detrahitis invicem, opprobria obicitis invicem."

[32] Gregory of Tours, *Libri Decem Historiarum*, I, prol. and V, prol., ed. Bruno Krusch and Wilhelm Levison, *MGH SS Mer* 1.1 (Hannover, 1951), 3: "bella regum cum gentibus adversis, martyrum cum paganis, eclesiarum cum hereticis…" and 193.

[33] Gregory of Tours, *Libri Decem Historiarum*, V, prol., ed. Krusch and Levison, 193: "Cavete illo, quaeso, apostoli: 'Si ab invicem mordetis et comeditis, vidite, ne ab invicem consummamini."

> Beware the discord, beware the civil wars, which overcome you and your people. What else must be hoped for except that your army be cut to pieces, and you—left without relief and oppressed by hostile nations—are forthwith overthrown? If civil war delights you, o king, then keep at the one which the apostle reminds us is conducted against each person, as the spirit strives for the flesh and the vices slaughter the virtues; and may you, a free man, serve your leader, that is Christ, you who fettered had formerly served the root of evils.[34]

Certainly, Gregory offered a disturbing warning about sin's power to endanger the realm. He called upon kings to fight a battle within themselves against their own tendency to sin rather than to harm their fellow kings and people with worldly violence. Yet Gregory did not use Paul's rhetoric of Christians devouring one another to develop a gruesome image of the offenders like the one found in King Carloman's prologue centuries later.

In order to understand such a striking difference, this study examines how the king and other Carolingian moralists used horrifying rhetoric to correct and condemn predatory soldiers and nobles in their cosmic war against evil. Indeed, such sinners were especially disturbing, since they constituted a grave threat to fellow Christians *within* the realm. Religious horror, I argue, gave teeth to the authorities' calls for correction—especially

[34] Gregory of Tours, *Libri Decem Historiarum*, V, prol., ed. Krusch and Levison, 193-194, the quotation on 194: "Cavete discordiam, cavete bella civilia, quae vos populumque vestrum expugnant. Quid aliud sperandum erit, nisi cum exercitus vester caeciderit, vos sine solatio relicti atque a gentibus adversis oppressi protinus conruatis? Si tibi, o rex, bellum civili delectat, illut quod apostolus in hominem agi meminit exerce, ut spiritus concupiscat adversus carnem et vitia virtutibus caedant; et tu liber capite tuo, id est Christo, servias, qui quondam radicem malorum servieras conpeditus."

when it laid bare the abject reality of sin's consequences in this life and the next. In this respect, King Carloman's monstrous portrayal of soldier robbers was particularly potent.[35] These horrors constituted "a site for religious reflection" and "a form of theological expression" particular to western Francia during the Viking attacks from the 880s to the 920s.[36] Certainly there was scriptural precedent for monsters and the horrorific language used to describe them. As Amy Kalmanofsky argues, biblical monsters existed to reform an audience and thereby restore its proper relationship with its God.[37] Following theorists Julia Kristeva and Noël Carroll, she identifies two essential components to scriptural horror's rhetoric of reform: the blood and corpses whose abjection revealed the sinful offenders' guilt and need for correction; and the monsters, including blood-thirsty pagans and even a cannibalistic God, who punished the sinners through violence and humiliation in order to bring about that correction.[38] Such disturbing imagery, violence and suffering were all linked with powerful emotions such as fear and shame in order to transform the audience from prideful sinners into the Lord's repentant servants.[39]

Carolingian horror related to the Northmen's attacks frequently worked in a similar vein, lamenting how greed and violence against fellow Christians angered God, who chastised and corrected his people through humiliation and slaughter. For instance, the anonymous *Translatio sancti Germani*

[35] For scholarship on medieval monsters, see the references in note 1 above.

[36] Beal, *Religion and its Monsters*, 8; and Tudor, "Why Horror?" 47-56 on the historicity of horror.

[37] Kalmanofsky, *Terror All Around*, 10-11 and 45-88. On biblical monsters overall, see also Beal, *Religion and its Monsters*, 23-55. Regarding Roman literary horror, see Estèves, *Poétique de l'horreur*.

[38] Kalmanofsky, *Terror all Around*, 9-14, 45-88 and 91-103; Kristeva, *The Powers of Horror*, 1-31; and Noël Carroll, *The Philosophy of Horror, or Paradoxes of the Heart* (New York, 1990), 12-58 and 97-144.

[39] Kalmanofsky, *Terror all Around*, 15.

Parisiensis, written at Saint-Germain-des-Prés, recounted the shocking and unprecedented Danish attack on Paris in 845, and Saint Germain's miracles coinciding with the transfer of his relics in order to return sinful Christian hearts to God.[40] The author mourned that an overwhelming abundance of sins had corrupted the entire realm and church in the upheaval of the empire's division in the early 840s so that, in the words of the Prophet Hosea, "blood touched blood" (*sanguisque sanguinem tangeret*), causing a wrathful God to unleash the terrible Northmen upon them just as he had sent the pagans to chastise ancient Israel.[41] The text recounted that when young King Charles the Bald assembled a mighty army against them near Paris, "those most impious and cruel Northmen, blasphemers of God, to the disgrace and derision of the king and his commanders and of all the Christians present there, hanged one hundred and eleven captives right before their eyes. And they butchered their way through dwellings and the streets, they hanged some from trees, meeting no resistance from so great a multitude."[42] This horrifying spectacle was very likely a large-scale pagan religious sacrifice intended to bring victory.[43]

---

[40] *Translatio sancti Germani*, cc. 1-6, 12 and 32, ed. de Smedt et al., 70-74, 78-79 and 93. Regarding the attack of 845, see Bauduin, *Le monde franc*, 158-171; and Nelson, *Charles the Bald*, 151-154. On this text and these events, see also Matthew Bryan Gillis, "Dreaming of Saint Germain: Violence, Visions and Holy Vengeance in the *Translatio sancti Germani Parisiensis*," in *In this Modern Age: Medieval Studies in Honour of Paul Edward Dutton*, ed. Courtney Booker and Anne Latowsky (Budapest, forthcoming).

[41] *Translatio sancti Germani*, ed. de Smedt et al., c. 2, 70-71. The scriptural reference is Os 4:2.

[42] *Translatio sancti Germani*, c. 12, ed. de Smedt et al., 78-79: "ipsi impiissimi ac crudelissimi Normanni, blasphematores Dei, ad opprobrium et derisionem regis principumque ejus seu omnium christianorum illic adstantium, centum et xi captivos coram eorum oculis suspenderunt. Et quosdam per domos et plateas trucidaverunt, quosdam arboribus suspenderunt, nullo ex tanta multitudine resistente."

[43] Coupland, "The Rod of God's Wrath," 545-546; and Coupland, "Vikings on the Continent," 190. On the Norse practice of ritual hanging, see: H.R.

While King Charles was willing to die defending the church, the author bemoaned the fact that the brave king could only grieve helplessly when his army fled: "helmeted and armored, covered by the protection of shields and lances, they turned in flight before the very fewest naked and nearly unarmed men (which we cannot say without a tremendous outpouring of tears), since the Lord deserted them on account of their sins: some across the mountain ridges, others across the valley floors, some through the flat fields, and some through the shades of the forests."[44]

The author of the *Translatio* was not the only writer to lament the 845 attack on Paris. In his *Expositio in Lamentationes*, Paschasius Radbertus exclaimed not only his shock that the Danes had dared to attack the city, but also his great concern that Christian sins were to blame.[45] His account expressed a collective sense of disbelief, grief and fear that the Franks could be so humiliated. Such circumstances called for lamentation in the tradition of Jeremiah, who had mourned such evils in his own time:

> And when they turned away from him, by whose favor they were protected, all of God's assistance departed from them and they became plunder among their enemies [Jer 2:14]—just as now our church,

Ellis Davidson, *Gods and Myths of Northern Europe* (Harmondsworth, 1964), 51-52; and Lotte Hedeager, *Iron Age Myth and Materiality: An Archeology of Scandinavia, AD 400-1000* (New York, 2011), 102-103.

[44] *Translatio sancti Germani*, c. 12, ed. de Smedt et al., 78-79: "galeatus ac loricatus, scutorum ac lancearum munimine tectus, alii per juga montium, alii per concava vallium, quidam per planitiem camporum, quidam vero per opaca silvarum, ante nudos ac pene inermes atque paucissmos homines (quod sine ingenti effusione lacrimarum dicere nequimus), Domino eum pro peccatis suis deserente, in fugam versus est."

[45] On Paschasius Radbertus, see Mayke de Jong, *Epitaph for an Era: Politics and Rhetoric in the Carolingian World* (Cambridge, 2019), 19-68 regarding his career and 39 and 87 for dating his commentary most likely to the late 840s, an argument which his discussion of the attack on Paris supports.

according to the mystical senses, is being plundered by enemies from all sides as I speak. Whoever would have believed or whoever could even have conceived that such a thing could happen in our lands as we all recently witnessed, which we grieved until we wept, and became so greatly afraid? We are still today no less frightened that pirates assembled from different retinues reached the edges of Paris and burnt with fire Christ's churches and along the shore on both sides. Who would ever believe, I ask, that bandits from an undistinguished nation would ever attempt such deeds? Or who could have supposed that a realm so glorious and so well defended and so very extensively populated and most steadfast in its peoples ought to be humiliated and defiled by such mobs? And I do not mention the fact that they hauled away so many riches and spoiled plunder and led away captives, but rather whoever could have believed that the lowest men would thus dare to enter our territories? For I confess that I deem not long ago none of the earth's kings would imagine such things and not a single inhabitant of our world might have heard that an enemy set foot in our Paris. Therefore, even if it is not something I should discuss here, it is still a thing I should lament and mourn.[46]

[46] Paschasius Radbertus, *Expositio in Lamentationes*, IV, 12, ed. Paulus, 281-282: "Cum autem ipsi aversi sunt ab eo cuius beneficio muniebantur recessit ab eis omne Dei praesidium et facti sunt inter hostes praeda sicuti et nostra nunc ecclesia iuxta misticos sensus hinc inde ab hostibus diripitur ut ita loquar. Quis umquam crederet vel quis umquam cogitare potuisset quod accidere tale aliquid potuisset nostris in partibus quod transcurso tempore omnes accidisse conspeximus doluimus ad deflevimus et valde pertimuimus? Unde et adhuc hodie non minus pertimescimus ut piratae diversis ad modum collecti ex familiis, Parisiorum attingerent fines ecclesiasque Christi igne hinc inde cremarent circa litus. Quis umquam

Just as in the case of Jeremiah's day, Paschasius Radbertus judged that God's people had turned away from him, so he removed his protection and allowed them become "plunder among their enemies." Like the *Translatio*'s author, Radbertus immediately thereafter rued the realm's overwhelming abundance of sins as the cause for God's humiliating chastisement, also including a reference to the Prophet Hosea's verse, "blood touched blood."[47] Thus the attack on Paris was a revealing event that rightly caused everyone to grieve, weep and fear. Radbertus focused especially upon his utter incredulity that such pirates and "bandits of an undistinguished nation" would dare to attack Paris. Equally unbelievable, he continued, was that such a powerful realm, one "most steadfast in its peoples ought to be humiliated and defiled by such mobs." Indeed, his concern was not even the fact that the Danes took away a significant amount of plunder or captives, but that the vilest of men risked entering Paris at all. This shocking and shameful event disclosed the Franks' otherwise unseen spiritual degradation. Radbertus concluded that the appropriate response to such a dreadful event was to "lament and mourn."

King Carloman's portrayal about the realm's monstrous soldiers sprouted from this Carolingian horror tradition, dramatically amplifying previous depictions of sinful soldiers and nobles in order to unveil the dire circumstances of his kingdom's struggle against evil. That soldiers ate peasants was

quaeso crederet quod latrones promiscuae gentis umquam talia auderent? Vel quis aestimare potuisset quod tam gloriosum regnum tamque munitum et latissimum tam populosum et firmissimum talium hominum humiliari vel foedari sordibus deberetur? Et non dico hi quod censum plurimum asportare et predas diripere vel captivos transducere verum quis credere potuisset quod tam vilissimi nostros adire fines auderent? Fateor enim ut aestimo non longe retro quod nullus ex regibus terrae ista cogitaret neque ullus habitator nostri orbis audire potuisset quod Parisius nostrum hostis intraret. Propterea hoc in loco et si non est quod exponam est tamen quod defleam et plangam."

[47] Paschasius Radbertus, *Expositio in Lamentationes*, IV, 13, ed. Paulus, 282.

of course a metaphor. Yet as Giselle de Nie has argued, medieval authors' metaphors revealed the otherworldly reality of their subjects, which in this case meant that these powerful soldiers were, spiritually speaking, cannibalistic fiends.[48] They could not defeat Christ's enemies because, by betraying the very community of the faithful they were charged with protecting, they had now joined God's traitorous foes and would suffer in eternity alongside the pagans unless they accepted correction. Accordingly, the metaphor reveals how in the great cosmic war, the soldier robbers—whether knowingly or not—had joined the forces of evil.

The horror rhetoric in King Carloman's prologue reflected to some extent the monstrous imagery used to describe the Northmen themselves in Carolingian sources.[49] An example contemporary to Carloman's text, the *Annals of St-Vaast*, noted how the Northmen—"thirsting for human blood" (*sanguinemque humanum sitientes*)—captured or slaughtered Christians; put their dwellings, churches, and monasteries to the torch; and pillaged moveable property.[50] In 884, the year of King Carloman's capitulary, the annalist intensified his horror imagery, describing a devastated landscape littered with

[48] While much of Giselle de Nie's work is concerned with metaphor, see especially "History and Miracle: Gregory's Use of Metaphor," in *The World of Gregory of Tours*, ed. K. Mitchell and Ian Wood (Leiden, 2002), 261-279. On medieval images of cannibalism, see Heather Blurton, *Cannibalism in High Medieval English Literature* (New York, 2007); and Merrall Llewelyn Price, *Consuming Passions: The Uses of Cannibalism in Late Medieval and Early Modern Europe* (New York, 2003). For another Carolingian allusion to cannibalism, see Angelbert, *Rhythmi de pugna Fontanetica*, ed. Peter Godman, *Poetry of the Carolingian Renaissance* (Norman, 1985), 262-264, where the first stanza invokes Saturn, who devoured his own children.

[49] Coupland, "Holy Ground," 73-97; and Zettel, *Das Bild der Normannen*, 114-138.

[50] *Annales Vedastini*, s.a. 879, ed. von Simson, 45-46.

civilian corpses, implying it was they who paid the price for Frankish sins and failures:

> The Northmen do not cease from taking captive and murdering the Christian people and demolishing churches, their walls destroyed and villages burned by fire. Indeed, in every street lay the cadavers of clerics, of lay people, of nobles and others, of women, of children and nurslings. In fact, there was no road or place, where the dead did not lie, and there was tribulation and suffering for everyone, seeing the Christian people laid waste *to their destruction* [Ezek 5:13-17].[51]

The annalist revealed both the Northmen's bloodthirstiness and their role as a wrathful God's chastisement of the Franks using prophetic, biblical language. Just as ancient Israel had offended its God, so had the Christians transgressed against their Lord and incurred punishment. The difference between the annalist's horror message and King Carloman's was that in the latter, the plundering monsters were to blame for their own gruesome crimes as well as the pagan devastation. The king's message applied not simply to all those generally who failed to abandon sin and correct themselves, but targeted a very specific group—soldiers robbing their fellow Christians.

Carloman's prologue also echoed traditional Carolingian thinking about sin and military defeat.[52] Two early war sermons from Charlemagne's time discuss the importance of

[51] *Annales Vedastini*, s.a. 884, ed. von Simson, 54-55: "Nortmanni vero non cessant captivari atque interfici populum Christianum atque aecclesias subrui, destructis moeniis et villis igne crematis. Per omnes enim plateas iacebant cadavera clericorum, laicorum nobilium atque aliorum, mulierum, iuvenum et lactentium. Non enim erat via vel locus, quo non iacerent mortui, et erat tribulatio omnibus et dolor, videntes populum Christianum *usque ad internitionem* devastari" [Ezek 5:13-17].

[52] Bachrach, *Religion*, 49-55, and the references in note 20 above.

being cleared of sin for success on the battlefield.[53] In the first, the preacher admonished soldiers so that—after having rid themselves of sin's wounds with the spiritual antidote of confession—and "persevering in the confession of the true faith, let us stand manfully in Christ's battle line, let us fight bravely so we conquer powerfully and are crowned happily!"[54] The second sermon urged soldiers to fight not for earthly reward or pomp, but to defend the Christian name.[55] Likewise, they should not commit robbery while on the march, instead taking only what they need reverently, lest they offend God.[56] The preacher then further explained the spiritual nature of warfare, indicating how remaining within God's law meant that Christ would direct his angel to defend the soldiers and protect their camp like arms against their enemies.[57] Therefore, soldiers were to know "God will not desert you, because your adversaries, who fight against you, not only fight against you, but against God, because persecutors of Christians and churches also despise the standard of the Holy Cross."[58] Soldiers should firmly serve their faith and fulfill God's will by fighting boldly and mightily against their enemies to defend Christianity, knowing that either they will be crowned here on earth with victory or they will enjoy the reward of eternal life with the Lord in paradise.[59]

---

[53] Albert Michael Koeniger, *Die Militärseelsorge der Karolingerzeit. Ihre Recht und ihre Praxis* (Munich, 1918), 68-72.

[54] Koeniger, *Die Militärseelsorge*, 69: "…in confessione verae fidei perseverantes stemus viriliter in acie Christi, pugnemus fortiter, ut vicamus efficaciter et coronemur feliciter!"

[55] Koeniger, *Die Militärseelsorge*, 73.

[56] Koeniger, *Die Militärseelsorge*, 73.

[57] Koeniger, *Die Militärseelsorge*, 73.

[58] Koeniger, *Die Militärseelsorge*, 73: "…quia deus non deserit vos, quia adversarii vestri, qui contra vos pugnant, non tantum contra vos pugnant, sed contra deum, quia persecutores christinaorum et ecclesiarum et vexillum sanctae crucis despiciunt."

[59] Koeniger, *Die Militärseelsorge*, 73-74.

Such thinking about the links between soldiers' spiritual health and their battles against Christ's enemies persisted throughout the ninth century. Authorities continued to assume, for example, that pious soldiers dying in battle against such foes would go to heaven. In 853, Pope Leo IV wrote that soldiers should march against the enemies of Christianity with "all terror and fear laid aside," and that anyone dying in battle against the pagans "will in no way be denied the celestial kingdom" since God knows whoever dies thus "shall attain a glorious reward from him."[60] In a similar vein, Pope John VIII in 878 assured the bishops in Louis the Stammerer's realm at the Synod of Troyes—where, incidently, the robbers of churches were condemned and threatened with excommunication—that "the repose of eternal life would receive those fighting vigorously against the pagans and infidels" in defense of God's holy church and the Christian religion.[61]

Yet the belief that immorality led to defeat remained too. We have already seen how King Charles the Bald's sinful army fled before the Northmen at Paris in 845. The *Translatio* also revealed that Frankish troops abandoned Rouen to the enemy

[60] Pope Leo IV, *Epistola* 28 (from 853), ed. Societas Aperiendis Fontibus, *MGH Ep.* 5 (Berlin, 1899), 601: "[Ex]ercitui Francorum. 1. [O]mni timore ac terrore deposito... regna illi caelestia minime negabuntur… ab eo pretitulatum premium consequetur." See also Gübele, *Deus vult*, 192-193; Albrecht Noth, *Heiliger Krieg und Heiliger Kampf in Islam und Christentum. Beiträge zur Vorgeschichte und Geschichte der Kreuzzüge* (Bonn, 1966), 95 and 104; and Carl Erdmann, *Die Entstehung des Kreuzzugsgedankens* (Stuttgart, 1965), 23.

[61] "9. Troyes (11 August-mid September, 878)," ed. Wilfried Hartmann, Isolde Schröder and Gerhard Schmitz, *MGH Conc.* 5 (Hannover, 2012), 76-148, here 98-101 on robbers; and Pope John VIII, *Epistola* 150 (to all the bishops in King Louis the Stammerer's realm in 878), ed. Societas Aperiendis Fontibus, *MGH Ep.* 7 (Berlin, 1928), 126-127: "requies eos aeternae vitae suscipiet contra paganos atque infideles strenue dimicantes." See also Bachrach, *Religion*, 60 as well as the references to scholarship in the previous note.

before they reached Paris on account of their fear: "For all of the commanders of the soldiers, who were inhabiting that land (which we cannot express without great moaning and sadness of heart), struck with great terror, had prepared themselves more for flight than resistance."[62] He clarified that they fled because of their sins. He wrote that "someone of the Christian name will be able to resist his enemies as long as the king of the heavens and earth stands forth as the inhabiter of his mind and body. For he says in a certain place in the holy Gospel: 'Without me you can do nothing' [Jo 15:5]. But since he disdained to preserve [Christ's] admonitions, then he could not stand before his foes."[63] Having abandoned God's commandments, the Frankish leaders and their troops were no longer fortified internally by the divine presence and therefore lacked the courage to stand up to Christ's foes. The *Translatio* reported that the Northmen, "thinking that the Christian people were lazy and averse to fighting," then massacred and captured the people of Rouen, putting villages, churches and monasteries to the torch.[64] At the Synod of Pîtres-Soissons in 862, Hincmar likewise warned that Christian soldiers could not overcome the Northmen, since they did not have Christ and the Holy Spirit in their hearts to council and protect them—"therefore," he added, "we cannot stand manfully against our enemies and

[62] *Translatio*, c. 3, ed. de Smedt et al., 71-72: "Omnes enim principes bellatorum qui ipsam incolebant terram (quod absque ingenti gemitu ac contritione cordis effari nequimus), magis se ad fugiendum quam resistendum, nimia perculsi formidine, praeparabant." On Frankish coastal defenses, see Coupland, "The Carolingian Army," 50-52.

[63] *Translatio*, c. 3, ed. de Smedt et al., 72: "Tamdiu enim quis inimicis christiani valebit resistere nominis, quamdiu coelorum rex atque terrarum ejus mentis ac corporis inhabitator extiterit. Ipse namque in quodam sacri Evangelii loco ait: *Sine me nihil potestis facere* [Jo 15:5]. Sed quoniam ejus monita servare contempsit, ante suos hostes stare non potuit."

[64] *Translatio*, c. 4, ed. de Smedt et al., 72: "…christianum populum ad bellandum pigrum atque inertem fore putantes…"

defeat them courageously."[65] He further explained that such soldiers were slain by corruption's deadly arms: "On that account, the country's inhabitants are killed and put to flight, because we have slain ourselves with the sword of sin."[66] Indeed, Hincmar warned that worse slaughters and disasters would befall the realm unless sinners converted back to Christ through penance and correction.[67]

In a similar manner, relatively recent accounts of Frankish military failures against the Vikings highlighted how sins led to humiliating defeats. For instance, in the 870s Bishop Gauzlin, then abbot of Saint Germain-des-Prés (Paris), commissioned his monk Haimo to revise the earlier *Translatio sancti Germani Parisiensis*.[68] The result was Haimo's *De miraculis sancti Germani*, which added an account of another Viking attack in 858 as well as the saint's additional miracles.[69] Haimo abbreviated the *Translatio*'s account of the events in 845, while still emphasizing that the magnitude of Frankish sins caused God to send the Northmen to chastise them.[70] The intervening decades had not lessened the horror for Haimo. He lamented that the Frankish soldiers did not fight the enemy when they landed in 845, so instead the Danes "leaving their ships, spread

[65] "10. Pîtres—Soissons, June 862," c. 1, ed. Hartmann, 97: "ideo contra inimicos nostros stare viriliter et vincere fortiter non valemus."

[66] "10. Pîtres—Soissons, June 862," c. 1, ed. Hartmann, 97-98: "Ideo habitatores terrae occisi et fugati sunt, quia nos ipsos peccati gladio occidimus."

[67] "10. Pîtres—Soissons, June 862," c. 1, ed. Hartmann, 98-100.

[68] Haimo, *De miraculis*, ep., *PL* 126: 1027-1028.

[69] Haimo, *De miraculis*, I and II, *PL* 126: retelling the events first recorded in the *Translatio* in col. 1029-1040 (which he misdates to 846) and those thereafter in col. 1039-1050. On Haimo's description of the 858 attack, see Gillmor, "Aimon's *Miracula Sancti Germani*," 103-128.

[70] Haimo, *De miraculis*, I, prol., *PL* 126: 1029; see also II, praef. and 5, 1039-1040 and 1042-1043, where he reiterates that the Northmen were sent to chastise the Christians through persecution. The corresponding passages in the original text is *Translatio sancti Germani*, c. 2, 70-71. The scriptural reference is Os 4:2.

out far and wide, began to butcher the multitude of both sexes, to take captives, to burn the villages, monasteries and churches as they devastated, and to exercise the full immensity of their wantonness with all cruelty on God's people while reveling wildly."[71] Haimo also mourned the shameful flight of King Charles's sinful soldiers even after the enemy hanged one hundred and eleven captives before their eyes: "Who, I ask, does not lament that before battle was engaged, the army fled; before an arrow was fired, it was struck down; before the shield's crash, it was thrown away disgracefully?"[72]

Bishop Gauzlin and others could have reminded King Carloman about this or similar accounts as they shaped the prologue to his capitulary in 884. Subsequent sections of this study will demonstrate that Carloman's monstrous robbers became part of a cluster of images and concepts that formed a coherent, theological whole with which Frankish reformers waged spiritual warfare on miscreant soldiers and nobles. Not insignificantly, these developments happened in an era when, as Wilfried Hartmann has shown, clerical authorities were developing from Hincmar's time into the early tenth century what would become the medieval church's definitive tradition of law and legal practice.[73] Therefore, this religious horror

[71] Haimo, *De miraculis*, I, 1, *PL* 126: 1029: "…exeuntes a navibus, longe lateque diffusi, coeperunt utriusque sexus multitudinem trucidare, captivare, villas, monasteria, ecclesiasque depopulando cremare, totamque suae libidinis immensitatem cum omni crudelitate in populum Dei debacchando exercere." The corresponding passage is *Translatio sancti Germani Parisiensis*, c. 4, 72

[72] Haimo, *De miraculis*, I, 1, *PL* 126: 1029-1030, with the quotation on 1030: "Quis, rogo, non doleret, antequam bellum committeretur, fugatum exercitum; antequam jaceretur sagitta, confossum; ante scuti collisionem, ignominiose subactum?"

[73] Wilfried Hartmann, *Kirche und Kirchenrecht um 900: Die Bedeutung der spätkarolingischen Zeit für Tradition und Innovation im kirchlichen Recht* (Hannover, 2008), including esp. 191-286 on new legal approaches and practices from this time.

served very much as an *active* way of shaping how the cosmic war against sin and evil unfolded in the realm from the 880s through the 920s, when western Francia was troubled by devastating Northmen attacks as well as internal conflicts. Indeed, Christian enemies in that era could be potentially more dangerous than foreign ones, since the former's nefarious activities caused the latter to descend upon the kingdom. As will become clear, authorities sometimes encouraged these monstrous soldiers to accept correction and return to the community, while at other times they condemned the perpetrators as irrevocably false Christians and Hell-bound horrors. Such different responses reflected changing historical circumstances as well as an interest among religious authorities to unveil the spiritual stakes of contemporary conflict, invasion and upheaval to both the soldiers themselves and their victims.

PART TWO

"MEN DEVOURING ONE ANOTHER DRINK THEIR NEIGHBORS' BLOOD"

SPIRITUAL PROTECTIONS AGAINST CHRISTIAN MONSTERS

SPIRITUAL PROTECTIONS AGAINST CHRISTIAN MONSTERS

Linked very much to the theology of King Carloman's monstrous robbers were the church's ways of protecting itself from them. While seemingly obvious, the importance of prayer as a mode for arousing spiritual assistance and force against enemies should not be underestimated in this respect. As noted above, Christians prayed to God and the saints for relief from their sins and protection from foreign enemies and other disasters.[74] This section examines texts in which the faithful sought divine assistance against enemies from *within* the church. These works include a pair of hymns and an important, precedent-setting case of excommunication. The investigation here will focus on how the authors of these texts adopted horror imagery and emotions in order to reveal the dreadful spiritual reality of the offenders' crimes and to call upon supernatural powers of protection and punishment. The first hymn condemns flesh-eating, blood-drinking robbers like those described in King Carloman's prologue. It appears to have been written around the time of and perhaps even in association with the king's Council of Ver, 884. The second is a lament composed in 900 by the canon Sigloard of Rheims to mourn the murdered Archbishop Fulco of Rheims and to condemn his assassins,

[74] In addition to the citations in note 20 above, see also Choy, *Intercessory Prayer*, who discusses key issues and previous scholarship, 1-24, and prayers related to rulers and society in general, 131-160 and 161-192 respectively; and Rosenwein, "Feudal War and Monastic Peace," 129-158.

Count Winemar and his men. As scholars have shown, Carolingian bishops in the second half of the ninth century sought to regularize the dreadful weapon of excommunication, which cursed offenders and cast them outside the bounds of the church's community and its powers of spiritual healing—thus denying them the possibility of salvation.[75] We have seen already that ecclesiastical authorities regularly called upon the clergy to administer such a punishment on unrepentant robbers. Winemar's excommunication at the Synod of Rheims, July 6, 900 proved to be a remarkable example clerical power exercised against a layman.[76] This section explores these works to see how they reveal some of the ways that the church used horror rhetoric to activate spiritual protections and weaponry against Christians who harmed their fellow Christians in the realm of western Francia.

The hymn *Dominus, caeli rex et conditor* was contemporaneous to King Carloman's prologue of 884 and provides an image of bloodthirsty robbers causing civil strife and persecuting the church, while praying to God for relief from such monsters. The text survives in a manuscript of the writings of Gregory of Nazianzus probably originating from Charlemagne's court, but later perhaps surfacing in lower Lotharingia; the codex also contains the more famous Eulalia Sequences, one in Latin and another in French written shortly after the saint's relics arrived at the abbey of Hasnon near St-Amand in 878, and the *Ludwigslied*, an Old High German text celebrating the 881 victory over the Danes at Saucourt of King

[75] Hartmann, *Kirche und Kirchenrecht*, 276-283. On early medieval excommunication in general, see Christian Jaser, *Ecclesia maledicens: Rituelle und zeremonielle Exkommunikationsformen im Mittelalter* (Tübingen, 2013), 26-53; and Little, *Benedictine Maledictions*, 30-44.

[76] On this important, precedent-setting case of public excommunication, see Jaser, *Ecclesia maledicens*, 54-63; and Little, *Benedictine Maledictions*, 121-122.

Carloman's deceased brother, King Louis III.[77] *Dominus, caeli rex et conditor*, which appears between the Latin and French Eulalia texts, was probably written sometime during the great discord among the Frankish magnates in 879 or in the first years of the 880s—perhaps even as late as 884 in conjunction with the Council of Ver.[78] The hymn described those who, succumbing to diabolical temptation, committed robbery in times of unrest—becoming very much the monstrous figures seen in King Carloman's prologue. The text also relates how such robbers will be punished in Hell, and closes with a prayer of protection from such evils. The perversion of the robbers' sins is highlighted by showing how it goes against the cosmic harmony instilled in all of creation by God:

I. 1a. The Lord, king and maker of heaven,
1b. Source and author of sea and earth,
2a. Ordered all creation to observe
2b. The law of peace under harmonious concord:
3a. As fire crackling in the cold

[77] *Dominus, caeli rex et conditor*, in Paul von Winterfeld, "Rhythmen- und Sequenzenstudien. 1. Die lateinische Eualiensequenz und ihre Sippe," *Zeitschrift für deutsches Altertum und deutsche Literatur* 45 (1901), 133-149, here I, ll. 1a-7b, 136-137 and 144. The MS is Bibliothèque municipale de Valenciennes 150, which eventually ended up at the monastery of St-Amand. On the codex, see Bernhard Bischoff, *Katalog der festländischen Handshriften des neunten Jahrhunderts (mit Ausnahme der wisigotischen). Teil III: Padua-Zwickau* (Wiesbaden, 2014), 395, n. 6345; Roger Berger and Annette Brasseur, *Les séquences de sainte Eulalie* (Geneva, 2004), 45-60; and the Paderborner Repertorium des deutschsprachigen Textüberlieferung des 8. bis 12. Jahrhunderts at http://www.handschriftencensus.de/7591 (accessed on September 2, 2019). Hubert Silvestre, "Un second témoin manuscrit de la séquence 'Dominus caeli rex,'" *Revue bénédictine* 91 (1981), 169-171 identified an additional manuscript from the tenth century containing *Dominus, caeli rex et conditor*, Bruxelles 5666, which Berger and Brasseur, *Les séquences*, 189-193 edit, discuss with commentary, and translate.

[78] Bibliothèque municipale de Valenciennes 150, folios 140v-141r.

3b. And vapor hovering over waters
4a. They accord in like agreement,
4b. + And thus show the state of things:
5a. So far as cold's numbness
5b. Tempers fire's force in peaceful tinder,
6a. Liquid, likewise mingled, wetting the dry breezes,
6b. Serves life's breath for those born from the earth.
7a. All cultivate the laws of peace and faith:
7b. The fields, the heavens and the deep sea's waters—
8a. A human being alone seized by demonic deceit
8b. Avoids peace and scorns concord,
9a. Loving wrath more and its torment
9b. Than the harmless time of peace.
II. 10a. Whence arises the slaughter of wars;
10b. Many perish from cruel swords.
11a. Among some comes civil strife:
11b. Brother tortures brother by robbery;
12a. Men devouring one another
12b. Drink their neighbors' blood.
13a. Human beings with such shameful deeds
13b. Crowd together the Stygian spirits,
14a. Seeing how the madness
14b. Of human sins, the profusion of crimes,
15a. Bury in the abyss the battalions of the impious
15b. Who armed persecute Christ's servants.
16a. Whence the prince of Hell shut in by flames,
16b. Soon to die, rejoices in such companions in death,
17a. Whom earthly raging, together with jealousy,
17b. Sends as condemned to torments in Tartarus;
18a. There they will reap the fruits of bloody rage:
18b. Sulfur, worms and the power of Gehenna's pitch.
19a. Lord, [king and maker of heaven,]
19b. [Source and author] of sea [and earth,]
20a. Take away these torments from your faithful ones,

20b. Remove strife, increase peace, bring joy
21. To those serving you.[79]

[79] *Dominus, caeli rex et conditor*, ed. von Winterfeld, 136-137:

I. 1a. Dominus, caeli rex et conditor,
1b. Maris et terrae fomes et auctor,
2a. Omnem iussit creaturam sub consona
2b. Observare legem pacis armonia:
3a. Ut algori calor crepitans
3b. Atque limphis aer volitans
4a. Parili foedere conveniant,
4b. + Sic quoque statum rerum conficiant:
5a. Quatinus frigoris rigor
5b. Igneam temperet vim placido fomite,
6a. Liquor item mixtus auris madens aridis
6b. Flatum vitae comministret terra genitis.
7a. Cuncta colunt iura pacis atque fidei:
7b. Arva polus et profundi stagnum pelagi—
8a. Solus homo fraude captus daemonica
8b. Pacem vitat atque spernit concordiam,
9a. Magis iras et earum supplicium
9b. Quam quietis amans tempus innocuum.
II. 10a. Unde bellorum clades oritur;
10b. Gladiis multi saevis pereunt.
11a. Apud quosdam fit civilis discordia:
11b. Frater fratrem spoliando discruciat;
12a. Se rodentes viri mutuo
12b. Bibunt sanguines affinium.
13a. Talibus homines flagitiis
13b. Stigios spiritus conglomerant,
14a. Visitent ut humanorum
14b. Rabiem scelerum, luxuriam criminum,
15a. Impiorum et abisso mergant cuneos,
15b. Qui armati persequuntur Christi famulos.
16a. Unde princeps inferorum flammis obsitus
16b. Gaudet tantos abiturus mortis socios,
17a. Quos terrenus furor, simul invidia,
17b. Tormentorum reos mittit in Tartara;
18a. Ibi fructus metent irae sanguineae:
18b. Sulphur vermes et gehennae vim piceae.
19a. Domine, ⌈caeli rex et conditor,⌉
19b. Maris ⌈et terrae fomes et auctor,⌉

As a hymn sung most likely by a soloist or small group of singers, the work would have blended its troubling message with melody and voice, making a prayer that on the one hand elicited the congregation's concerns about the horrors of civil strife and robbery as it reflected on the sinners' infernal punishments; on the other hand, the prayer appealed directly to God to rescue the faithful from the danger of such hellish punishments by ending the evils of strife and discord from their community.[80] Such a powerfully spiritual and artistic message could very easily have been developed for an event of great magnitude, whose participants shared the hymn's very concerns. King Carloman's assembly at the royal palace of Ver, where he issued his capitulary, is a likely and reasonable choice; alternatively, if the hymn had been written a few years earlier, it could have partly inspired the king's prologue.

Dominus, caeli rex et conditor contains potent and arresting imagery about the evil plaguing King Carloman's kingdom. First, the text presents the ordered state of the cosmos: the Lord commanded all creation to obey the law of harmony, a decree heeded by the land and sea and all of the elements. Indeed, the entire order cultivates the "laws of peace and faith." Only human beings prey to demonic lies and temptations destroy peace and concord by desiring anger and destruction. The emphasis on diabolic corruption that twists human wills into perversely "loving" (*amans*) wrath and its dreadful consequences rather than peace's innocent, harmless calm signified to listeners that those who overturned the cosmos's

20a. Haec tormenta tuis aufer fidelibus,
20b. Tolle lites, auge pacem, fer gaudium
21. Tibi servientibus.

[80] Christopher Page, *The Christian West and its Singers: The First Thousand Years* (Yale, 2010), 281-378 on the Carolingian tradition of religious singing up to King Carloman's time. On the spiritual importance of singing hymns, see Gunilla Iversen, *Laus angelica: Poetry in the Medieval Mass* (Turnhout, 2010).

natural harmony did so in the service of demons, whatever individual motivations seemed to drive them. The result of their corruption was "the slaughter of wars," where "cruel swords" slay many and cause civil war. Then follows the image of robbers and malefactors, whose crimes take on unnatural, bestial qualities through metaphorical characterization: "Brother tortures brother by robbery;/ Men devouring one another/ Drink their neighbors' blood." Here robbery is torture, whose diabolical madness leads to the eating of human flesh and drinking of human blood.

Some of the Latin terms are worth considering. The verb translated as "devouring" is "rodentes," which means to gnaw (like a rodent), but also to eat away, consume or even to backbite and slander. This is a powerful verb, since it captures each of these meanings simultaneously, which collectively represent the ways the powerful and greedy wear down and destroy each other and those beneath them. Likewise, the line translated as "Drink their neighbors' blood" contains the phrase "sanguines affinium." *Affinis* can signify neighbor or neighboring as translated, yet it can also mean more specifically those related by family or allied by marriage. Therefore, this word identifies as much "fellow men" as it does those joined through the closest bonds of blood or alliance. The multivalence of the term returns one to the hymnist's depiction of one brother torturing another through robbery, since the word could apply to brothers by blood or marriage as well as fellow Christian brothers in the community.

The hymn then turned to the fate of those embracing "such shameful deeds." Here the military terminology highlights how the offenders were soldiers: their crimes bury them in Hell with other "Stygian spirits," where as impious "battalions" (*cunei*) they recognize the insanity of their sins, since as "armed men" (*armati*) they persecuted Christ's servants. As a result, the Devil, whom they realize now they have been serving, rejoices in his companions in death, whose fury and envy have

condemned them to Tartarus's torments. Here an abysmal, inverted pastoral image describes the tortures of those who tortured others through robbery: "There they will reap the fruits of bloody rage:/ Sulfur worms and the power of Gehenna's pitch." Their bloodthirsty rage or madness (*ira*) will sprout forth the very punishments afflicting them. This line alludes to biblical passages describing Gehenna, including Isaiah 66:24 and Mark 9:43-49, whose most essential verse for our purposes reads: "Their worm will not die and their fire will not be extinguished."[81] Following the ancient and medieval science of maggots and dead flesh, the biblical authors and their medieval successors understood that worms spontaneously generated from the rotten flesh they consumed.[82] One of the most influential ancient commentators on this passage was Jerome, who claimed that the worms were "either understood as the eternal punishments, which are generated by one's conscience, or the material of torments, which is born from one's own sins. For so long as a cadaver has matter, and there is some fluid in it, worms are born from the putrescence; thus from the very material of sins are punishments begotten."[83]

For over a century, Carolingian authors used Gehenna's horrors as a source of correction for lay readers, who by

[81] Isaiah 66:24 and Marc 9:43,45,47: "vermis eorum non morietur et ignis eorum non extinguetur." Gehenna's horrors are examined further by the author in his "The Worm and the Corpse: Carolingian Visions of Gehenna's Undead Cemetery," *Journal of Medieval History* (forthcoming).

[82] On the ancient and medieval science of spontaneous generation, see Maaike van der Lugt, *Le ver, le démon et la vierge. Les théories médiévales de la génération extraordinaire. Une étude sur les rapports entre théologie, philophie naturelle et médecine* (Paris, 2004), 131-186.

[83] Jerome, *Comentarii in Isaiam*, VI, 14, ed. Adriaen, 240: "putredo et tinea et operimentum vermium, vel poenae intelleguntur aeternae, quas propria gignit conscientia, vel suppliciorum materia, quae ex propriis peccatis nascitur. Sicut enim quamdiu cadaveris materia est, et aliquis humor in cadavere, vermes nascuntur ex putredine; sic ex ipsa materia peccatorum supplicia gignuntur."

imagining themselves as one of the damned could reject sin and accept correction for their spiritual welfare. In a sermon on greed written for wealthy and powerful laymen sometime between 777 and 778, for example, Ambrosius Autpertus warned his audience that not only would reprobate souls dwell in Gehenna, "but also the immortal worms, which tear apart their bodies."[84] Indeed he admonished his audience: "Fear the immortal worms, because they will never be glutted by devouring your flesh, and when so many and so great torments cling to you in eternity, the singular torture and the worst of them all—greed—will never be wanting."[85] That greed, which had led them to desire worldly things, would also devour them as the worms did was a fitting torture. Authors from the late eighth to the early tenth century warned the laity against Gehenna's horror vermin, including Paulinus of Aquileia, Jonas of Orléans, Hincmar of Rheims, Abbo of Saint-Germain (Paris), and Odo of Cluny, the last of whom asked: "What could be more horrible than to undergo forever the pains of biting worms, and for that never to cease?"[86]

---

[84] Ambrosius Autpertus, *Sermo de cupiditate*, 12, ed. Robert Weber, *CCCM* 27B (Turnhout, 1979), 963-981, here 975: "… non solum impiorum animae, verum etiam qui eorum corpora dilanient inmortales vermes." On this sermon, see Maximilian Diesenberger, "An Admonition Too Far? The Sermon *De cupiditate* by Ambrose Autpertus," in Rob Meens, Dorine van Espelo, Bram van den Hoven van Genderen, Janneke Raaijmakers, Irene van Renswoude and Carine van Rhijn (eds.), *Religious Franks: Religion and Power in the Frankish Kingdoms: Studies in Honour of Mayke de Jong* (Manchester, 2016), 202-220.

[85] Ambrosius Autpertus, *Sermo de cupiditate*, 13, ed. Weber, 976: "Timete vermes inmortales, quia in manducando carnes vestras nulla eis satietas erit, et cum tota ac tanta vobis in aeternum adheserint tormenta, numquam deerit singularis avaritiae omniumque deterior excruciatio."

[86] Paulinus of Aquileia, *Liber exhortationis ad Hericum comitem*, 49, *PL* 99: 252-253; and Jonas of Orléans, *Instruction des laïcs*, III, 19, ed. and trans. Odile Dubreucq, 2 vols., *Sources chrétiennes* 549-550 (Paris, 2012), here vol. 2, 358; Hincmar of Rheims, *De cavendis vitiis et virtutibus exercendis*, II, 3, ed. Doris Nachtmann, *MGH Quellen zur Geistesgeschichte des Mittelalters* 16

Along similar lines, *Dominus, caeli rex et conditor* emphasized the disgusting, though uncannily fitting punishment reaped by the sinners, the fruits of their bloody madness: as men who "gnawed" and devoured others, their offences were akin to the very torturous worms their undead flesh generated. The hymn closed with an appeal for divine aid against Hell's torments and the afflictions caused by King Carloman's monsters. Here is where the singers and the congregation collectively sought to harness spiritual power to protect them from such evils. First, the prayer asked the Lord to protect those loyal and devoted to him—meaning here those persecuted by the monsters—from Gehenna's eerie tortures: "Take away these torments from your faithful ones." The second request concerned this world: "Remove strife, increase peace, bring joy/ To those serving you." The hymnist used the word "lites" for strife, a term conveying everything from legal disputes to general conflict and quarreling. Conceptually, this word adds another dimension to the upheaval caused by robbers, since the metaphor of their plundering extended also to legal claims they made upon others' land. While the imagery of cruel swords and cannibalism continues to haunt these final lines, the multiple layers of meaning added to the term's power and resonance for both singers and congregation. In closing, therefore, the singers stressed two things: the desire for peace and joy, and a determination to distinguish those serving the Lord from the persecuting monsters destined for Gehenna.

(Munich, 1998), 190, which (as indicated on 186, n. 278) was part of Hincmar's adaptation of Gregory the Great's *Moralia in Iob*, IX, 61, 92-66, 103, ed. Marc Adriaen, *CCSL* 143 (Turnhout, 1979), 522-530; Abbo of Saint-Germain-des-Prés, *Sermo 3. Dominica in septuagesima, evangelium secundum Matheum*, 19, in *Abbo von Saint-Germain-des-Prés 22 Predigten*, ed. Ute Önnerfors (Frankfurt am Main, 1985), 79-83, here 82-83; and Odo of Cluny, *Collationum libri tres*, I, 2, *PL* 133: 521: "Quid horribilius quam semper morsibus vermium dolores suscipere, nec eos unquam finiri?"

As a hymn, *Dominus, caeli rex et conditor* was remarkable for condemning and describing the horrific punishment of Christian robbers as persecutors. Such depictions were not unusual for Christ's foes. One anonymous hymn, for instance, sung of Christ's Hell-bound traitor, Judas: "Fear, Judas, fear God, fear faithless serpent,/ the wicked one will bear away your soul from you on this night,/ Worms will cover your face and your tongue."[87] Paulinus of Aquileia composed two hymns in which two of Christ's most infamous enemies—Herod the Great and Attila the Hun—were already "torn to pieces" (*laceratus*) and "being tortured" (*excruciatur*) respectively by worms in Gehenna.[88] Herod, who sought to kill Christ and murdered instead many innocent boys, was a particular target for Christian hatred and ire.[89] His story especially represented what terrible sins did to the sinner not only in the afterlife, but also in this world. For instance, the ancient Jewish historian Josephus and the Christian Eusebius, whose works were translated from Greek into Latin in antiquity, claimed that Herod the Great died horribly, his genitals swarming with worms, because he had done much sacrilege and harmed the innocent.[90] His successor, Herod Agrippa, later suffered a similar fate for persecuting the Apostles and allowing himself

[87] *Respice de celo*, st. 7, ed. Karl Strecker, *PLAC* 4.2 (Berlin, 1914), 583: "Time, Judas, time deum time dracho perfide,/ Animam a te maligno in hac nocte auferet,/ Faciem et linguam tuam vermes cooperient."

[88] Paulinus of Aquileia, *De nativitate domini*, st. 13, and *Versus de destructione Aquileiae numquam restaurandae*, st. 20, ed. Dag Norberg, *L'œuvre poétique de Paulin d'Aquilée* (Stockholm, 1979), 128 and 169.

[89] Mt 2:16 relates these events.

[90] *Hegesippi qui dicitur historiae libri V*, I, 45, 9, ed. Vincentius Ussani, *CSEL* 66 (Veinna, 1960), 124; and Eusebius-Rufinus, *Historia Ecclesiastica*, I, 8, ed. Theodor Mommsen (and Eduard Schwartz), *Eusebius Werke*, vol. 2.1, *Die Kirchengeschichte: Die lateinische Übersetzung des Rufinus* (Leipzig, 1907), 67, 69 and 71.

to be called a god.[91] Carolingian and earlier Christian authors relished these stories as evidence of their sinfulness.[92] The ninth-century biblical commentator Haimo of Auxerre linked the crimes of persecutors of Christians not only to the particular punishments they would suffer in Gehenna, but also in life as in Herod's case.[93] After discussing how the Jews and pagans had unjustly condemned the church, and accordingly they would be judged by God as worthy of infernal punishment, Haimo then explained the punishment of the wicked and those who persecuted the saints:

> 'And I will eat,' that is I will sate or fill, 'your enemies with their own flesh,' which is to say they will be enfeebled, consumed in their own putrescence and misery, so that they will not cease to be, but will be tortured continually, 'and will be inebriated on their own blood as if on new wine' ⁅Is 49:26⁆. These words should not be understood carnally, that the impious and those persecutors of the saints should eat their own flesh and drink their own blood, but that their flesh will be devoured by worms and infernal beasts, that is that they will perish in their own misery and putrescence, and just as a man is inebriated by new wine, thus they will be filled with miseries, because they poured out the blood of many saints. We can also refer to the present time, since

[91] Acts 12:23; and Eusebius-Rufinus, *Historia Ecclesiastica*, II, 10, ed. Mommsen, 127.

[92] See, for example, Gregory of Tours, *Libri Decem*, I, 21 and 24, ed. Krusch and Levison, 17 (where Gregory only hints at Herod the Great's fate) and 19; Freculf of Lisieux, *Historiarum libri xii*, pars I, VII, 18, and pars. 2, I, 14, ed. Michael Allen, *CCCM* 169A (Turnhout, 2002), 428 and 465; and Christian of Stavelot, *Expositio super librum generationis*, 23 and 27, ed. Robert Huygens, *CCCM* 224 (Turnhout, 2008), 420 and 523.

[93] Haimo of Auxerre, *Annotatio libri Isaiae prophetae*, 49, ed. Roger Gryson, *CCCM* 135C (Turnhout, 2014), 600.

> the flesh of the persecutors of the saints is eaten by worms and their blood is drank, just as happened to Herod, who murdered boys, [and] who 'consumed by worms expired' [Act 12:23].[94]

Haimo offered a series of interpretations of the hellish fate of the wicked and persecutors of Christians. First, he explained that the divine threat in Isaiah that they will be tortured by metaphorically eating their own flesh and drinking their own blood meant actually that they will be consumed and tortured endlessly in their own rotten worm-generating wretchedness, a monstrous suffering in death as a living, remorseful corpse. Next, Haimo added that one should not think in literal terms, meaning that they would actually devour their own flesh and blood, but that this signified Gehenna's worms and monsters which would be eating them in their own putrescence and misery. Indeed, the reason for these tortures, he makes clear, is "because they poured out the blood of many saints." Therefore, their misery and decay as undead corpses being ceaselessly devoured by immortal horrors, according to Haimo, uncannily matched the crimes committed by the reprobates in life. Then, however, Haimo added that persecuting the saints could lead to the same punishment in this world, offering Herod's horrible

[94] Haimo of Auxerre, *Annotatio libri Isaiae prophetae*, 49, ed. Gryson, 600: "'Et cibabo,' id est satiabo vel replebo, 'hostes tuos carnibus suis,' pro eo quod est dicere putredine et miseria sua consumpti deficient, non ut desinant esse, sed ut jugiter crucientur, 'et quasi musto sanguine suo inebriabuntur' [Is 49:26]. Non carnaliter ista intelligenda sunt, quod impii et qui persecutores sunt sanctorum carnes suas comedant et sanguinem bibant, sed ipsorum carnes devorabuntur a vermibus et bestiis infernalibus, id est in sua miseria et putredine peribunt, et sicut homo inebriatur a musto, ita illi replebuntur miseriis, eo quod multorum sanguinem sanctorum fuderint. Possumus etiam ad praesens tempus referre quod persecutorum sanctorum carnes a vermibus comedantur, et sanguis ebibatur, sicut contigit Herodi, qui interfecit pueros, qui 'consumptus a vermibus exspiravit.'" Note that Haimo used the quotation from Acts about Herod Agrippa to refer to Herod the Great.

ending as evidence. To murder the innocent and to persecute the church made the offenders so rotten with sin that they could expire while being devoured by worms spontaneously generated within them.

What is especially striking about the hymn *Dominus, caeli rex et conditor* is that it takes the theme explored by Haimo and applies it to wicked Christians as Hell-bound persecutors. Haimo commented on the punishment of persecutors after discussing the Jews and pagans as those condemning the church, giving Herod as an example of an especially evil offender and quite likely leading readers to identify these enemies as non-Christians. Though *Dominus, caeli rex et conditor* did not explicitly describe its persecutors as Christians, it did so shrewdly by focusing on those who start civil discord, one who as a "brother" slaughtered a "brother" through robbery, and who persecuted Christ's servants.[95] The hymnist could have easily mentioned the Northmen, if that was the intended message, since other hymns—including the *Summa pia gratia* of Charles the Bald's prayerbook and the *Virginis virginum cantica Mariae*—prayed openly for protection from murderous pagans.[96] Yet *Dominus, caeli rex et conditor* avoided any particular identifiers related to them, enabling the singers and audience to focus on the enemies in their midst: murderous Christian robbers.

[95] Berger and Brasseur, *Les séquences*, 189 read the text as referring here to the Northmen and the Hungarians.

[96] Gunilla Iversen, "*Psallite regi nostro, psallite:* Singing 'Alleluia' in Ninth-Century Poetry," in *Sapientia et Eloquentia: Meaning and Function in Liturgical Poetry, Music, Drama, and Biblical Commentary in the Middle Ages*, ed. Gunilla Iversen and Nicolas Bell (Turnhout, 2009), 9-58, here 23-24; and *Virginis virginum cantica Mariae*, ed. Paul von Winterfeld, "Rhythmen- und Sequenzenstudien. 1. Die lateinische Eualiensequenz und ihre Sippe," *Zeitschrift für deutsches Altertum und deutsche Literatur* 45 (1901), 133-149, here 140-141.

In June, 900, it became clear that Christians persecuting their fellow Christians could also suffer Herod's dreadful fate thanks to the power of the clergy's spiritual weapons. The nobleman Winemar, who served the notorious Count Baldwin of Flanders, and his accomplices ambushed and murdered Archbishop Fulco of Rheims, an ally of King Charles the Simple.[97] The attack was part of a well-documented political struggle over the control of the wealthy monastery of Saint-Vaast.[98] When Count Baldwin was unable to recover control over its lands at an assembly because Archbishop Fulco and others spoke against him, he sent his men after the archbishop, as the annalist of Saint-Vaast described:

> Winemar with his accomplices unexpectedly overcame Archbishop Fulco, which is abominable to say, and killed him pierced through with many wounds on June 16, 900; his body was taken away and placed in the church of blessed Remi. After these things, once a synod was called and Herveus ordained bishop of Rheims, the bishops damned all the murderers and sent them as exiles outside the bounds of the holy mother church.[99]

---

[97] *Annales Vedastini*, s.a. 900, ed. de Simson, 82. On Archbishop Fulco, see: Gerhard Schneider, *Erzbischof Fulco von Reims (883-900) und das Frankenreich* (Munich, 1973), including 178-182 for a discussion of his conflicts and murder; and Michel Sot, *Un historien et son Èglise au Xe siècle: Flodoard de Reims* (Paris, 1993), 122-155 and 156-213 on the archbishop's reign and Flodoard's account of it respectively, and 153-155, 179 and 211-212 regarding his murder.

[98] *Annales Vedastini*, s.a. 899-900, ed. de Simson, 81-82. For an examination of the historical background to Fulco's murder, see Jaser, *Ecclesia maledicens*, 55-59.

[99] *Annales Vedastini*, s.a. 900, ed. de Simson, 82: "…Winetmarus inprovise superveniens Fulchoni archiepiscopo cum suis complicibus, quod dictum nefas est, multis perfossum vulneribus interfecerunt XVI. Kal. Iulii, corpusque eius Remis delattum atque in aecclesia beati Remigii positum. Post haec ordinato episcopo Herveo Remis synodoque facto, omnes

Winemar's excommunication at the Synod of Rheims, July 6, 900 would prove to be a precedent-setting case of clerical power exercised against a layman.[100] As we shall see, the bishops there condemned him of murder and sacrilege—the very two crimes associated with robbers since the Synod of Quierzy, 857.[101] Several sources besides the *Annals of St-Vaast* relate different information and even alternate versions of the events of Fulco's murder. For instance, the tenth-century historian, Flodoard of Rheims, indicated that when Baldwin's men killed the archbishop with their lances, several members of Fulco's household sought to protect him with their own bodies and died from being impaled with him. Afterwards, the archbishop's armed men set out in pursuit of the assassins, while his people brought his body back to Rheims with great lamentations.[102]

Other sources regarding Fulco's murder reveal how the expression of abject emotions such as grief, mourning and sadness was integral to the process of unleashing the clergy's spiritual weaponry against the offenders. The Carolingians certainly understood the importance of lamentating sins, evils and misfortune. In his *Expositio in Lamentationes Hieremiae*, for instance, Paschasius Radbertus explained that the church and the saints lament with powerful emotions (*affectibus*) not only for the lost heavenly homeland while dwelling as pilgrims in this world, but also as penance for their sins and because of the many other evils befalling the church during their earthly

interfectores episcopi damnaverunt et a liminibus sanctae matris aecclesiae extorres reddiderunt."

[100] See note 76 above regarding the scholarship. The sources describing his excommunication include: Sigloard, *Planctus Fulconis archiepiscopi Remensis*, ed. Paul von Winterfeld, *PLAC* 4.1 (Munich, 2000), 174-175; and "47. Reims. 6 July 900," ed. Wilfried Hartmann, Isolde Schröder and Gerhard Schmitz, *MGH Conc. 5* (Hanover, 2012), 453-458.

[101] "47. Reims. 6 July 900," ed. Hartmann et al., 457-458.

[102] Flodoard, *Historia Remensis ecclesiae*, IV, 10, ed. Martina Stratmann, *MGH SS* 36 (Hannover, 1998), 402-403; and Sot, *Un historien*, 211-212.

existence.[103] In addition to the Prophet Jeremiah's laments, other biblical texts from both the Old and New Testament offered many examples of prayers that expressed both earthly and spiritual sorrows with hope for relief and redemption.[104] Scholars have shown how Carolingian authors throughout the ninth century lamented in prose and verse the evils of their time.[105] Lamentation thus served as a particular form of spiritual expression of the pain caused by disaster and loss that—like other prayers—had the power to move the deity to act on behalf of the faithful. In this way, the texts related to Archbishop Fulco's murder not only disclosed the series of events involved in his murder and Winemar's ultimate demise, but also helped the clergy to summon and activate spiritual powers to help the victim's soul and to harm the offender.

One such text was a *planctus*, or a hymn of lament, composed by the canon Sigloard of Rheims.[106] Investigation of this text reveals that it was carefully crafted with emotions, rhetoric and imagery to achieve a series of goals. First, it praised the archbishop as a pious leader of the church, while condemning Count Winemar and his other killers as evil and cruel. The hymn recounted the crime with enough details to reveal its shocking and wicked nature, while also linking the prayers of the clergy and the congregation to their emotions of grief and lamentation. Second, the text reestablished Fulco's dignity as

[103] Paschasius Radbertus, *Expositio in lamentationes Hieremiae*, prol., ed. Paulus, 4-5.

[104] Paschasius Radbertus, *Expositio in lamentationes Hieremiae*, prol., ed. Paulus, 5-7 lists numerous examples of different prayers and discussions of lamenting.

[105] In addition to the references in note 25 above, see Paul Edward Dutton, *The Politics of Dreaming in the Carolingian Empire* (Omaha, 1994), esp. 81-156; de Jong, *The Penitential State*, 112-147; Andrew Romig, *Be a Perfect Man: Christian Masculinity and the Carolingian Aristocracy* (Philadelphia, 2017), 98-131; de Jong, *Epitaph for an Era*; and Gillis, "Pleasures of Horror."

[106] Sigloard, *Planctus Fulconis archiepiscopi Remensis*, ed. von Winterfeld, 174-175.

archbishop during his funeral. The hymn did so very much in physical terms, describing how the clergy clothed him in his vestments and gave him his regalia with great respect and love. Such activity restored Fulco's honor after he had suffered such dishonor at the hands of his enemies. Finally, the hymn closed with a description of Winemar's excommunication and Fulco's honorable burial, when the clergy solicited prayers from the congregation for the archbishop's soul. Sigloard here again linked the prayers of the clergy and the congregation with their tears of grief and lamentation. Throughout the hymn, the sorrowful emotional state of those present was inseparable from their two-fold request that God save their murdered archbishop's soul and punish his murderer. Therefore, words and affect were expected to work together to encourage the deity to act as they wished.

Since Sigloard's lament recounted that Winemar's excommunication took place just before Fulco's burial, it seems likely that he composed his song in connection with the Synod of Rheims, July 6, 900.[107] After praising the archbishop in stanzas one through four, the singer then emphasized the congregation's great sorrow for the loss of their leader and their prayers for his soul:

5. The weeping at your funeral
We can scarcely restrain.
6. May Christ give you rest
And the perpetual crown!
7. For we will mourn you
Day and night;
8. For you loved truly
Us and led us sweetly.
9. You adorned the church,
You governed your family;

[107] "47. Reims. 6 July 900," ed. Hartmann et al., 453-458.

10. Through God's highest grace
You ruled the fatherland well.[108]

The clergy's affective response to Fulco's slaying was prominent here: his clerics and servants cannot contain their weeping, and they mourn his death day and night, while praising his paternal love and sweetness as their leader. These lamentations and expressions of love and praise demonstrated his holiness and goodness, thereby encouraging Christ to grant him his heavenly reward, "the perpetual crown." Yet the singer's focus on these emotions also set the tone for the next section of the hymn, which recounted and denounced the crime committed against the archbishop. Therefore, these early stanzas were setting up what would become a clear contrast between the clergy's hope for Fulco's heavenly reward and their wish to condemn his killers to hellish suffering.

Accordingly, the next stanzas related how a "slippery serpent" had treacherously "increased our suffering," which made him worthy of Hell's punishments: "Cursed by the Lord/ May he be punished in the pit!"[109] After cursing the enemy, the

[108] Sigloard, *Planctus Fulconis*, st. 5-10, ed. von Winterfeld, 174:
5. "In tuo fletus funere
Vix possumus reprimere.
6. Det tibi Christus requiem
Atque coronam perpetem!
7. Nos autem te plorabimus
Diebus atque noctibus;
8. Nam amasti veraciter
Nos et tractasti dulciter.
9. Adornasti ecclesiam,
Gubernasti familiam;
10. Per summam dei gratiam
Bene rexisti patriam."

[109] Sigloard, *Planctus Fulconis*, st. 11-13, ed. von Winterfeld, 175:
11. "Sed quidam serpens lubricus
Et non pater, sed vitricus,
12. Tibi tendens insidias

singer addressed Fulco himself, describing the attack: "With sword and cudgels/ And his armed soldiers/ Winemar assailed you,/ Sweet to none, but bitter;/ From whom you'd taken nothing,/ Against whom you'd not sinned." [110] Sigloard stressed the specific weapons of the attack—swords and cudgels—which were not the lances later described by Flodoard. And the audience could readily envision Winemar's gang of soldiers gathered around the archbishop, bludgeoning him with clubs as their leader put him to the sword. Doubtlessly many members of the episcopal household had seen his corpse before it was prepared for burial, so those present at his funeral could recall the wounds. The poet also made a pun with Winemar's name, "Uuin-emar," or "bitter wine," while stressing Fulco's innocence and sinlessness in relation to his murder. Nevertheless, Sigloard also revealed how the crime itself uncannily sealed the spiritual fate of the criminals. For when Fulco was murdered, his betrayer also destroyed himself by his wicked deed.[111]

Once Sigloard had recounted the archbishop's murder and articulated its spiritual meaning, he then returned to describing his people's response to the crime. He stressed their suffering at both hearing the news of his death and during the event of his funeral, which the hymn described in vivid detail.

Nostras auxit iniurias:
13. Maledictus a domino
Puniatur in barathro!"

[110] Sigloard, *Planctus Fulconis*, st. 14-16, ed. von Winterfeld, 175:
14. "Cum gladio et fustibus
Et armatis militibus
15. Invasit te Guinemarus,
Nulli dulcis, sed amarus;
16. Cui nihil abstuleras,
In quem nihil peccaveras."

[111] Sigloard, *Planctus Fulconis*, st. 17, ed. von Winterfeld, 175:
17. "In die, qua te tradidit,
Et te et ipsum perdidit."

Furthermore, he recounted how the clergy reestablished Fulco's dignity by dressing him in his vestments and giving him the symbols of his office as they honored him:

18. How quickly the clergy heard
So great an evil, and bellowed;
19. Both his people and his order lamented:
They rushed there and grasped
His body and took it with them
20. Pouring out many tears,
While celebrating his funeral procession.
21. He is brought to the church,
Standing beside the altar;
22. Abbots and bishops
Bear him in their vestments:
23. They dress him in his miter
And pallium and tunic;
24. The stole is placed upon his neck
And the taper is lit;
25. And not absent there is the crozier,
But placed in his hands.[112]

[112] Sigloard, *Planctus Fulconis*, st. 18-25, ed. von Winterfeld, 175:
18. "Quam cito clerus audiit
Tantum malum, infremuit;
19. Et plebs et ordo gemuit:
Ruit illuc et rapuit
Corpus et secum detulit
20. Multasque fudit lacrimas,
Dum celebrat exequias.
21. Translatus in ecclesia,
Stans rectus ad altaria;
22. Abbates et episcopi
Hunc sustentant revestiti:
23. Induunt eum infula
Pallioque et tunica;
24. Stola collo imponitur
Et candela accenditur;

Again Sigloard made the emotional response to Fulco's murder central. He described the bellowing and lamenting as the archbishop's *familia* learned of the terrible evil of his assassination. They recovered his body with great sadness. Then, "pouring out many tears," they honored him at his funeral. Emotions then gave way to a detailed description of his funeral. These stanzas recount the remaking of Fulco's mutilated corpse into an archbishop's body. They restored his episcopal physical appearance by replacing his vestments and the regalia of his office, thereby reestablishing his dignity. Key here was that they did so with great reverence after he had been so dishonored in his vicious death. After honoring Fulco in such a fitting manner, his clerics further called upon God to grant him his heavenly reward. Thereupon, the hymn turned dramatically to the deacon who called upon the entire congregation to pray for Fulco's soul:

26. Then the deacon of the priests
Bids and asks the people,
All to beseech the Lord
27. For the pontiff's soul,
So he will not sink into Hell,
But will be happy in Heaven,
28. And whether they will give an offering to God,
Which will purge his soul.
29. Then all pray to God
And beg thus with tears.[113]

25. Nec deest ibi baculus,
Sed applicatur manibus."

[113] Sigloard, *Planctus Fulconis*, st. 26-29, ed. von Winterfeld, 175:
26. "Tunc decanus pontificum
Iubet et rogat populum,
Ut orent omnes dominum
27. Pro anima pontificis,
Ne mergatur in inferis,
Sed laetetur cum superis,

The drama of the scene is captured in the poet's use of the present tense. The deacon's request for the congregation's prayers and an offering to God on behalf of the archbishop's soul emphasized the hope of all Christians regarding the afterlife: "So he will not sink into Hell,/ But will be happy in Heaven." Indeed, such an entreaty also foreshadowed the clergy's forthcoming excommunication of his murderer. Again, one should focus also on the tears linked with their prayers: "Then all pray to God/ And beg thus with tears." As in the King Carloman's capitulary, which stressed the tears and clamor of the poor as overcoming the prayers of the wicked for victory, here the archbishop's *familia* weeps and prays for his soul before calling for his murderer's damnation. The excommunication and his burial continued in the dramatic present tense:

30. Each holds a candle
Bishops, priests;
31. They excommunicate the tyrant
And mortify him living,
32. After this they bear out the dead man
And bury him honorably,
34. And before his tomb
They commend his spirit to God.
35. My his soul be at rest
Now and forever.
36. 'Amen, amen may it be so,'
Says the whole church.[114]

28. Et ut deo dent hostiam,
Quae purget eius animam.
29. Tunc omnes deo supplicant
Cum lacrimis et rogitant."

[114] Sigloard, *Planctus Fulconis*, st. 30-36, ed. von Winterfeld, 175:
30. "Tenent candelam singuli
Pontifices, presbyteri;
31. Tyrannum excommunicant
Et viventem mortificant

The lament revealed that Winemar's excommunication happened before the archbishop's burial. The bishops and priests held candles as they cursed him, "mortifying him living" (*viventem mortificant*). [115] They also labeled Winemar "the tyrant," which was a term applied to the murderers of bishops in the Merovingian era.[116] After this curse of living death, the bishops and the rest of the clergy then proceeded with Fulco's honorable burial, where they commended his soul to God for its eternal rest. Thus, the clergy prayed that—unlike his killer who was condemned to a living death—he would enjoy eternal spiritual life despite his earthly death. In this fashion, the ceremony orchestrated a powerful contrast between the fates of the murdered Archibshop Fulco and the condemned murderer, Winemar. The importance of arranging these events together would not have been lost on the participants, who doubtlessly hoped that their prayers would move the deity to grant salvation to the victim and inflict punishment upon his killer.

Sigloard's description of events suggests that the archbishop's funeral occurred in conjunction with the Synod of Rheims, July 6, 900. The document of Winemar's excommunication sheds further light on these events.[117] Once Herveus was elected archbishop in Fulco's place there, his first order of business was to lead the bishops in condemning his

32. Post hoc defunctum efferunt
Et honeste sepeliunt,
34. Eiusque ante tumulum
Commendant deo spiritum.
35. In requie sit anima
Nunc et per cuncta saecula.
36. 'Amen, amen fiat ita'
Dicat omnis ecclesia."

[115] Sigloard, *Planctus Fulconis*, st. 31-32, ed. von Winterfeld, 175.

[116] Jennifer Vanessa Dobschenzki, *Von Opfern und Tätern: Gewalt im Spiegel der merowingischen Hagiographie des 7. Jahrhunderts* (Stuttgart, 2015), 100-102.

[117] Jaser, *Ecclesia maledicens*, 59-63 examines the text in detail.

predecessor's killers.[118] The text for Winemar's excommunication demonstrates again how lamentation for Fulco's death was integral to harnessing the spiritual forces to destroy Winemar. In the sentence of excommunication, Archbishop Herveus and the bishops wrote that "sadness beyond measure" (*nimia tristitia*) troubled them and the church over the unheard of killing of Archbishop Fulco committed "wickedly by wicked men" (*ab impiis impie*)—Count Baldwin's man Winemar and others—a crime against every law, divine and human.[119] The bishops stressed that the entire church was rightly "saddened and sends forth laments of compassion from the deepest sighs of their hearts" for a crime that had not been perpetrated except by pagans.[120]

Having articulated their emotional response to Fulco's murder, the bishops then proceeded to condemn his murderers. Condemning them as excommunicated and "with anathema's perpetual curse" (*perpetuae maledictionis anathemate*), they doomed their bodies and souls, their offspring and their property to be cursed, so that the condemned "might pour out their guts just as faithless and cursed Arius."[121] They declared them cursed according to the sacred canons and apostolic

[118] Sot, *Un historien*, 214-244 examines Herveus's episcopacy.

[119] "47. Reims. 6 July 900," ed. Hartmann et al., 456-457.

[120] "47. Reims. 6 July 900," ed. Hartmann et al., 457: "…contristatur et lamenta compassionis ex intimis cordium suspiriis emittit." For a discussion of such victims at the hands of the Northmen, see Coupland, "The Vikings on the Continent," 193-195. Regarding the murder of bishops in the Merovingian era, see Paul Fouracre, "Why Were so Many Bishops Killed in Merovingian Francia?" in *Bischofsmord im Mittelalter*, ed. N. Fryde and D. Reitz (Göttingen, 2003), 13-35; and Dobschenzki, *Von Opfern und Tätern*, 190-220, who discusses the representation of such victims as martyrs.

[121] "47. Reims. 6 July 900," ed. Hartmann et al., 457: "…intestina in secessum fundant sicut perfidus et infelix Arrius." The editors and Jaser, *Ecclesia maledicens*, 60 indicate that several of the curses come from chapter 28 of Deuteronomy.

decrees concerning murderers and sacrileges—the very two crimes for which robbers were condemned—for having "dared to lay a hand upon this one annointed of the Lord," whose punishment by divine decree meant "perpetual ruin" (*perpetuum interitum*).[122] Thereupon, the bishops blew out the candles, which Sigloard's lament described, saying "And just as these lights, cast out from our hands today, are exstinguished, thus shall their light forever be exstinguished."[123]

In this fashion, the bishops lamented Fulco's murder and condemned his murderers. The reference to Arius requires investigation. Like Herod the Great, the heretic Arius was a favorite enemy of Christ in antiquity and the medieval world. The historian Eusebius recorded that Arius died fittingly in the latrine by shitting out his guts, an end whose physical putrescence and repugnance reflected his spiritual iniquity.[124] Gregory of Tours then popularized this story for western readers in his *Libri decem historiarum*, relishing it so much that he repeated it four times.[125] While Arius had not been a robber or physical murderer of Christians and innocents, his heresy was tantamount to the spiritual murder of Christians and he was excommunicated for this very reason. His excommunication removed him from the Christian community and threw him outside the protection of the Church's spiritual nourishment, which meant that divine grace and correspondingly salvation were denied him. Arius's sinfulness and his loss of the grace received at baptism then led to his abject end.

---

[122] "47. Reims. 6 July 900," ed. Hartmann et al., 457-458: "…qui *in* hunc *christum domini manum* ⌈cf. I Reg 26:9,11,23⌉ mittere ausi sunt…"

[123] "47. Reims. 6 July 900," ed. Hartmann et al., 458: "Et sicut hae lucernae de nostris proiectae manibus hodie extinguntur, sic eorum lucerna in aeternum extinguatur." Here paraphrasing Prov 20:20.

[124] Eusebius-Rufinus, *Historia Ecclesiastica*, X, 14, ed. Mommsen, 979-980.

[125] Gregory of Tours, *Libri Decem Historiarum*, II, 23, III, prol., V, 43, and IX, 15, ed. Krusch and Levison, 68-69, 96-97, 251 and 430.

Such theological assumptions were central to Carolingian thinking about baptism and salvation.[126] If sin putrefied human beings, then the reversal of this process was baptism, a rite that formed the basis of Carolingian imperial Christianity.[127] In this ritual, the convert was transformed into a Christian by renouncing demonic forces, having them exorcized from their body, and eating salt—both metaphorically in terms of accepting the "salt of wisdom" in the form of clerical instruction and physically as they consumed actual salt that became part of their flesh.[128] Here the figurative and the bodily together demonstrated the nature of this uncanny phenomenon, as concept and flesh were joined together into a single, transformative experience. Carolingian authors and editors of baptismal rites explained how the process worked.[129] For instance, Alcuin's text on baptism from 798 reveals the following: "The cathecumen receives salt in order that his putrid and flowing sins may be cleansed by the salt of wisdom in a divine gift."[130] Hrabanus Maurus, Alcuin's pupil, wrote later that eating salt preserved the catechumen from the "stench of iniquity lest they be further putrefied by the worms of their sins" and instead they were preserved unharmed for the

[126] The texts and topics discussed in this paragraph are examined further by the author in his "The Worm and the Corpse."

[127] On Carolingian baptism, see Owen Phelan, *The Formation of Christian Europe: The Carolingians, Baptism, and the* Imperium Christianum (Oxford, 2014); and Carine van Rhijn, *Shepherds of the Lord: Priests and Episcopal Statutes in the Carolingian Period* (Turnhout, 2007), 112-124.

[128] Susan Keefe, *Water and Word: Baptism and the Education of the Clergy in the Carolingian Empire*, 2 volumes (Notre Dame, 2002), here vol. I, 80-99 discusses the key texts.

[129] Keefe, *Water and Word*, vol. I, 116-131 discusses Carolingian interpretations of baptism in general. On salt in baptism, though without reference to the worm, see Phelan, *The Formation of Christian Europe*, 122-125 and 165-168.

[130] Alcuin, Text 9, ed. Keefe, 238-245, here 241: "accipit caticuminus salem, ut putrida et fluxa eius peccata sapientiae sale divino munere mundentur."

receiving of greater grace.[131] While interpreting the passage "You are the salt of the earth" in his commentary on the Gospel of Matthew, Hrabanus further explained how this salt drove worms out of human flesh for the deity: "Because salt is suited for the preserving of foods and the drying of meats, it rightly demonstrates that through the preaching of the Gospel the flow of desires is restricted, and human nature, with the worms and the putrescence of sins having been pressed out, is preserved unharmed for its creator through the keeping of his mandates."[132]

Therefore, when Archbishop Herveus and the Synod of Rheims cursed Winemar with excommunication and anathema, they were undoing the saving power of baptism and leaving him to suffer a rotten fate of the sort experienced by Arius. Sources from Rheims suggested that the spiritual force of excommunication achieved the bishops' designs. Some decades following these events, the Rheims historian Flodoard related the disgusting details of Winemar's end—a monster dying a monstrous death:

> And then Winemar, the murderer, excommunicated and anathematized with his accomplices by the bishops of the realm of the Franks was in addition struck with an incurable wound by God, so that his flesh rotting and his health gone he was living

[131] Hrabanus Maurus, *De institutione clericorum*, c. 27 *De catechizandi ordine*, ed. Detlev Zimpel, *Fontes Christiani* 61.1 (Turnhout, 2006), 194: "Tunc datur ei sal benedictum in os, ut per sal typicum sapientiae sale conditus, foetore careat iniquitatis, et nec a vermibus peccatorum ultra putrefiat, sed magis inlaesus servetur ad majorem gratiam percipiendam."

[132] Hrabanus Maurus, *In Mathaeum*, II, 5, 13, ed. Bengt Löfstedt, *CCCM* 174 (Turnhout, 2000), 133: "Item quia sal ad condiendos cibos carnesque siccandas aptum est, rite demonstrat, quod per praedicationem evangelii fluxus restringitur voluptatum et humana natura exclusis vermibus et putridine peccatorum inlaesa servatur suo conditori per eius custodiam mandatorum."

> devoured by worms and, since no one could approach him on account of the immeasurable stench, he ended his most miserable life with a miserable death.[133]

The late tenth-century Rheims historian Richer further developed the account of Winemar's death, writing that following his excommunication God struck the killer with "incurable dropsy" which caused him horrendous suffering, and becoming rotten inside he died wretchedly while his "genitals swarmed with worms"—a description Richer drew directly from Josephus's account of Herod's death.[134] Learning of such an end for the infamous Winemar offered a satisfying experience for those who understood themselves waging the cosmic war against sin and evil—evil which included Christian robbers who harmed the faithful and the church. A terrible villain had received his due.

Winemar's condemnation established a model for exercising clerical power against dangerous laymen, which was quickly adopted by other ecclesiastical authorities and then influenced the subsequent development of the excommunication ritual in medieval Europe.[135] Thus the importance of his case cannot be overstated. This section has argued that activating such spiritual forces in prayers and curses involved using horror rhetoric to reveal the spiritual reality of the offenders' crimes.

---

[133] Flodoard, *Historia Remensis ecclesiae*, IV, 10, ed. Stratmann, 402-403 on Fulco's murder and Winemar's death: "Denique Winemarus, eius interemptor, ab episcopis regni Francorum cum suis complicibus excommunicatus et anathematizatus insuper insanabili a deo percussus est vulnere ita, ut computrescentibus carnibus et exundante sanie vivus devoraretur a vermibus et, dum propter immanitatem fetoris nullus ad eum accedere posset, miserrimam vitam miserabili decessu finivit." See also Jaser, *Ecclesia maledicens*, 67-68.

[134] Richer, *Historiae*, I, 17-18, ed. Hartmut Hoffmann, *MGH SS* 38 (Hannover, 2000), 53-56, with his death in c. 18, 55-56: "Verenda vermibus scaturiebant." The borrowed text comes from *Hegesippi*, I, 45, 9, ed. Ussani, 124. On Richer, see also Jaser, *Ecclesia maledicens*, 68.

[135] Jaser, *Ecclesia maledicens*, 68-76.

The hymn *Dominus, caeli rex et conditor* and the texts involved in Winemar's excommunication disclose how authors and their audiences could utilize the uncanny powers of spiritual weapons not only to envision a fitting punishment for monstrous enemies, but also to pray for protection from them and to enact a grim fate on their foes. Religious horror played a key role in such activity. Articulating its monstrous imagery and negative emotions enabled authorities to orchestrate their prayers and rituals, thus making effective their requests to God for the church's protection and their enemies' punishment. They were intended to move the deity as much as their mortal audiences. Calls for divine aid, therefore, served the faithful when the clergy's warnings failed to force wayward soldiers to cease their robberies and accept correction. Winemar's case made clear that sin's destructive powers then went to work on the sinners themselves. In this way, the church revealed its power to destroy its enemies, even when they were baptized Christians.

PART THREE

"ALAS, NAKED THEY UNDERWENT THE SAVAGE FOLK'S SWORD!"

HEROISM IN ABBO OF SAINT-GERMAIN'S *WARS OF THE CITY OF PARIS*

HEROISM IN ABBO OF SAINT-GERMAIN'S *WARS OF THE CITY OF PARIS*

In an era when soldiers were being condemned as the church's monstrous enemies, some stood out as its mightiest champions. This section examines a striking new vision of heroism articulated in the epic poem, *Bella Parisiacae urbis* (*The Wars of the City of Paris*).[136] Its author was Abbo, a deacon and monk of Saint-Germain-des-Prés (Paris) originally from Neustria.[137] He

[136] Abbo of Saint-Germain-des-Prés, *Bella parisiacae urbis*, ed. Paul von Winterfeld, *PLAC* IV, 1 (Berlin, 1899), 72-122. The only complete manuscript of the epic is Paris, BN, MS lat. 13833, which was made at Saint-Germain-des-Prés probably in the early tenth century. Introductions to the text include: Max Manitius, *Geschichte der lateinischen Literatur des Mittelalters: Erster Band: Von Justinian bis zur Mitte des zehnten Jahrhunderts* (Munich, 1965, reprint of 1911 edition), 585-588; Abbon, *Le siége de Paris par les Normands: poème du IXe siècle*, ed. and trans. Henri Waquet, 2nd ed. (Paris, 1964), v-xix; Alfred Ebenbauer, *Carmen Historicum: Untersuchungen zur historischen Dichtung im karolingischen Europa* (Vienna, 1978), 150-175; *Abbo von Saint-Germain-des-Prés*, Bella Parisiacae urbis, *Buch I: Lateinischer Text, deutsche Übersetzung und sprachliche Bemerkungen*, ed. and trans. Anton Pauels (Frankfurt am Main, 1984), 5-15; Anthony Adams and A.G. Rigg, "A Verse Translation of Abbo of St. Germain's *Bella Parisiacae urbis*," *The Journal of Medieval Latin* 14 (2004), 1-68, here 1-17, including a useful summary of Books I-II on 7-10; and *Viking Attacks on Paris: The* Bella parisiacae urbis *of Abbo of Saint-Germain-des-Prés*, ed. and trans. Nirmal Dass (Paris, 2007), 1-17.

[137] For useful biographies, see Ute Önnerfors, *Abbo von Saint-Germain-des-Prés 22 Predigten* (Frankfurt am Main, 1985), 16-18, who also edits Abbo's

composed the work during the 890s not only as a literary exercise after reading Vergil's *Eclogues*, but also to offer the story of the successful defense of Paris against the Northmen in 885-886 as "an enduring example to the protectors of other cities."[138] In Part One we saw that Paris itself was no stranger to their depredations, and the city was attacked not only in 845, but also in 856, 857, 858 and 861, before the siege of 885-886.[139] In his introductory letter to the poem, Abbo emphasized that his work recounted the deeds of Paris's most illustrious defenders, King Odo, who was count of Paris during the siege, and his "hero," Saint Germain, the city's fifth-century bishop, whose miracles rescued its protectors and people on numerous occasions.[140] These were events Abbo had witnessed personally, and his narrative did not shrink from displaying war's horrors in grim detail.[141] I argue that the purpose of Abbo's vivid and

sermons from the 920s; and Pauels (ed.), *Abbo von Saint-Germain-des-Prés*, 5-9, who suggests that Abbo died around 938-940.

[138] Abbo, *Scedula singularis cernui Abbonis dilecto fratri Gozlino*, ed. Paul von Winterfeld, *PLAC* 4.1 (Berlin, 1899), 77-78, here 77.

[139] *Annales Bertiniani*, s.a. 845, 856-857 and 861, ed. Félix Grat, Jeanne Vielliard and Suzanne Clémencet with introduction and notes by Léon Levillain (Paris, 1964), 49, 74, and 84. On the attack of 845, see Bauduin, *Le monde franc et les Vikings*, 151-172; and regarding the 858 attack, see Gillmor, "Aimon's *Miracula Sancti Germani*," 103-128.

[140] Abbo, *Scedula*, ed. von Winterfeld, 78, including the term "heros" for Germain. Regarding Odo, see Simon MacLean, *Kingship and Politics in the Late Ninth Century: Charles the Fat and the End of the Carolingian Empire* (Cambridge, 2003), 48-80, and 55-62 for Abbo's account of Odo's activities; Lösslein, *Royal Power in the Late Carolingian Age*, 111-121, 240-243 and 274-277; and Favre, *Eudes*. Regarding Saint Germain, see Bruno Dumézil and Anne Wagner, "Saint Germain, évêque de Paris, un évêque chez les barbares?" in *Les Saints face aux barbares au haut Moyen Âge: Réalités et légendes*, ed. Edina Bozoky (Rennes, 2017), 69-80.

[141] Abbo, *Bella*, I, 24-26, 593-595 and 633, ed. von Winterfeld, 80, 96 and 97 recounts himself as an eyewitness. On the monastery of Saint-Germain-des-Prés in the 880s, see Jacques Bouillart, *Histoire de l'abbaye royale de Saint Germain des Prez* (Paris, 1724), 49-60; and René Poupardin, *Recueil*

gory portrayal of violence was to show that the terror and suffering soldiers experienced in battle were integral to their heroic exploits. Some fighters even died as martyrs in the war—a new development in Christian piety.[142] Furthermore, Abbo's epic showed that soldiers and civilians must pray to the saints with great lamentations to receive their aid and protection against the enemy, whenever earthly military power failed them in battle.[143] Overall, the analysis here will reveal that his epic spiritualized and heroized Christian warfare to a degree hitherto unseen in medieval Europe.

Abbo's epic comprises three books of 660, 618 and 115 hexameters in turn, of which only Book One and part of Book Two cover the siege; the entire text has been translated twice into English, while Books One and Two have been rendered into French and Danish and Book One into German.[144] Peter

des chartes de l'abbaye de Saint-Germain-des Prés, 2 vols. (Paris 1901-1932), here vol. 1.

[142] On the cult of martyrs, see Candida Moss, *The Myth of Persecution: How Early Christians Invented a Story of Martyrdom* (New York, 2013); Boyarin, *Dying for God*; and Henri Quentin, *Les martyrologes historiques du Moyen Âge*, 2nd ed. (Paris, 1908), which is the classic study for the Carolingian period.

[143] František Graus, *Volk, Herrscher und Heiliger im Reich der Merowinger* (Prague, 1965), 455-462, who documents early examples of saints fighting on the battlefield; Thomas Scharff, "Karolingerzeitliche Vorstellungen vom Krieg vor dem Hintergrund der romanischen-germanischen Kultursynthese," in *Probleme einer germanisch-romanischen Kultursynthese in Spätantike und frühem Mittelalter*, ed. Dieter Hägermann, Wolfgang Haubrichs and Jörg Jarnut with Claudia Giefers (Berlin, 2004), 473-490, esp. 479-487 on the militarization of saints in Carolingian hagiography, including a discussion of Abbo's epic on 485-487; Laury Sarti, "Der merowingisiche Heilige als Krieger," in *Die Militarisierung der Heiligen in Vormoderne und Moderne*, ed. Liliya Berezhnaya (Berlin, 2020), 83-99; and Thomas Scharff, "Die Heiligen im Kampf gegen die Normannen," in *Die Militarisierung der Heiligen in Vormoderne und Moderne*, ed. Liliya Berezhnaya (Berlin, 2020), 101-125.

[144] "A Verse Translation," trans. Adams and Rigg, 1-68; *Viking Attacks on Paris*, trans. Dass; Abbon, *Le siége de Paris*, trans. Waquet, which contains

Godman identifies it as "the first major historical narrative poem since Ermoldus Nigellus," while Thomas Scharff notes that it is "the longest Carolingian poem about a military event."[145] Abbo's epic also reveals qualities of what Michael Lapidge has characterized as the "hermeneutic style," meaning a predilection for obscure and foreign words—which in Abbo's case he and contemporaries glossed.[146] His work therefore contributed to the literary developments of this style, which flourished in the tenth and early eleventh century especially.[147] Indeed, the epic's third book, which offers advice to clerics on how to avoid sin and contains the most hermeneutic Latin of the entire poem, survives in several manuscripts whereas the first two books are extant in only one codex from Saint-

only Books I-II; *Abbo*, trans. Pauels; and Niels Skyum-Nielsen, *Vikingerne i Paris* (Munksgaard, 1967), 72-131.

[145] Peter Godman, *The Poetry of the Carolingian Renaissance* (Norman, 1985), 63; and Thomas Scharff, *Die Kämpfe der Herrscher und der Heiligen. Krieg und historische Erinnerung in der Karolingerzeit* (2002, Darmstadt), 77: "Die längste karolingerzeitliche Dichtung über ein militärisches Ereignis."

[146] Michael Lapidge, "The Hermeneutic Style in Tenth-Century Anglo-Latin Literature," *Anglo-Saxon England* 4 (1975), 67-111, esp. 71-76 and 101-103; and Abbo, *Scedula*, ed. von Winterfeld, 78, where he indicates that he glossed some terms himself, probably referring only to those in Book Three. See also D.R. Bradley, "The Glosses on *Bella Parisiacae Urbis* I and II," *Classica et mediaevalia* 28 (1967), 344-356, who argues the glosses are likely not from Abbo himself; Godman, *Poetry*, 63; Dass, *Viking Attacks*, 3-5, who recommends the term "macronic" rather than "hermeneutic" to depict Abbo's style; MacLean, *Kingship*, 55; Patrizia Lendinara, "The Third Book of the *Bella Parisiacae urbis* by Abbo of Saint-Germain-des-Prés and its Old English Gloss," *Anglo-Saxon England* 15 (1986), 73-89; ead., "A Difficult School Text in Anglo-Saxon England: the Third Book of Abbo's *Bella Parisiacae urbis*," *Leeds Studies in English* n.s. 37 (2006), 321-342; and ead., "Glossing Abbo in Latin and the vernacular," in *Rethinking and Recontextualizing Glosses: New Perspectives in the Study of Late Anglo-Saxon Glossography*, ed. ead., Loredana Lazzari and Claudia di Sciacca (Porto, 2011), 475-508.

[147] Lapidge, "The Hermeneutic Style," 63-103.

Germain.[148] Furthermore, Abbo's narrative approach in the first two books is rapid-paced, frequently loaded with striking but strange imagery, rich in personification and other Classical poetic devices, all of which collectively—as in the case of many ninth-century hagiographical epics—create a rather phantasmagoric literary experience for his audience's pleasure.[149]

Despite these demanding stylistic conventions, Simon MacLean notes that research on Abbo's epic has placed it "squarely within the mainstream of ninth- and tenth-century moralistic works concerning Christian encounters with the Vikings."[150] Nonetheless, Abbo's Christian heroism has perhaps more than anything attracted scholarly attention.[151] Paul

[148] Lendinara, "The Third Book," 73-89; ead., "A Difficult School Text," 321-342; and ead., "Glossing Abbo," 475-508. Regarding the only complete MS, see note 136 above.

[149] Anna Taylor, *Epic Lives and Monasticism in the Middle Ages, 800-1050* (Cambridge, 2013), 28-45 describes these stylistic features of monastic epic lives to which Abbo's epic was indebted; Ebenbauer, *Carmen*, 282-283 discusses Abbo's preference for especially obscure paraphrases; and Scharff, *Die Kämpfe der Herrscher und der Heiligen*, 77-79 notes Abbo's use of personification.

[150] MacLean, *Kingship*, 55-56.

[151] Previous scholarship on Abbo's praise of military figures includes: Paul Szarmach, "The (Sub-) Genre of the Battle of Maldon," in *The Battle of Maldon. Fiction and Fact*, ed. J. Cooper (London, 1993), 43-61; Rachel Stone, *Morality and Masculinity in the Carolingian Empire* (Cambridge, 2012), 69-115, where Abbo's *Bella* appears frequently as a source; Anthony Adams, *Heroic Slaughter and Versified Violence: A Reading of Sacrifice in Some Early English and Carolingian Poetry of War* (Dissertation, University of Toronto, 2008), 145-156; Scharff, *Die Kämpfe*, 77 identifies that the panegyric element remains strong in Abbo's poem; Dass, *Viking Attacks*, 10; Nirmal Dass, "Temporary Otherness and Homiletic History in the Late Carolingian Age: A Reading of the *Bella Parisiacae urbis* of Abbo of Saint-Germain-des-Prés," in *Difference and Identity in Francia and Medieval France*, ed. Meredith Cohen (Farnham, UK, 2010), 99-114; and Robert Evans, "Frankish Leadership and the Viking Raids," (M.A. Thesis, Cambridge, 2012), which deals with Abbo's work on 66-89.

Szarmach highlighted "the importance of praise and the positive depiction of *aristeia*" in the epic, meaning scenes where heroes have their finest moments in battle and sometimes die.[152] Rachel Stone utilizes Abbo's poem in her study of "the ethos of Frankish warriors,"[153] while Anthony Adams, one of the epic's translators, highlights Abbo's sacrificial heroes.[154] Another of Abbo's translators, Nirmal Dass, fuses the martial and moral themes most distinctly, characterizing the poem as being "about heroic action, which serves two ends: the repelling of the Viking raiders, and the salvation of the soul. For Abbo, the two struggles are one and the same."[155] My analysis builds upon such scholarship to survey Abbo's portrayal of the heroism displayed by the defenders of Paris. The goal here is not a complete examination of his work, but to reveal how it offered an example of heroic and holy warfare that strongly contrasted with the monstrous villainy of the soldiers robbers examined in this study thus far.[156]

Abbo was not the only author to recount the deeds of Paris's protectors. The *Annals of Saint-Vaast*, for example, offered a detailed account of the city's successful defense.[157] The annalist wrote critically that the Franks trusted to fortresses on the rivers Oise and Seine rather than meet the Danes in open battle, which allowed the enemy, "thirsting for massacres" (*occisionibus sitientes*), to kill and capture Christians without resistance,

[152] Paul Szarmach, "The (Sub-) Genre of the Battle of Maldon," 53.

[153] Rachel Stone, *Morality and Masculinity*, 56; see also her chapter on warfare, 69-115, where Abbo's *Bella* appears as a source.

[154] Adams, *Heroic Slaughter and Versified Violence*, 145-156.

[155] Dass, *Viking Attacks*, 10. Also see Dass, "Temporary Otherness," 99-114.

[156] The author is currently completing a study of Abbo's epic that more thoroughly considers his portrayal of Christian heroism as well as his debts to previous Carolingian literary traditions.

[157] *Annales Vedastini*, s.a. 885, ed. de Simson, 57-58. On this campaign and other annals relating its events, see Vogel, *Die Normannen*, 320-338; Favre, *Eudes*, 17-68; and MacLean, *Kingship and Politics*, 55-64.

while burning their lands and churches.[158] The Northmen then besieged the fortress on the Oise in November, deprived the garrison of water, and forced its commander to negotiate a peace and the stronghold's surrender. They burned the fortress after plundering it, while the Christians unheroically fled with only their arms and horses.[159] The author then related the early phases of the siege of Paris. In clear contrast to the failure of the soldiers to hold the fortress on the Oise, he praised the city's defenders for their bravery and their ability to thwart the Northmen's crafty attempts to besiege them:

> Greatly elated after winning this victory, the Northmen approach Paris and immediately attack and strongly besiege the tower. And because its defenses were not yet complete, they deem they will seize it without delay. But the Christians manfully defend it, and *the battle* took place *from morning all the way to evening* [I Macc. 9:13], and night ends the battle. And thus the Northmen returned on that night to their ships. But Bishop Gauzlin and Count Odo labored the entire night with their men, strengthening their tower in preparation for the fight. On the following day, the Northmen again took up the attack against the tower, and the fight was fierce all the way to sunset. But after losing many of their men the Danes returned to their ships; from there they establish a fortress for themselves against the city and surround it in a siege, they build machines, they set fire to it and try every one of their tricks to capture the city. But the Christians in fighting bravely against them stood forth supreme in all things.[160]

[158] *Annales Vedastini*, s.a. 885, ed. de Simson, 57-58.

[159] *Annales Vedastini*, s.a. 885, ed. de Simson, 58.

[160] *Annales Vedastini*, s.a. 885, ed. de Simson, 58-59: "Hac Nortmanni patrata victoria valde elati Parisius adeunt turremque statim aggressi valide

The annalist stressed that the Northmen attacked Paris quickly and fiercely, inspired by their success on the Oise and the city's unfinished defenses. Yet the Christians "manfully" defended the tower, fighting so that "*the battle* took place *from morning all the way to evening*," ending only with nightfall. The biblical allusion (I Macc. 9:13) referred to the Battle of Elasa between Bacchides's Hellenistic army and Judah Maccabee's diminished guerilla forces. In the battle, Judah determined to resist his enemies and die in battle rather than flee, and he fell on the field.[161] The allusion suggested to biblically-literate readers that the defenders of Paris were equally heroic and determined, and they staged their defense wisely. When night stopped the fighting and the Danes returned to their ships, the Franks under Bishop Gauzlin—who had served as King Carloman II's archchancellor and took part in the Council of Ver during the previous year—and Count Odo of Paris fortified the tower.[162] Though the next day brought another long battle, the Danes had to withdraw with heavy casualties. From this point on, the attackers besieged the city, using machines, fire and stratagems. Nevertheless, the annalist stressed the defenders' remarkable courage and resourcefulness in battle:

obpugnant, et quia necdum perfectae firmata fuerat, eam se capi sine mora existimant. At Christiani viriliter eam defendunt, et factum *est proelium a mane usque ad vesperum* [I Macc. 9:13], noxque dirimit proelium; atque ita Nortmanni ea nocte regressi ad naves. Gauzlinus vero episcopus et Odo comes tota nocte cum suis laboravere, suam obfirmantes turrim ad praeperationem pugnae. Sequenti die iterum Nortmanni accurunt ad ipsam turrim ad proelium, fitque gravis pugna usque ad solis occasum. Sed Dani multis suorum amissis rediere ad naves; indeque sibi castrum statuunt adversus civitatem eamque obsidione vallant, machinas construunt, ignem supponunt et omne ingenium suum apponunt ad captionem civitatis. Sed Christiani adversus eos fortiter dimicando in omnibus extitere superiores."

[161] I Macc. 9:7-18.

[162] On Gauzlin, see note 17. Regarding Odo's remarkable career as count and then king, see note 140.

"the Christians in fighting bravely against them stood forth supreme in all things."

Abbo's approach to narrating these same events was to emphasize the drama and terror of battle. His goal in doing so was to reveal the heroism of the city's defenders in the very grim experience of combat. In this fashion, he could suggest to his readers that soldiers could overcome their fear through bravery, thereby vanquishing dread along with their enemies by glorious deeds. Abbo's first description of battle recounted the Danes' first assault on the city and especially their attempt to seize the Grand Pont's tower on the Seine's northern shore, as the annalist described. Note especially how Abbo reported the course of the action in the attack and the defenders' responses:

Truly they all rushed forward from the boats hastening to the tower,
Which they strike fiercely with slingstones and overwhelm with arrows:
The city resounds, citizens rush in alarm and the bridges shake;
All rush together and bring aid to the tower.
Here the counts, Odo and his brother Robert,
Were shining, and equally Count Ragnar, there
The pontiff's nephew Ebolus, the bravest abbot.
Here the bishop is lightly wounded by sharp missile,
Here his young soldier Frederic is likewise
Struck by a sword; the soldier died, and the elder
Recovered, healing himself with God's healing art.
Here they give the end of life to many, but thrust
Fierce wounds into more; and at last they withdraw,
Bearing many dead Danes with them.
Now Apollo of the southern regions turned midway
Toward most distant Thule, followed by Olympus.[163]

[163] Abbo, *Bella*, I, ll. 62-77, ed. von Winterfeld, 81-82: "Nempe ruunt omnes ratibus turri properantes,/ Quam feriunt fundis acriter complentque

The battle began at dawn, as the Danes rushed from their ships. Their goal was to overcome the defenders in the unfinished tower, which they assailed with numerous missile weapons. Abbo then gave a poetic description of the city's response to the Northmen's assault. The lines are dense with action and emotion: "The city resounds, citizens rush in alarm and the bridges shake;/ All rush together and bring aid to the tower." The reader is thrust into the distress and activity within the city. The defenders run to their stations, the city itself is filled with clamor as the bridges shake—depicting not only how the soldiers rush across them, but also the collective sense of terror and tension as the attack unfolds—and all make toward the vulnerable tower to help it withstand the assault. Abbo frequently used a formula such as this to depict the defenders' response to the Northmen's terrifying attacks. In another assault later in the siege, for instance, Abbo wrote: "Mars arising rages here and there and rules proudly;/ The curving bells of the whole church crying out/ Fill up the empty airs with doleful clamors./ The stronghold shakes, the citizens grow troubled, and the trumpets'/ Mighty voice resounds, and dread enters all within the towers."[164] The emotions contained within this formula revealed battle's terrors which were

sagittis:/ Urbs resonat, cives trepidant pontesque vacillant;/ Concurrunt omnes turrique iuvamen adaugent./ Hic comites Odo fraterque suus radiabant/ Rotbertus pariterque comes Ragenarius, illic/ Pontificisque nepos Ebolus, fortissimus abba./ Hic modicum presul iaculo palpatus acuto,/ Hic eius iuvenis miles simili Fredericus/ Est ictus gladio; miles periit, seniorque/ Convaluit, sese medicante dei medicina./ Hic vitae multis extrema dedere, sed acres/ Pluribus infigunt plagas; tandemque recedunt,/ Exanimes Danos secum multos referentes./ Iam occidui medium vergebat ad ultimata Tile/ Climatis australis quoque Apollo secutus Olimpho."

[164] Abbo, *Bella*, I, ll. 237-241, ed. von Winterfeld, 87: "Mars hinc inde furit surgens regnatque superbus;/ Totius ecclesiae convexa boando metalla/ Flebilibus vacuas supplent clamoribus auras./ Arcs nutat, cives trepidant, ingensque tubarum/ Vox resonat, cunctosque pavor cum turribus intrat."

overcome by the defenders' courage. As in the first day's assault depicted above, the Christians here rushed to battle and bravely protected the city despite their fear.[165]

Returning to the Danes' first assault, we see how Abbo included a brief list of the chief defenders, including the "shining" Count Odo and Bishop Gauzlin's nephew, the lay abbot of Saint-Germain, Ebolus, the "bravest abbot." The heroes did not let the deadly Danish attack daunt them—even when they were wounded. Indeed, Bishop Gauzlin was injured by a missile, but he recovered through the spiritual power of prayer, "healing himself with God's healing art." Young Frederic's fate, however, revealed that not all would survive. The poet cast his reader's gaze into the violence of the battle, showing men wounded in the fighting, while simultaneously slipping ahead in time to reveal their subsequent fate. In this fashion, he emphasized Bishop Gauzlin's piety amid the tumult and violence. Indeed, Gauzlin was only one of numerous Carolingian bishops who led armies and fought against the Northmen.[166] He and the other defenders killed many Danes, who hauled their companions back to their ships at nightfall. This brief scene revealed the siege's daily rhythm that continued on and off for months. The Northmen regularly launched their attacks at daybreak, causing fear and alarm within the city. Then the heroic defenders fought bravely and drove them back with many casualties in fighting that often

[165] Abbo, *Bella*, I, ll. 242-247, ed. von Winterfeld, 87.

[166] Friedrich Prinz, *Klerus und Krieg im früheren Mittelalter* (Stuttgart, 1971), 115-146; Gübele, *Deus vult*, 131-138; and Janet Nelson, "The Church's Military Service in the Ninth Century: A Contemporary Comparative View?" in ead., *Politics and Ritual in Early Medieval Europe* (London, 1986), 117-132, who discusses episcopal military forces. On Gauzlin's fighting specifically, see Geneviève Bührer-Thierry, "Bishops as City Defenders in Early Medieval Gaul and Germany," in *Between Sword and Prayer: Warfare and Medieval Clergy in Cultural Perspective*, ed. Radosław Kotecki, Jacek Maciewski, and John Ott (Leiden, 2018), 24-45, here 35-37.

lasted until sunset. This repeating pattern unveiled how the small Christian force held off the much greater Danish army.

As we shall see later in the section, there were occasions when the terrified Christians proved unable to stop the Danes. But first let us consider how the Northmen immediately renewed their assault on the following day as described by the annalist of Saint-Vaast above. Abbo reported that the defenders strengthened the tower overnight with additional boardwork, raising it higher into the air to protect them from the next day's assault.[167] Their efforts proved worthwhile, when the enemy returned. In this attack, Abbo focused on Odo and Ebolus, who slew many Danes. Note again here the poet's emphasis on the emotions of fear amid battle's terrors that preceded the Christians' heroic action:

Then the sun and the Danes greeted the tower together;
They vehemently hurled savage attacks upon the faithful;
Missiles flew from here, from there and blood fell through the air,
Mixed together with them are slingstones and busted ballistas—
Nothing else was flying between earth and sky.
Now the nightly tower moans pierced with missiles
(For night was its mother, as I sang above),
The city trembles, its citizens clattering, and the trumpets call
All without delay to aid the quaking tower;
Christ-worshippers fight and take pains to resist in battle.
Among all the warriors a pair was shining
More valiant than the rest, one a count, the other an abbot:
One was Odo, a conqueror unconquered by any battles,
Was restoring strength to weary men with his mighty presence,
Continually going around the tower slaying enemies;
In fact they want to fell the wall with war machines,
He serves them oil and wax and pitch,

[167] Abbo, *Bella*, I, ll. 78-83, ed. von Winterfeld, 82.

The mixed liquids boiling vehemently together in a pot:
They burn and tear the hair off the Danes' necks,
And they kill some and force others to run the river's
Shoals. Ours together were resounding this:
"Run burning to the Seine's seas, where they'll
Restore your manes with better braids!"
Mighty Odo pounded countless foes; but who was the other?
The other was Ebolus, his comrade and his equal;
He could spit seven on a single shaft,
Whom joking he ordered the living to offer to the cook.
None was better or equal or close to them,
But the others fought bravely scorning death:
Yet what is a single drop to a thousand flames?[168]

Abbo began by emphasizing the savage ferocity and massive extent of the Danes' attack. The audience sees the sky filled with airborne weaponry of all sorts as well the gruesome

[168] Abbo, *Bella*, I, lines 84-113, ed. von Winterfeld, 82-83: "Sol igitur Danique simul turrim resalutant;/ Prelia devotis iaciunt inmania valde;/ Pila volant hinc inde caditque per aera sanguis,/ Conmiscentur eis fundae laceraeque balistae—/ Nil terras interque polos aliud volitabat./ At turris nocturna gemit dardis terebrata/ (Nox fuit eius enim genetrix, cecini quoque supra),/ Urbs pavitat, cives strepitant, et classica clamant/ Absque mora tremulae cunctos succurrere turri;/ Christcolae pugnant belloque resistere curant./ Belligeros inter cunctos gemini radiabant/ Plus aliis fortes, alter comes, alter et abba:/ Alter Odo victor bellis invictus ab ullis/ Confortando fatigatis vires revocabat,/ Lustrabat iugiter speculum perimens inimicos;/ Qui vero cupiunt murum succidere musclis,/ Addit eis oleum ceramque picemque ministrans,/ Mixta simul liquefacta foco ferventia valde:/ Quae Danis cervice comas uruntque trahuntque,/ Occiduunt autem quosdam quosdamque suadent/ Amnis adire vada. Hoc una nostri resonabant:/ 'Ambusti Sequanae ad pelagos concurrite, vobis/ Quo reparent alias reddendo iubas mage comptas!'/ Fortis Odo innumeros tutudit; sed quis fuit alter?/ Alter Ebolus huic socius fuit aequiperansque/ Septenos una potuit terebrare sagitta,/ Quos ludens alios iussit prebere coquinae./ Hisce prior mediusve fuit circumve nec ullus,/ Fortiter ast alii spreta nece belligerabant:/ Verum stilla quid est simplex ad caumata mille?"

evidence of its effectiveness: "blood fell through the air." Indeed, the assault was so vehement that "nothing else was flying between earth and sky." The effectiveness of this description is that it also captured the fact that the defenders—"the faithful" as Abbo called them—were sorely outnumbered. Next, Abbo applied the poetic device of personification to the tower itself, which "moans pierced with missiles." Standing in for the suffering defenders, the tower as agent revealed their painful wounds caused by the countless flying weapons. The description then turned quickly to the soldiers themselves, using again a dense depiction of their rapid response to the attack: "The city trembles, its citizens clattering, and the trumpets call/ All without delay to aid the quaking tower." As on the previous day, the city is filled terror and activity. Before focusing on particular heroes, Abbo stressed the defenders' religious identity, writing: "Christ-worshippers fight and take pains to resist in battle."

The fast-paced narrative then turned to Count Odo and Abbot Ebolus. The former received an extended discussion of his leadership and strength in combat. The count, "a conqueror unconquered by any battles," restored his men's strength through his "mighty presence," as he appeared all around the tower slaughtering the foe. And when they sought to crush the wall with siege engines, Odo dropped boiling oil and wax and pitch on them, causing terrible burns and death, while some fled to the river's waters to ease their pain. Meanwhile, the Christians mocked the suffering Danes' agonizing loss of hair. Abbo then praised the deeds of Ebolus, Odo's "comrade and his equal." Continuing in a grimly humorous and mocking tone, Abbo remarked that the abbot could skewer seven Danes with a single arrowshaft, calling down to their companions to take them to the cook. The superhuman fighting qualities of these two soldiers, as well as their undaunted spirit and humor, clearly were meant to inspire readers as much as they did their fellow soldiers during the siege. Indeed, Abbo told his audience

that the rest of the Christian defenders, though not equal to Odo or Ebolus, nevertheless "fought bravely scorning death." In this way, the poet presented this second day of fighting as an outstanding example of Christian bravery, which he then enhanced by reminding the audience about the sheer numbers of the enemy: "Yet what is a single drop to a thousand flames?"

Abbo also recounted the heroism of soldiers who died during the siege. For instance, he related the deeds of the brothers Segebertus and Segevertus, who attacked the Danes on one of Paris's nearby islands and slaughtered "nine times thirty" of them, and when later they fell he added: "enjoying an illustrious death, they bore their holy feet upon the stars."[169] As examined in Part One, such sinless soldiers falling in battle against Christ's enemies enjoyed their heavenly reward. Bishop Gauzlin, who counted as one of the city's must stalwart defenders, also died during the siege, succumbing to illness in April 886.[170] As noted above, Gauzlin was not exceptional as a fighting bishop, and Sedulius Scottus praised two bishops of Liège, Hartgar (r. 841-855) and Franco (r. 856-901), as religious and military leaders in panegyrics earlier in the ninth century.[171] In addition to the scene above in which the bishop was lightly wounded by the Northmen, Abbo described Gauzlin in combat on two other occasions of his narrative—including

[169] Abbo, *Bella*, II, lines 187-194, ed. von Winterfeld, 103: "…qui morte fruentes/ Egregia sanctos vexere pedes super astra."

[170] The bishop's epitaph dates his death to April 16, 886; see *Epytaphium domni Gozlini epyscopi*, ed. Paul von Winterfeld, *PLAC* 4.1 (Berlin, 1899), 136-137.

[171] On Sedulius Scottus and his poetry, see Reinhard Düchting, *Sedulius Scottus: Seine Dichtungen* (Munich, 1968); Jean Meyers, *L'Art de l'emprunt dans la poésie de Sedulius Scottus* (Paris, 1986); and Paul Kershaw, *Peaceful Kings: Peace, Power and the Early Medieval Political Imagination* (Oxford, 2011), 2-8, 223-234. His poems for the bishops are Sedulius Scottus, viii. *Ad Hartgarium episcopum*, ed. Ludwig Traube, *PLAC* 3 (Berlin, 1896), 176-177; and Sedulius Scottus, lxvi. *De adventu Franconis episcopi*, ed. Ludwig Traube, *PLAC* 3 (Berlin, 1896), 220.

once when his prayers to the Virgin Mary guided his shaft to kill a Dane executing Christian prisoners outside the wall.[172] Furthermore, when the Danes first arrived in Paris, their King Sigfrid parleyed with Bishop Gauzlin, hoping to secure permission to bypass the city's defenses so that they might pillage upriver. In heroic fashion, the bishop refused despite Sigfrid's threats of besieging the city, and the first attack followed the next day.[173] All of these events were recounted in Book One of Abbo's epic. In Book Two, the poet included a lament for Bishop Gauzlin in which he praised both his religious piety and his strong hand in battle as a protector of his flock:

Who can hear with open ear, what is added below?
The earth moans and the sea, and the vast heavenly bodies:
Gauzlin, the Lord's bishop, sweetest hero,
Seeks the stars, traveling to the Lord, shining like them,
Remaining our tower, shield and double-sharp
Sword; our strong bow and our strong arrow.
Alas! For all, the wells of tears bore through their eyes
And anguish tears the guts of those consumed by fear.[174]

Not just human beings, but the whole cosmos—the earth, sea and heavens—mourned for Bishop Gauzlin, the "sweetest hero." Abbo celebrated his holiness as he joined the shining company of the stars in the Lord's presence. He did not neglect Gauzlin's fighting qualities, which were also a feature of

[172] Abbo, *Bella*, I, ll. 237-247 and 312-326, ed. von Winterfeld, 87 and 89.

[173] Abbo, *Bella*, I, ll. 27-61, ed. von Winterfeld, 80-81.

[174] Abbo, *Bella*, II, lines 68-75, ed. von Winterfeld, 100: "Quis sentire potest patula, quod subditur, aure?/ Terra gemat pontusque, polûm latus quoque mundus:/ Gozlinus, domini presul, mitissimus heros,/ Astra petit domino migrans, rutilans velut ipsa,/ Nostra manens turris, clipeus necnon bis—acuta/ Rumphea; fortis et arcus erat fortisque sagitta./ Heu! Cunctis oculos fontes terebrant lacrimarum/ Atque pavore dolor contritis viscera scindit." Here also see Bührer-Thierry, "Bishops as City Defenders," 36.

Sedulius Scottus's praise of Bishops Hartgar and Franco.[175] Bishop Gauzlin was Paris's "tower, shield and double-sharp/ Sword; our strong bow and our strong arrow." As the city's protector, the bishop acted not unlike the towers protecting Paris's riverbanks. As a mighty warrior in battle, he was the city's shield and sword, its bow and arrow. Then the poet summoned his audience's sad emotions, recalling how at the bishop's death all wept greatly torn within by anguish and "consumed by fear." Indeed, losing this stalwart, holy champion, appropriately filled Paris's people and soldiers with sadness and despair. Nevertheless, Abbo revealed that Gauzlin was succeeded by another fighting bishop, Anscheric, who—praised by Abbo as "the noble pastor" and "mighty by/ The Virgin's mouth"—also fought the Danes, leading on one occasion an attack outside the city in which six hundred enemy soldiers were slain and much booty was taken by the Parisians back within the walls.[176]

In what was a remarkable historical development, Abbo celebrated twelve Frankish soldiers as martyrs, whom the Northmen killed as prisoners when they took the tower of the Petit Pont, which connected Paris to the Seine's southern shore.[177] Abbo committed nearly one hundred lines out of nearly 1,300 in his account of the siege and wars against the Northmen to retelling the twelve's martyrdom, revealing how

[175] Sedulius Scottus, viii. *Ad Hartgarium episcopum*, ed. Traube, 176-177; and id., lxvi. *De adventu Franconis episcopi*, ed. Traube, 220. For commentary, see: Prinz, *Klerus und Krieg*, 125-126; Düchting, *Sedulius Scottus*, 52-54 and 179-181; Meyers, *L'Art de l'emprunt*, 77-81 and 90-91; and Gübele, *Deus vult*, 132.

[176] Abbo, *Bella*, II, ll. 485-490, ed. von Winterfeld, 111: "Preterea quadringentis a mille remotis/ Acefalos prostravit humi peditum comitatus/ Agmine tercentum pastor certamine acerbo/ Nobilis Anschericus, pollens ex virginis ore;/ Sic alacres spolium revehunt ad moenia multum/ Urbani prestante deo qui regnat ab alto."

[177] Abbo, *Bella*, I, ll. 504-597, ed. von Winterfeld, 94-96; and Scharff, *Die Kämpfe*, 205; and Scharff, *Die Kämpfe*, 205-206.

prominent a place the story held in his epic. It is worth noting that not only was the veneration of martyrs a central feature of ninth-century religion, but one of the most influential martyrologies was written at Abbo's own monastery in the 870s by Usuard for King Charles the Bald.[178] Yet, the idea that soldiers falling in battle against pagans should be counted as martyrs was not a common Carolingian or early Christian idea. [179] Prior to the 880s, the only record of such a memorialization comes from Reichenau, where Count Gerold, who died in the Avar wars, was celebrated as being "equal to the martyrs" (*martyribusque parem*) for falling while defending Christ's people against "faithless nations" (*gentibus infidis*).[180] Memorialization of soldier martyrs appeared again during the Siege of Paris. Henry of Saxony, who brought a relief force to the city, was killed there in 886. According to the chronicler Regino of Prüm, after being taunted by the pagans Henry charged them, but fell unwittingly into a covered pit, where the enemy ran him through with their spears before he could rise and fight; afterwards his followers recovered his remains in a desperate struggle and buried them in Saint-Médard in Soissons.[181] His epitaph, likely recorded there but surviving in

[178] *Le Martyrologe d'Usuard: text et commentaire*, ed. Jacques Dubois (Brussels, 1965). On the topic generally, see Quentin, *Les martyrologes historiques*. On Usuard's text see *Le Martyrologe d'Usuard*, ed. Dubois, 10-141 for a discussion of the work; and Janet Nelson, "The Franks, the Martyrology of Usuard, and the Martyrs of Cordoba," in *Martyrs and Martyrologies*, ed. Diana Wood (Oxford, 1993), 67-80.

[179] For a discussion of the few accounts of non-soldier martyrs at the hands of the Northmen, see Coupland, "The Vikings on the Continent," 186-203.

[180] Walahfrid Strabo, *Visio Wettini*, ll. 802-810, ed. Ernst Dümmler, *PLAC* 2 (Berlin, 1884), 329. See also Noth, *Heiliger Krieg*, 103-104 on Gerold, and 95-99 regarding Bede's earlier account of Saint Oswald; and Scharff, *Die Kämpfe*, 205.

[181] Regino, *Chronicon*, s.a. 886, ed. Friedrich Kurze, *MGH scriptores rerum germanicarum in usum scholarum separatim editi* 50 (Hanover, 1890), 125-126. See also Simon MacLean (trans.), *History and Politics in Late Carolingian*

an eleventh-century hand in a copy of Regino's *Chronicon*, described Henry's death in the following terms:

> His steed impaled and his arms were witnesses of his martyrdom,
> The man too was pierced through: God, let there be a crown.[182]

While militarily speaking, his end was not Henry's finest hour, this memorialization of his death characterized it as martyrdom—witnessed by his mount and weaponry—while praying he would be so rewarded. The text also offered an arresting image of rider and horse transfixed with spears in the manner of a martyrology. Indeed, Usuard's work from the 870s contained three such examples.[183] Based on these sources, we might surmise that contemporaries described Henry as a martyr particularly because he was killed when trapped and vulnerable. It also seems noteworthy that his epitaph in Soissons—meaning relatively close to Paris—portrayed him as a martyr, while Regino later emphasized instead that he charged into the ditch trying to avenge the Northmen's insults.

---

and Ottonian Europe: The Chronicle *of Regino of Prüm*, (Manchester, 2009), 194-195. *Annales Vedastini*, s.a. 886, ed. de Simson, 61-62, indicates that Henry was scouting out the Northmen's defenses when he was trapped and killed, and his death caused the Christians "magnumque dolorem et terrorem."

[182] *Epitaphium Heinrici*, ed. Paul von Winterfeld, ll. 11-12, *PLAC* 4.1 (München, 2000), 137:

"Martyrii testis sonipes perfossus et arma,
Vir quoque traiectus: esto corona, deus."

[183] *Le Martyrologe*, ed. Dubois: Namnetis (24 May, 234), "…qui pro constantia fidei in carcerem missi et in equulei catasta suspensi ac laniati, deinde lancea militari perfossi, novissime capita eorum praecisa sunt;" Marcus and Marcellianus (18 Jun., 249), "cumque demum non cessarent laudare Christum lancea, per latera transfixi, cum gloria martyrii ad siderea regna migraverunt;" and Benignus (1 Nov., 332), "postquam est a Terentio comite # gravissimis tormentis multipliciter afflictus, # tandem collum eius vecte ferreo tundi et corpus lancea forari iubetur."

During the night on February 6, 886, the Petit Pont collapsed because of the Seine's flooding, separating the tower there from the city.[184] Abbo related how the Danes attacked the twelve defenders, who fought fiercely, while the other Parisians could only watch helplessly from across the river.[185] In the same way that he often listed the chief heroes of particular battles, Abbo named the twelve and praised their heroic struggles.[186] The Danes, stymied by their fierce resistance, set the tower ablaze.[187] Then the defenders released their falcons, lest they die from the smoke, and lacking buckets or other equipment they failed to put out the fire.[188] The men fled to what remained of the bridge and prepared to make their final stand against their enemies, but the Danes gave them assurances that they would be ransomed as captives.[189] Abbo, however, reported a different outcome:

Oh agony! They trusted these wickedly false words,
Hoping they could be redeemed for a hefty price;
Truly they would not otherwise have been taken that day.
Alas, naked they underwent the savage folk's sword!
And to heaven they sent their souls as their blood flowed;
They took up martyrdom's palm and the dear crown.[190]

[184] Favre, *Eudes*, 46-47; and Vogel, *Die Normannen*, 329.

[185] Abbo, *Bella*, I, ll. 504-524, ed. von Winterfeld, 94.

[186] Abbo, *Bella*, I, ll. 525-528, ed. von Winterfeld, 94: "Ermemfredus, Eriveus, Erilandus, Odaucer,/ Ervic, Arnoldus, Solius, Gozbertus, Vuido,/ Ardradus, pariterque Eimardus Gozsuinusque."

[187] Abbo, *Bella*, I, ll. 529-536, ed. von Winterfeld, 94-95.

[188] Abbo, *Bella*, I, ll. 537-550, ed. von Winterfeld, 95. On Frankish nobles and falconry, see Eric Goldberg, *In the Manner of the Franks: Hunting, Kingship, and Masculinity in Early Medieval Europe* (Philadelphia, 2020), 151-157 and 160 with a reference to this incident.

[189] Abbo, *Bella*, I, ll. 550-558, ed. von Winterfeld, 95.

[190] Abbo, *Bella*, I, ll. 559-578, ed. von Winterfeld, 95-96: "Pro dolor! alloquiis sese credunt male finctis,/ Sperantes precio redimi potuisse sub amplo;/ Non alias vere caperentur luce sub illa./ Heu, nudi gladium subeunt gentis

Abbo mourned that the twelve died tragically while unable to fight off their enemies, memorializing them in heroic terms. He exclaimed "Oh agony!" and "Alas," because they had been tricked by the Northmen into surrendering, simultaneously confirming their heroism: "Truly they would not otherwise have been taken that day." Unarmed and no longer able to defend themselves, the Danes slaughtered them. A gloss to the manuscript indicated more specifically that they were "beheaded" (*decollari*).[191] Thus pouring out their blood, they sent their souls to heaven, where Abbo recounted that they received the "martyrdom's palm and the dear crown." Though the fate of their corpses was undignified, Abbo assured his readers that the memory of their deeds was not:

The bodies of those men whose struggles I relate, the merciless ones,
Out of fear, surrendered them lifeless to the Seine,
Their praise and name will continually *fly through the mouths of men*
And likewise their distinguished deaths and battles,
Until the sun learns to celebrate the night's darkness with its rays,
The moon and the stars make up the day.[192]

Knowing readers would have recognized an allusion here to *Georgics* (III, 9), where Vergil described how his poem would preserve his memory as he, "a victor, might fly through the

truculentae!/ Et caelo mittunt animas livore fluente;/ Martirii palmam sumunt caramque coronam."

[191] Abbo, *Bella*, I, l. 569, ed. von Winterfeld, 96.

[192] Abbo, *Bella*, I, ll. 584-589, ed. von Winterfeld, 96: "Quorum pre terrore virum certamina promo,/ Corpora crudeles Sequanae tradunt sine vita,/ Laus quorum jugiter nomenque per ora virorum/ Insignesque simul mortes et bella volabunt,/ Sol radiis donec noctis pompare tenebras,/ Luna diem, stellae pariter conponere discant."

mouths of men."[193] Thus did Abbo immortalize the twelve's "praise and name" and their "distinguished deaths and battles." At the end of this scene, Abbo made sure to defend his account of their end, claiming he was an eyewitness. He wrote: "Let no one contend with my words about this battle;/ Since no one will tell it more truly,/ Because I drank it in with my own eyes."[194] Such a testimonial may have seemed necessary because another, less flattering perspective of the soldiers' death existed. The *Annals of Saint-Vaast* recorded that Bishop Gauzlin, who had sent the men to protect the tower after the bridge fell, along with the citizens watched helplessly from the walls weeping as the brave defenders, broken by wounds and the fire, were captured and—to the "disgrace" (*opprobrium*) of the Christians—were killed in various ways, and then cast down headlong into the river.[195] The annalist, therefore, sought to reveal the horror and tragic humiliation of the twelve men's deaths. In contrast, Abbo stressed first that the Danes dumped their bodies out of fear to account for the appalling end of their remains, while celebrating their glory as an eyewitness to the events.

Thus Abbo memorialized twelve soldiers as martyrs, who, like Henry of Saxony, were slaughtered by the enemy while unable to defend themselves. Furthermore, Abbo would likely have been familiar with Usuard's martyrology, which included three accounts of groups of soldiers being martyred in the Roman era. In the first, forty "soldier saints" (*sancti milites*) in Asia Minor were tortured with chains in prison and beaten in the face with stones until they were placed in a pool where they

[193] Virgil, *Georgica*, III, 8-9, ed. Gian Biagio Conte (Berlin, 2013), 167: "possim…victorque virum volitare per ora."

[194] Abbo, *Bella*, I, ll. 593-595, ed. von Winterfeld, 96: "Nemo meis super hoc dictis insurgere bello/ Decertet; siquidem nemo nil verius ullus/ Expediet, quoniam propriis obtutibus hausi."

[195] *Annales Vedastini*, s.a. 886, ed. de Simson, 59.

became martyrs after their legs were broken.[196] In the second account, forty-six more baptized soldiers were executed in the city of Rome on the orders of Emperor Claudius, and they were buried with other martyrs.[197] Finally, the third account indicated that seventy soldiers were beheaded along with the two sons of Claudius the tribune, who was drowned in the sea after being bound to a huge stone.[198] While the record of the soldier martyrs in Rome does not specify how they were killed, the other two reveal that they were killed as prisoners. Thus, like Abbo's twelve martyrs and Duke Henry, these soldier martyrs appear to have been unable to defend themselves and thus were at the mercy of their pagan enemies. Furthermore, Abbo's account of the twelve martyrs and Henry's epitaph suggest a willingness among Carolingian elites in the last decades of the ninth century to commemorate soldier martyrs. As we shall see in Part Four, Abbo drew on this idea as well as the understanding of soldier robbers as monsters in a sermon from the 920s, when he joined them together to offer the possibility of a conversion experience for robbers who could become Christ's victorious soldiers and perhaps die as martyrs.

---

[196] Usuard, *Martyrologium*, 11 Mar., ed. DuBois, 192: "Apud Sebasten Armeniae minoris, natalis sanctorum quadraginta militum, qui, tempore Licinii regis, # post vincula et carceres creberrimos, post caesas lapidibus facies, missi sunt in stagnum, # et sic demum crurifragio martyrium consummaverunt. # Erant autem nobiliores inter eos Quirion et Candidus."

[197] Usuard, *Martyrologium*, 25 Oct., ed. DuBois, 328: "Romae, natalis quadraginta sex militum, qui simul baptizati a Dionisio papa, mox iubente Claudio imperatore decollati ac via Salaria sepulti, ubi et alii martyres centum viginti unus positi sunt. Inter quos fuerunt quattuor milites Christi, Theodosius, Lucius, Marcus, et Petrus. #"

[198] Usuard, *Martyrologium*, 3 Dec., ed. DuBois, 353: "Romae, natalis sanctorum martyrum Claudii tribuni, et uxoris eius Hilariae, ac filiorum Iasonis et Mauri, cum septuaginta militibus, # ex quibus Claudium iussit Numerianus imperator cum ingenti saxo alligatum in medio mari praecipitem dari, milites vero ac # filios ipsius Claudii capitali sententia puniri. #"

Abbo also revealed that Paris was protected by more than earthly soldiers. Saint Germain, Bishop Gauzlin's sixth-century predecessor and the patron of Abbo's monastery miraculously defended the city on numerous occasions.[199] It is well known that the saints were regarded as an important source of patronage and protection throughout late antiquity and the Middle Ages, so it should be unsurprising that they became defenders of their territories and communities during the Northmen's attacks.[200] Authors from the Merovingian period began describing saints with military imagery and terminology, and they recounted how they miraculously helped the faithful in danger or punished the wicked through their intercession with God.[201] Yet Merovingian saints did not serve a particularly military role in the cosmic struggle against evil. In the Carolingian era, however, saints came to be identified as warriors actively engaged in battle against Christ's enemies, in particular as a response to the Northmen's violence.[202] Such a result appears to have stemmed at least partially from the fact that the saints and their treasure were often targeted by the

[199] Regarding Germain's career as bishop, see Dumézil and Wagner, "Saint Germain," 69-80.

[200] For a recent introduction to saints and their sources in the early Middle Ages, see James Palmer, *Early Medieval Hagiography* (Leeds, 2018) with a helpful discussion of the key scholarship on 112-122. The classic study of saintly patronage is Peter Brown, *The Cult of Saints: Its Rise and Function in Latin Christianity*, 2nd ed. (Chicago, 2015).

[201] Graus, *Volk, Herrscher und Heiliger*, passim but esp. 458-462; Sarti, *Perceiving War*, 335-340; Sarti, "Der merowingisiche Heilige als Krieger," 83-99; and Duard Grounds, *Miracles and Punishment and the Religion of Gregory of Tours and Bede* (Vienna, 2015), esp. 125-157.

[202] Scharff, *Die Kämpfe der Herrscher und der Heiligen*, 45-50; Scharff, "Karolingerzeitliche Vorstellungen vom Krieg," 479-487; and Scharff, "Die Heiligen im Kampf gegen die Normannen," 101-125. See also Dobschenski, *Von Opfern und Tätern*, 94-112, who argues that living Merovingian saints tended to be the victims of violent barbarians and tyrants in the sources.

Northmen in their raids.[203] The saints did not remain passive victims in the face of such aggression. Instead, the sources reveal that they sometimes violently destroyed the pagans seeking to rob their churches and to harm their people.[204]

Germain was bishop of Paris in 552 and 556-576, and his sixth-century miracles were recorded by Venantius Fortunatus.[205] As recent scholars have noted, Fortunatus did use military language on occasion to describe him, writing that when Germain's mother sought to abort him, a battle ensued within her body as he resisted, and elsewhere that as bishop of the church of Paris, Germain acted spiritually as the leader (*dux*) of an army (*exercitus*) in which Fortunatus served as a "soldier swift to arms" (*miles ad arma celer*).[206] An anonymous Carolingian author recorded the saint's additional miracles in the eighth century, when his remains were transferred to the Church of Saint Vincent, which thereafter bore Germain's name.[207] It was not until the Northmen's attack on Paris and

[203] Scharff, "Die Heiligen im Kampf gegen die Normannen," 105-109; and Coupland, "Holy Ground?" 80-91.

[204] Scharff, "Die Heiligen im Kampf gegen die Normannen," 110-125.

[205] Venantius Fortunatus, *Vita Germani*, ed. Bruno Krusch, *MGH SRM* 7 (Hannover, 1888), 372-418 with an introduction 346-367. See also Krusch's introduction on 337-346; and Dumézil and Wagner, "Saint Germain," 69-80.

[206] Venantius Fortunatus, *Vita Germani*, 1, ed. Krusch, 372; and Venantius Fortunatus, *Ad clerum Parisiacum, Carmina*, II, 9, ed. Leo Friedrich, *MGH Auctores Antiquissimi* 4.1 (Berlin, 1881), 38-39. See Sarti, *Perceiving War*, 338; and Sarti, "Der merowingisiche Heilige als Krieger," 85-86. On the latter example, see also Brian Brennan, "The Image of the Merovingian Bishop in the Poetry of Venantius Fortunatus," *Journal of Medieval History* 18 (1992), 115-127; and Michael Roberts, *The Humblest Sparrow: The Poetry of Venantius Fortunatus* (Ann Arbor, 2009), 138 whose translation appears above.

[207] *Translatio sancti Germani vetustissima*, ed. Bruno Krusch, *MGH SRM* 7 (Hannover, 1888), 422-428 with an introduction 368-371. The transfer happened in 754. See Konrad Elmshäuser and Andreas Hedwig, *Studien zum Polyptychon von Saint-Germain-des-Prés* (Cologne, 1993), 7 on this event.

his monastery in 845 that Germain emerged fully as a soldier saint fighting Christ's enemies.[208] The author of the *Translatio sancti Germani Parisiensis* described Saint Germain in military terms when he defeated the Northmen with miraculous assaults. He killed several individual raiders in his church and then destroyed the rest with a dreadful plague of dysentery that caused them to flee Paris and return to Denmark, where they were beheaded by King Horich, who feared the saint's powers.[209] After the Danes left Paris, the author revealed that one brother saw Saint Germain "helmeted and armored, and very tired as if he were coming from the field of battle."[210] Thus the saint revealed his military role as defender of his people, church and city. Accordingly, the *Translatio*'s author celebrated this event as a "victory" (*victoria*) over the Northmen that could only be won by Saint Germain, who had been "fighting manfully against them."[211] When Haimo of Saint-Germain abbreviated this account of these events during the 870s in Book One of his *De miraculis*, he praised Saint Germain's miraculous defeat of the enemy as a "victory" (*victoria*) and "triumph" (*triumphus*), which God had granted him for his holy merits, and he cast the Northmen's destruction in Denmark as fitting "vengeance" (*ultio*) for their attacks.[212]

Abbo included numerous accounts of Saint Germain's attacks on the Northmen and his intervention in battle to save

[208] Scharff, *Die Kämpfe der Herrscher und der Heiligen*, 47-48; and Gillis, "Dreaming Saint Germain," which analyzes the events described briefly in the rest of this paragraph.

[209] *Translatio*, cc. 14-20 and 30-31, ed. de Smedt et al., 80-84 and 91-93.

[210] *Translatio*, c. 29, ed. de Smedt et al., 91-92: "… galeatum ac loricatum, et quasi ex campo certaminis veniens nimium fessum.

[211] *Translatio*, c. 31, ed. de Smedt et al., 93: "…erga eos viriliter decertante…"

[212] Haimo, *De miraculis*, I, 12-13 and 18, *PL* 126: 1035-1036 and 1038. For his account of the events described in the *Translatio*, see *De miraculis*, I, 7-10 and 12-13, *PL* 126: 1033-1034 and 1035-1036.

the city at critical points in the siege.[213] The first of these appears in Book One, when the Danes tried to burn down the city's key defenses of the Grand Pont and its tower with fireboats, and the Christians were helpless to prevent them.[214] Abbo revealed that city turned to its holy patron and defender—Saint Germain—with lamentations and pleas for rescue at that dangerous moment:

Hence earth and field, waters and heavens are burned;
The city laments and the towers tremble and the walls weep;
Alas, how great tearful rivers flow from blessed
Eyes! Beautiful youths, and also hoary old age, mourning
Let forth lamentations; and mothers tearing their locks
Showed their backs on dry land, and roll their hair across the ground:
Now some beat their naked breasts with their fists,
While others tore their cheeks made wet with tears.
Then the citizens hurry with alarm, and all call on celebrated
Germain: "Have pity, Germain, on your poor servants!"
Once he had been Paris's most holy bishop,
And his venerable body shines there still.
The walls echo Germain's name, and in every
Tower soldiers and the men's leaders exclaim:
"O Germain, come help your servants!"
The shores and the deep sea's watery waves call and
The countless, echoing cries beat upon the starry thrones,
Where the nourisher shines forth as splendor;
And to their cries the city echoes "Germain!"
Mothers and equally young girls are running
To the saint's tomb, to beg for welcome aid.[215]

---

[213] Scharff, "Karolingerzeitliche Vorstellungen vom Krieg," 485-487; and id., "Die Heiligen im Kampf gegen die Normannen," 116-118.

[214] Abbo, *Bella*, I, lines 353-384, ed. von Winterfeld, 90.

[215] Abbo, *Bella*, I, lines 385-405, ed. von Winterfeld, 90-91: "Hinc tellus et ager, limfae caelique cremantur;/ Urbs luget speculaeque timent et menia deflent;/ Heu, quam magna oculis manant lacrimosa beatis/ Flumina!

In this dire situation, earth, water and heaven all succumbed to the flames. Abbo captured the defenders' emotional response to this dreadful threat first through personification: the city itself mourns, its towers trembling in fear and its walls become wet with tears. Indeed, the poet then goes to great lengths to dramatize the defenders' calls for saintly assistance. Lamenting himself, he writes "alas" while directing his reader's eye to the inhabitants, whose eyes pour forth "great tearful rivers." From the most lovely youths to the grey-haired elders, all grieve and lament. The women with their backs laid bare tear their hair and roll their tresses across the ground, some violently beating "their naked breasts with their fists" while others scratch up their tearful cheeks. In alarm, the citizens collectively rush to call upon the saint, calling to him "Have pity, Germain, on your poor servants!"[216] The poet explained that long ago he had been the city's "most holy bishop," and his shining, "venerable body" remained still in Paris. Soon the entire city resounded with cries for the bishop, and in the towers the soldiers and their commanders cried out, "O Germain, come help your servants!" After the soldiers, the Seine's shores and "watery waves" follow their example. All of these "countless, echoing" cries and pleas reached up to heaven, where—like the women beating their

Dant pulchri iuvenes, sed et alba senectus,/ Merentes gemitus; matresque iubas laniando/ Terga dabant siccae, crinesque per arva revolvunt:/ Hae colafis nudata suis iam pectora tundunt,/ At secuere genas aliae lacrimis madefactas./ Tum trepidant cives, cunctique vocant celebrandum/ Germanum: 'Miserere tuis, Germane, misellis!'/ Parisius presul fuerat sanctissimus olim,/ Inlustrabat eam cuius venerabile corpus./ Menia Germani nomen recinunt, et in omni / Exclamat miles specula primique virorum:/ 'O famulis, Germane, tuis succurrere disce!'/ Littora seu liquidi laticis pelagus ciet altum/ Sidereosque thronos, quibus emicat ut iubar almus,/ Verberat innumerus echo comitante boatus;/ Germanum respondet et urbs vocitantibus ipsum./ Concurrunt matres pariter iuvenesque puellae/ Ad sancti tumulum, suffragia poscere grata."

[216] On the early medieval clamor and cries for holy assistance, see note 14 above.

breasts—they "beat upon the starry thrones," the saint's celestial dwelling place. The city itself re-echoed the cries for Saint Germain, as mothers and girls rush to his tomb to beg for his help.

Abbo then reported how the Danes mocked the Christians' pleas for holy protection, but Saint Germain nevertheless answered them, causing the fireboats to run aground, where the defenders extinguished them and kept them as booty.[217] Thus Abbo made clear how important the city's prayers and lamentations were in winning saintly protection in their time of dire need. Regarding such miracles, Szarmach noted how this pattern would become common among later medieval authors: "Abbo's moral/cosmic framework … is the standard kind that the later medieval period particularly favours: God works through his saints to intervene on behalf of the just and the good. Christian prayer receives positive results."[218] Germain would fight the enemy again throughout the course of the siege. For instance, he protected his church from individual Northmen robbers as he had in 845.[219] After Bishop Gauzlin's death, he killed more Northmen enemies and even saved the entire city from an overwhelming attack, when the Christians called upon him again with great lamentations to prevent the enemy from conquering them.[220] Not long after this last victory, during which Abbo claimed Germain appeared "bodily" to help the Christians destroy countless Northmen, the poet had the personified city of Paris itself laud its holy patron in martial terms. Here readers should note definite similarities between Abbo's praise for Saint Germain—the city's ancient

[217] Abbo, *Bella*, I, lines 406-432, ed. von Winterfeld, 91-92.

[218] Szarmach, "The (Sub-) Genre," 55-57 with the passage quoted on 57.

[219] Abbo, *Bella*, I, lines 468-500, ed. von Winterfeld, 93-94.

[220] Abbo, *Bella*, II, 79-153 and 254-314, ed. von Winterfeld, 100-102 and 105-106, the latter of which related how he stopped the Northmen from taking the city.

bishop—and for Bishop Gauzlin, who had died recently during the siege:

Come, City of Paris, under which princes were you
Protected? 'Who could defend me, except
This excellent Germanus, all of my strength and love?
After the king of kings and his holy mother
He himself was my king and pastor, and my mighty count;
He is my handy double-edged sword, he is my catapult,
And he is my shield, my wide city wall, and also my quick bow.'[221]

Paris glorified its defender Saint Germain in several ways: as its own powers of strength and love; in the offices of those charged with protecting it—king, bishop and count; and as the personified arms and defenses set against the Danes in the siege. Thus Paris celebrated Germain's holy power, which was as effective in battle as an earthly commander's.[222] His victory was the city's. While the Parisians had feared and lamented that they would soon be slaughtered by the conquering Northmen, his fierce and holy heroism saved them. Germain thus answered their prayers, appearing even bodily to battle their enemies, to reinvigorate the beleaguered soldiers, and to extinguish the flames threatening the watchtower at the critical hour.

Abbo's epic thus cast the defense of Paris in richly heroized and spiritualized terms. He stressed that its mortal heroes, such as Count Odo and Bishop Gauzlin, overcame their fear of wounds and death from an overwhelming enemy in order to

[221] Abbo, *Bella*, II, lines 380-387, ed. von Winterfeld, 108: "Urbs age Parisius, sub quis defensa fuisti/ Principibus? 'Me quis poterat defendere, primas/ Hic nisi Germanus, virtus et amor meus omnis?/ Post regem regum sanctameque eius genetricem/ Rex meus ipse fuit pastorque, comes quoque fortis/ Hic ensis bis-acutus adest meus, is catapulta,/ Is clipeusque, patens murus, velox sed et arcus.'" Bührer-Thierry, "Bishops as City Defenders," 36-37 connects the praise for Germain and Gauzlin.

[222] Scharff, "Karolingerzeitliche Vorstellungen vom Krieg," 487.

perform great deeds and slaughter countless foes. As an example to the protectors of other cities, therefore, Abbo's portrayal of combat laid bare battle's terrors as well as its glories. Furthermore, he celebrated the martyrdom of unarmed soldiers slaughtered by the Northmen, revealing that a new vision of warfare against non-Christians was taking shape in Francia at the end of the ninth century. The saints also took part in such struggles, such as when Saint Germain protected his city when its earthly protectors could not. Furthermore, when disaster struck—whether this meant the loss of a leader, such as Gauzlin, or the city's imminent destruction—Abbo incorporated lamentations in his epic to reveal to readers the important role that prayer played in the city's defense. In these ways, Abbo presented an image of Christian heroic violence that strongly contrasted with the clergy's view of monstrous soldier robbers from that same era. Both, nevertheless, featured horror rhetoric, imagery and emotions to identify the forces of good and evil as they participated in the church's cosmic war. As we shall see in the following section, these two views of soldiers would inform Abbo's response to the problem of Christian sins and the Northmen's attacks in the sermons he composed during the 920s.

PART FOUR

"O, FRANCIA, PROTECT YOURSELF!"

COSMIC WAR IN ABBO OF SAINT GERMAIN'S SERMONS

COSMIC WAR IN ABBO OF SAINT GERMAIN'S SERMONS

When a wave of Viking attacks plagued western Francia in the 920s after they overwhelmed the Kingdom of Brittany in 919, Abbo of Saint-Germain created a sermon collection "for the utility of simple clerics" out of both original and earlier writings at the behest of Bishop Froterius of Poitiers (900-936) and Bishop Fulrad of Paris (922-926/927).[223] Abbo wrote in his preface that he offered both clear explanations of the Gospels for those who found the works of the church fathers obscure and additional things helpful for the salvation of readers and

[223] Abbo, pref., ed. Önnerfors, 63: "ad utilitatem simplicium clericorum." Önnerfors, *Abbo*, 204-299, offers a useful commentary on all of the sermons. On Carolingian sermons, see Thomas Amos, *The Origin and Nature of the Carolingian Sermon* (Dissertation, Michigan State University, 1983); and Diesenberger, *Predigt und Politik*. Regarding Abbo's collection, see also Charles West, "'Fratres, omni die videtis cum vadit istud regnum in perdicionem': Abbo of Saint-Germain and the Crisis of 888," in *The Collapse of the Early Medieval European Kingdoms (8th-9th Centuries)*, ed. Iñaki Martín Viso, *Reti Medievali Rivista* 17 (2016), 301-317, who discusses several of the sermons; Piroska Nagy, "La notion de Christianitas et la spatialisation du sacré au Xe siècle: un sermon d'Abbon de Saint-Germain," *Médiévales*, 49 (2005), 1-15; and Jean Leclercq, "Le florilège d'Abbon de Saint-Germain," *Revue du Moyen Âge latin* 3 (1947), 113-140. Neil Price, *The Vikings in Brittany* (London, 1989), 39-43 indicates that Breton resistance against the Northmen ended in 919. Abbo's *Sermo adversus raptores bonorum alienorum* can be dated by reference to the fall of Brittany to the Northmen: c. 16, 97-98.

listeners.[224] The bishops probably asked Abbo to make the compilation because of his reputation as a poet. As we have seen, he offered an arresting account of the defense of Paris in the 880s as an example of Christian heroism to the protectors of other cities. Yet his epic also included a sermon-like ending to Book Two. There he criticized King Odo—one of the city's great defenders—for failing to drive out the Northmen in the 890s, and he called upon the Franks in general to repent their sins of pride, lust and vanity which prevented them from defeating the pagans as before.[225] Thus, like earlier Carolingian moralists, Abbo saw correction as the main antidote to the Christian sins causing pagan victories.[226] When Abbo developed his sermon collection from the 920s, he returned to these themes. He also linked the Northmen's attacks to the crimes of monstrous soldier robbers specifically in three sermons, borrowing such rhetoric from King Carloman's prologue of 884 and even adapting this earlier text in one of them.[227] Abbo's adoption of this monster theology occurred at a time when conflict among Christians, especially between the supporters of the Carolingian and Robertian dynasties, caused great upheaval as the Northmen attacked Western Francia.[228]

---

[224] Abbo, pref., ed. Önnerfors, 63.

[225] Abbo, *Bella parisiacae urbis*, II, ll. 583-618, ed. von Winterfeld, 114-115.

[226] Szarmach, "The (Sub-) Genre," 57; Dass, *Viking Attacks*, 10-11; and Amos, *The Origin and Nature*, 338-339.

[227] Abbo, *Sermo* [6] *adversus raptores bonorum alienorum*, ed. Önnerfors, 94-99; id., *Sermo* [11] *adversus raptores qui bona pauperum hominum diripiunt*, ed. Önnerfors, 113-117; and id., *Sermo* [14] *de fundamento et incremento christianitatis*, ed. Önnerfors, 133-146. There is also id., *Sermo* [24] *adversus eos qui res ecclesiasticas diripiunt* (199-202), which does not mention the pagans, but is very similar to the *Collectio de raptoribus* in "38. Quierzy, 14 February 857," *MGH Conc.* 3, 392-396. Here see also West, "'Fratres, omni die videtis,'" 6.

[228] On the political history of the 920s, see Geoffrey Koziol, "Charles the Simple, Robert of Neustria, and the *vexilla* of Saint-Denis," *Early Medieval Europe* 14 (2006), 355-390; id., "Is Robert I in Hell? The Diploma for Saint-Denis and the Mind of a Rebel King (Jan. 25, 923)," *Early Medieval Europe*

This section examines how Abbo crafted his sermons to argue that Christian robbers made themselves into Christ's enemies and persecutors of the church. In this fashion, his sermons provided the bishops with an effective tool for correcting, converting and even condemning wayward soldiers and their leaders. Such an approach was a remarkable change from his epic. Nevertheless, Abbo took different approaches to the problem that these criminals posed in each of his three sermons. In one, he built upon his epic's notion of heroism to call upon sinful soldiers to convert back to Christ and fight in God's war against the pagans. As Charles West has argued, this war sermon portrayed the defense of the realm as "prefiguring later elaborations of the idea of holy war (if that is not too teleological a way of thinking about it)," in which soldiers invoked God's name as they marched into battle and who would be martyrs should they die there.[229] Nevertheless, as we shall see, Abbo's articulation of holy war spoke to the concerns of Frankish authorities in the early tenth century. And he offered Christian soldiers not only a chance to rejoin the good side in the cosmic war against evil, but also to defend the church victoriously and possibly be counted among its martyred heroes.

Abbo's other two sermons presented a much less glorious view of things. In one, he adapted King Carloman's prologue to

14 (2006), 233-267; id., *The Politics of Memory and Identity in Carolingian Royal Diplomas: The West Frankish Kingdom (840-987)* (Turnhout, 2012), 401-534; and Lösslein, *Royal Power*, 151-190.

[229] West, "'Fratres omni die videtis," 10; and Leclercq, "Le florilège," 117-118 also saw links to the later crusading tradition. See also Gübele, *Deus vult*, 198-205 who argues, without reference to Abbo's epic or his war sermon, that the wars against the Northmen were different from later holy wars particularly because Christians dying in battle were not regarded as martyrs. Coupland, "The Rod of God's Wrath," 554, suggests without reference to Abbo's sermons that the Carolingian church's response to the Northmen's attacks overall amounted to "a Frankish crusade against paganism."

cast robbing soldiers as the church's monstrous enemies. As the holy patrons of their communities, the saints' accusations against the robbers angered God, who prevented them from winning their battles against the pagans. While Abbo's message remained one of conversion, his approach was to correct soldiers by horrifying them with a glimpse of their spiritual reality rather than to inspire them as heroes. In the third text in the collection, Abbo abandoned his heroic vision entirely. He condemned soldier robbers in the severest of terms: they were nothing other than the church's unredeemable foes, "Hell's firebrands," reprobates in the making and, therefore, the walking damned. His depiction of their crimes and their suffering in Hell drew from the worm theology directed at such offenders examined earlier in Part Two. As false Christians and Christ's predatory enemies, Abbo argued that their persecutions transformed their suffering victims into the city of God, the true church. While the first two sermons' audience included soldiers, this final text appears to have been directed at monks and clerics, whose people and institutions endured the robbers' crimes. Abbo's sermon collection, therefore, approached the problem of soldier robbers in dramatically different ways. He drew from various traditions of spiritualized thinking about soldiers from the last decades of the ninth century in order to unveil their role in the great cosmic war as either the church's truest champions or its vilest oppressors in the 920s.

Abbo's first sermon about the Northmen and robbers—his *Sermon* [6] *against the Robbers of Others' Property* (or as it is called in some manuscripts his *Sermon to Soldiers*)—detailed how these same military men could turn back to Christ, become victors in God's war against the pagans, and perhaps even die as martyrs.[230] Therefore, Abbo's sermon articulated a new and

[230] Abbo, *Sermo* [6] *adversus raptores bonorum alienorum*, ed. Önnerfors, 94-99; and Leclercq, "Le florilège," 117-121.

transformative kind of heroism for Frankish military men, a pious remedy to robbery's sinfulness whose process involved revealing to predatory nobles and knights their troubling spiritual reality in order to transform them into Christ's holy fighters. Abbo began: "Brothers, every day you see that this kingdom of yours is headed to perdition," and he explained how the peasants, who made their wealth possible (including their arms and horses), were now dead or in captivity.[231] This disaster was surely the soldiers' own fault: "Certainly God is angry with us, and therefore so many evils come over us from the pagans and the sterility of the earth," which he made clear would not sustain evil inhabitants, who were known by their evil works.[232] Abbo continued about the cause of their failure in the battles with the Northmen. Here he adopted King Carloman's concept of robbing soldiers as monstrous eaters of human flesh, but without much of its graphic imagery. He wrote: "But how can you please God and have victory, you who always have your hands filled with perjuries and robbery? In however many villages you pass through on a march, you always devour poor people and plunder the villages of God's churches, and therefore your hands are bound by the chains of sins and you cannot have victory."[233] Citing I Corinthians

[231] Abbo, *Sermo* ⌈6⌉ *adversus raptores bonorum alienorum*, 1, ed. Önnerfors, 94: "Fratres, omni die videtis cum vadit istud regnum in perdicionem."

[232] Abbo, *Sermo* ⌈6⌉ *adversus raptores bonorum alienorum*, 2-3, ed. Önnerfors, 94, here c. 2: "Certe Deus est nobis iratus, et propterea veniunt super nos tanta mala de paganis et de sterilitate terre." On the sterile earth, Abbo cites Augustine, *Adnotationes in Iob*, lib. 1, ed. Joseph Zycha, *CSEL* 28 (Vienna, 1895), 580.

[233] Abbo, *Sermo* ⌈6⌉ *adversus raptores bonorum alienorum*, 6, ed. Önnerfors, 95: "Sed quomodo potestis vos Deo placere et victoriam habere qui semper habetis vestras manus plenas de periuriis et de rapinis? Quantis vicibus vos ambulatis in aliquo itinere, semper manducatis pauperes homines et predatis villas ecclesiarum Dei et propertea sunt vestre manus ligate de catenis peccatorum et non potestis habere victoriam."

(6:10), he warned them just as King Carloman and others had before: "No plunderers will possess the kingdom of God."[234]

Abbo continued with historical examples. He encouraged his audience to emulate their own Christian ancestors, the pagan Romans whose success grew from their virtues, or the Jews whose repentance God rewarded with "total victory" (*tota victoria*) over their pagan enemies.[235] Abbo wanted the soldiers to see that what they needed to do was make a conversion. In this fashion, he echoed the sentiments of earlier Carolingian writers, such as the author of the *Translatio sancti Germani Parisiensis*, who noted that sinful soldiers without Christ's support could not defeat the church's enemies. Abbo advised them: "Consider, brothers, how our Lord calls to you every day: 'Come back to me and I will come back to you' [Mal 3:7], and therefore if you truly are converted so that you fear God and his saints, and you promise God that you will no longer live from robbery, but from your justice, then our Lord himself will extend his mercy over you and will free you from all of your enemies." [236] By turning back to Christ, Abbo urged his listeners, they could avoid the evils that had befallen the king, counts and bishops of Brittany, who in 919 became "pilgrims in a foreign land."[237] Then Abbo indicated how such a conversion would transform soldiers on the battlefield:

---

[234] Abbo, *Sermo* [6] *adversus raptores bonorum alienorum*, 7, ed. Önnerfors, 95: "Certe de vobis rapinatoribus dicit sancta scriptura: Neque rapaces regnum Dei possidebunt."

[235] Abbo, *Sermo* [6] *adversus raptores bonorum alienorum*, 11-12, ed. Önnerfors, 96-97.

[236] Abbo, *Sermo* [6] *adversus raptores bonorum alienorum*, 14, ed. Önnerfors, 97: "Adtendite, fratres, quid noster Dominus clamat ad vos omni die: 'Revertimini ad me et ego revertar ad vos' et propterea si veraciter conversi fueritis, quo Deum et suos sanctos timeatis et promittatis Deo, ut non amplius vivatis de rapina sed de vestra iustitia, noster Dominus ipse ostendet misericordiam super vos et liberabit vos de omnibus inimicis vestris."

[237] Abbo, *Sermo* [6] *adversus raptores bonorum alienorum*, 16, ed. Önnerfors, 97-98: "peregrini in aliena terra."

> O, Francia, protect yourself! Don't multiply and increase your enemies, but—just as Scripture commands—fight for your fatherland [2 Macc 8:21 and 13:14], don't fear to die in God's war. Certainly, if you are killed there, then you will be holy martyrs. And know that the end is foreknown by God. A man cannot be killed among all of those swords, if it is not his end. For it is written: 'You have established his bounds, which cannot be passed [Job 14:5]. And therefore enter secure into the Lord God's war. And when you go into God's battle, all shout in a great voice: 'Christ conquers, Christ reigns, Christ commands!' And in that very hour the prince of the pagans, the Devil, will flee when he hears the Christians' terrible voice. And next the pagans will flee after their prince, the Devil. And thus you, who have God as king and prince, will receive victory from the giving Lord...[238]

Abbo's sermon unveiled a vision of military men transformed from monstrous eaters of Christian flesh into

[238] Abbo, *Sermo* [6] *adversus raptores bonorum alienorum*, 18-21, ed. Önnerfors, 98-99: "[18] O, Francia custodi temetipsam! Nolite vestros inimicos multiplicare et crescere sed, sicut conmendat scriptura, pugnate pro patria vestra, nolite timere mori in bello Dei. Certe si ibi mortui fueritis sancti martyres eritis. [19] Et scitote terminum a Deo prescitum. Inter omnes gladios non potest homo occidi si suus finis non est. Scriptum est enim: 'Constituisti terminos eius eorum qui preteriri non poterunt.' Et propterea intrate securi in bellum Domini Dei. [20] Et cum vos intratis in bellum Dei clamate omnes voce magna: Christus vincit, Christus regnat, Christus imperat! Et in ipsa hora fugiet princeps paganorum diabolus cum audierit tam terribilem vocem christianorum. Et deinde fugient ipsi pagani post suum principem diabolum. [21] Et sic vos qui habetis Deum regem et principem accipietis victoriam donante Domino nostro Ihesu Christo cui est cum Deo patre et spiritu sancto regnum et imperium in secula seculorum, amen." Önnerfors, 241 points out this passage is like Abbo, *Bella*, II, ll. 583-618, ed. von Winterfeld, 114-115.

heroic would-be martyrs defeating Satan's minions, the Northmen. As already noted, this was a remarkable historical development foreshadowing later medieval ideas of holy war. Yet rather than calling for a march upon Jerusalem against a distant enemy, Abbo urged Christian soldiers to abandon their sins and convert back to Christ in order to defeat the church's pagan enemies at home.[239] Overall, the poetics of his sermon moved the audience's gaze from its own spiritual crimes to historical examples showing the dismal fate awaiting them, and then to the possibility of conversion and heroic victory. The literary effect of this movement made conceivable the audience's realization of the sermon's message, meaning perhaps they might very well convert back to Christ and be transformed into his champions conquering pagan foes.

Abbo's call "fight for your fatherland, don't fear to die in God's war!" appears to have been taken from 2 Maccabees 8:21 and 13:14. This was not the only occasion upon which Carolingian authors turned to the Maccabees while discussing Christian conflicts with the Northmen. For instance, as we saw in Part Three, the *Annals of Saint-Vaast* referred to I Maccabees 9:13, when depicting Paris's brave defenders in 885. Earlier, the *Annals of Fulda* described the Frankish Count Robert as a "second Maccabee," because of his many struggles against the Northmen.[240] In 881, the Council of Fismes used the example of the victorious Judah Maccabee and his men to warn Christian robbers against their crimes, since Judah saw that those who

[239] See the references to West, Leclerq and Gübele in note 229 above. For introductions to the First Crusade, see Rubenstein, *Armies of Heaven*, esp. 17-32 on preaching the Crusade; Thomas Madden, *The Concise History of the Crusades*, 3rd ed. (New York, 2013), 1-34; Peter Frankopan, *The First Crusade: The Call from the East* (Cambridge, MA, 2012), esp. 1-12 on preaching the Crusade; and the translated documents in Jay Rubenstein, *The First Crusade: A Brief History with Documents* (New York, 2015), 62-77.

[240] *Annales Fuldenses*, s.a. 867, ed. Friedrich Kurze, *MGH Scriptores rerum germanicarum in usum scholarum separatim editi* 7 (Hannover, 1891), 66.

died in battle had carried idolatrous objects into battle—thus, the bishops warned, soldier robbers going to war bearing criminal consciences would also be defeated.[241] Knowing readers following Abbo's allusion to 2 Maccabees 8:21 would have recalled in that text that Judah Maccabee had just finished a speech to encourage his men to fight the gentiles, since God would help them. He urged them in his rousing oration not to fear their wicked enemy, since God could strike them down as numerous historical events proved.[242] Quite likely Abbo's use of historical examples earlier in his sermon was inspired by this passage, though he selected cases specifically appropriate to his audience. The scriptural author revealed that the results of Judah Maccabee's speech were effective: "With these words they were made steadfast and were prepared to die for their laws and their fatherland."[243]

Abbo's allusion to 2 Maccabees 13:14 led readers to the occasion when Judas led his soldiers in lamentations and fasting before they marched against their blasphemous enemy. The text reads: "Therefore giving the power over all things to God, the world's creator, he exhorted his men to fight bravely and stand all the way onto death for their laws, the temple, the city, the fatherland and the citizens."[244] Abbo, however, then claimed that the soldiers dying in war would be martyrs, which is a departure from his biblical source, which only described those who earlier had refused to transgress the laws of their faith as martyrs.[245] Abbo also focused on God's control over human

[241] "15. Fismes (April 881)," c. 7, ed. Wilfried Hartmann, Isolde Schröder and Gerhard Schmitz, *MGH Conc.* 5 (Hannover, 2012), 166-201, here 192.

[242] 2 Macc 8:16-21.

[243] 2 Macc 8:21: "his verbis constantes effecti sunt/ et pro legibus et patria mori parati." Cf. I Macc 3:21: "nos vero pugnabimus pro animabus nostris et legibus nostris."

[244] 2 Macc 13:14: "dans itaque potestatem omnium Deo mundi creatori/ et hortatus suos ut fortiter dimicarent/ et usque ad mortem pro legibus templo civitate patria et civibus starent."

[245] 2 Macc 6:18-31 and 7:1-42.

mortality, so that soldiers should not fear dying. He wrote: "And know that the end is foreknown by God. A man cannot be killed among all of those swords, if it is not his end." Abbo then created a vivid scene of battle, in which his listeners imagined their Christian battlecry would terrify Satan and his pagan minions, all of whom would flee before them. Their invocation, "Christ conquers, Christ reigns, Christ commands!" formed the opening lines of the *Laudes Regiae*, which the Franks since Charlemagne's era sometimes used to call upon divine aid in battle.[246] Thus fortified by Christ's power, the soldiers would terrify the pagans and their prince, the Devil, and triumph. In this way, Abbo moved the audience's gaze away from the grim possibility of dying in battle to see the rout of the enemy, a victory granted by God.

The spiritualized martial joy expressed in Abbo's war sermon encouraged and memorialized a form of military service that exchanged the vices of robbery and infernal punishment for earthly victory and eternal reward. Drawing from the heroism expressed in his epic, Abbo linked correction with courage in his appeal to soldiers, showing that they could still be on the right side in the church's great fight against sin and evil. That such an admonition in the sermon was directed at the soldiers themselves should come as no surprise. Yet Abbo offered a much more critical appraisal of delinquent soldiers in his second sermon, which featured an adaptation of Carloman II's 884 prologue. To my knowledge, Abbo's adoption of the king's prologue has remained undiscovered until now. His use of this earlier work suggests perhaps that Bishop Gauzlin of Paris, who had previously been abbot of Saint-Germain and was present at Ver in 884 when the capitulary was issued, may have provided Abbo's monastery with a copy of the text. Unlike his

[246] McCormick, *Eternal Victory*, 355-356; and Michael McCormick, "The Liturgy of War in the Early Middle Ages: Crisis, Litanies, and the Carolingian Monarchy," *Viator* 15 (1984): 1-23, here 23.

war sermon, which merely echoed King Carloman's gruesome imagery and disturbing rhetoric in a limited manner, Abbo here included the entire passage from the prologue in his text and added material stressing that churches were these robbers' victims. The sermon, entitled *Sermon* [11] *against Robbers who Plunder the Property of Poor People*, opened with this message about ecclesiastical property very clearly:

> All of you, brothers, let us admonish in common from the authority of almighty God, who speaks to you through his prophets, through his apostles and through ourselves, who hold the position and place of Christ in this world, so that you abstain as much from great robbery as from plundering in all places the villages of Christ's holy churches.[247]

In this manner, Abbo set the stage for recasting King Carloman's passage about the flesh-devouring and blood-drinking robbers more strongly and distinctly as persecutors of the church. Though they still robbed peasants, now these peasants were more clearly associated with the institutional church. This was an old theme in Merovingian and Carolingian writings against robbers and one reiterated more recently at the Synod of Trosly (909), whose proceedings echoed some of the rhetoric of King Carloman's prologue and of Winemar's excommunication from 900, while also condemning powerful men who oppressed and devoured those weaker than them in the same way as the fish in the sea ate one another.[248]

[247] Abbo's *Sermo* [11] *adversus raptores qui bona pauperum hominum diripiunt*, c. 1, ed. Önnerfors, 113-117, here 113: "Omnes vos, fratres, in conmune ammoneamus ex auctoritate Dei omnipotentis qui ad vos loquitur per suos prophetas, per suos apostolos et per nosmetipsos qui vicem et locum Christi tenemus in hoc seculo, ut abstineatis vos a tam magna rapina quam in omnibus locis facitis predando villas sanctarum eclesiarum Christi."

[248] Magnou-Nortier, "The Enemies of the Peace," 58-79; and "58. Trosly (26. June, 909)," ed. Wilfried Hartmann, Isolde Schröder and Gerhard Schmitz, *MGH Conc.* 5 (Hannover, 2012), 497-562, esp. the pref., 503-506, c. 7, 530-

Nevertheless, King Carloman's capitulary had only touched on this theme in the canons as part of the legal prosecution of robbers, and the persecution of the church did not appear in the sermon-like prologue, since the thrust of the accusation against the robbers instead concerned the poor.

Abbo's reuse of the prologue, therefore, was aimed at casting robbers foremost as the church's enemies. He next included King Carloman's horrifying passage of robbers plundering the poor, letting its nightmare vision reveal how such monstrous villains harmed the faithful.[249] He wrote that the sin of robbery was a spiritual disease that corrupted and evilly perverted those willingly infected by it in body and mind.[250] Like others before him, he reminded such criminals of Paul's warning that robbers would not enter God's kingdom (I Cor 6:10).[251] He then revealed that pillaging fellow Christians was such a horrid perversion, since spiritually the perpetrators devoured their flesh and drank their blood.[252] Such monstrosity also revealed the links between Christian sins and the Northmen's attacks. Following Isaiah's admonition that plunderers will be plundered (33:1), he explained that the pagans held dominion over the Christians because of these violent robberies: "Truly we rob our brothers and therefore the pagans rightly rob us and

531, which also includes King Carloman's pairing of Is 9:20 and Gal 5:15, and c. 13, 552-554, where the bishops borrowed language from Winemar's excommunication. See "47. Reims. 6 July 900," ed. Hartmann et al., 457.

[249] As indicated above, the text is taken from "287. Karolomanni capitulare Vernense. 884. March," ed. Boretius and Krause, 371-372, which is cited and analyzed in Part One of this study.

[250] Abbo, *Sermo* ⌈11⌋ *adversus raptores qui bona pauperum hominum diripiunt*, c. 2, ed. Önnerfors, 113.

[251] Abbo, *Sermo* ⌈11⌋ *adversus raptores qui bona pauperum hominum diripiunt*, c. 2, ed. Önnerfors, 113: "'Rapaces regnum Dei non possidebunt.'"

[252] Abbo, *Sermo* ⌈11⌋ *adversus raptores qui bona pauperum hominum diripiunt*, c. 3, ed. Önnerfors, 113.

our property."[253] Then Abbo offered King Carloman's grim depiction of such monstrous soldiers marching to battle, which sharply contrasted his vision of Christ's holy heroes defeating the Northmen in Sermon 6:

> How, therefore, can we securely march against our enemies and those of God's holy church, when the plunder of the poor is enclosed within our house? ⌜Is 3:14⌝ And not only is it in our house, but also it commonly happens that some march against the foe with a belly full of booty. How can we completely conquer our enemies, when the blood of our brothers drips from our mouth and our hands are full of blood and our arms weighed down by the weight of suffering and robbery, weakening all of the strength of our mind and body? Our prayers are not received by God, because the clamors and weeping and deep sighs of the poor, the orphans and widows overcome and surpass our voices, which made heavy by these atrocities to our brothers become hoarse, lacking the melodiousness of the sound of virtues.[254]

[253] Abbo, *Sermo* ⌜11⌝ *adversus raptores qui bona pauperum hominum diripiunt*, cc. 4–5, ed. Önnerfors, 113–114 with the quotation from c. 5, 114: "Nos vero predamur fratres nostros et idcirco pagani merito nos nostramque substantiam depredantur."

[254] Abbo, *Sermo* ⌜11⌝ *adversus raptores qui bona pauperum hominum diripiunt*, c. 6, ed. Önnerfors, 114: "Quomodo igitur securi pergere poterimus contra inimicos sancte Dei ecclesie et nostros, cum rapina pauperum conclusa est in domo nostra? Et non solum domi inclusa est, verum etiam plerumque evenit, ut pleno ventre rapina contra hostem quidam proficiscantur. Sed quomodo poterimus inimicos nostros devincere, cum sanguis fratrum nostrorum ab ore nostro distillat et manus nostre plene sunt sanguine et brachia pondere miseriarum et rapinarum gravantur totaque virtus animi corporisque debilitatur? Preces nostre a Deo non recipiuntur, quia clamores et ploratus altaque suspiria pauperum et orfanorum pupillorum atque viduarum preoccupant et preveniunt voces nostras, que crudelitatibus fratrum nostrorum gravate raucitudinem acceperunt nullam sonoritatem virtutum habentes."

Rather than terrifying Satan and his minions, these frightening Christian monsters were themselves abject perversions. They feebly marched against the foreign enemy with Christian blood dripping from their mouths and their blood-stained hands. The Northmen need not fear such weakened troops, since they had spent their soldierly vigor on their sinful crimes. And such monstrous men were unable to thunder forth the righteous Christian battle cry from the *Laudes Regiae*—"Christ conquers, Christ reigns, Christ commands!"—because their hoarse and heavy voices were drowned out by their victims' "clamors and weeping and deep sighs."[255] As in the case of King Carloman's prologue in 884, the audience could easily imagine that such corrupted and debased troops would quickly be slaughtered by the wicked pagans, who would then unleash their fury and cruelty upon the realm's unprotected people.

After this horror scene, Abbo listed the many sins that corrupt soldiers might be tempted to commit. Here he especially emphasized murder and sacrilege, which were the crimes for which soldier robbers had been condemned and excommunicated since the Synod of Quierzy (857), and he further warned that plundered Christian property could not be given to the church as legitimate alms.[256] Abbo then closed the sermon by emphasizing again that robbing the church was a most terrible offence. He brought this point home especially by stressing how the saints accused the robbers before God, who then allowed pagans and other disasters to befall the realm unchecked:

> Therefore, abstain from all robbery, so that you might possess the kingdom of God and know that all of the saints whose people and villages you rob daily

[255] On the clamor of the poor, see note 14 above.

[256] Abbo, *Sermo* ⌈11⌋ *adversus raptores qui bona pauperum hominum diripiunt*, cc. 7-12, ed. Önnerfors, 114-116. See also the references in note 26.

> accuse you before God day and night; and on account of these evils that you do and you consent for your men to do against the saints of God, God does not help you regarding the pagans and pestilences that come in the kingdom nor does he give you victory, so that you can defeat the enemies of God's holy church in battle. For just as wise Solomon says: 'Justice exalts the realm and sin which is wickedness lays it low into ruin and into Hell' [cf. Prov 14:34]. From which great danger to souls may the Savior constantly bestow on you to avoid and always do good, so that you can obtain God's grace forever and ever, amen.[257]

Here King Carloman's message that robbery leads to defeat in battle against the pagans and eternal damnation is greatly augmented by the fact that the saints—the holy guardians of the faithful—were working actively against the soldiers. Indeed, this passage calls to mind the scenes in Abbo's epic, when the Parisians prayed to Saint Germain with great lamentations to protect them from the Northmen's overwhelming attacks. Since the writing of his epic, Bishop Radbod of Utrecht had reported a similar series of events happening at Tours not long after 900, when Saint Martin

[257] Abbo's *Sermo* [11] *adversus raptores qui bona pauperum hominum diripiunt*, cc. 13-14, ed. Önnerfors, 116-117: "[13] Ergo abstinete vos ab omni rapina, ut regnum Dei possitis habere et scitote, quod omnes sancti quorum homines et villas predatis cotidie vos accusant ante Dominum die ac nocte; et propter hec mala que vos facitis et consentitis vestris hominibus facere contra sanctos Dei non adiuvat vos Deus de paganis et de pestilentiis que veniunt in regno nec dat vobis victoriam, ut possitis expugnare sancte Dei eclesie inimicos. [14] Nam, sicut ait sapiens Salomon: Iusticia exaltat regnum et peccatum quod est iniquitas deprimit in ruinam et in infernum. A quo magno animarum periculo tribuat vobis salvator iugiter declinare et semper bene facere, quo possitis gratiam Dei obtinere per omnia secula seculorum, amen."

miraculously defeated the pagans attacking his city.[258] Clearly, Abbo's sermon warned that such holy assistance would not be forthcoming to such monstrous soldiers because of their crimes. Instead, saints such as Germain and Martin accused them before God, who refused to help them win their battles or to relieve them of pestilence. Abbo here also blamed both military commanders and their troops, writing that such evils happened "on account of these evils that you do and you consent for your men to do against the saints." Therefore, the sermon warned that the robbers' crimes were ruining and dividing the realm between God's servants and their oppressors, who included those expected to fight foreign enemies and their commanders. The result of their sinful efforts could only mean disaster for all.

Abbo addressed those who suffered at the robbers' hands in his third text—his *Sermon* ⌈14⌉ *On the Foundation and Growth of Christianity*—where he continued his focus on robbers as monsters persecuting the church.[259] In Sermon 14, Abbo additionally incorporated aspects of the worm theology discussed in Part Two in order to denounce these monsters and their role in cosmic history in the strongest terms. Abbo's purpose, therefore, in this last sermon was to condemn rather

[258] Radbod of Utrecht, *In translatione sancti Martini episcopi*, ed. Paul von Winterfeld, *PLAC* 4.1 (Berlin, 1899), 163-165, with the texts relevant to Martin and the Danes, 164-165; and *Metrum anapaesticum ypercatalectum de eodem miraculo*, ed. Paul von Winterfeld, *PLAC* 4.1 (Berlin, 1899), 165-165b.

[259] Abbo, *Sermo* ⌈14⌉ *De fundamento et incremento Christianitatis*, ed. Önnerfors, 133-146. On this sermon, see Önnerfors, *Abbo von Saint-Germain*, 266-286; and Nagy, "La notion de Christianitas," 1-15. While Saint-Germain's lands were often ravaged by the Northmen, the monastery seems to have benefited from royal patronage rather than suffered only from robbery and appropriation; see "XLI. Compiègne, 14 mars 918," ed. René Poupardin, *Recueil des chartes de l'abbaye de Saint-Germain-des-Prés des origines au début du xiiiᵉ siècle*, vol. 1 (Paris, 1909), 68-70; Bouillart, *Histoire*, 64; and the references to Koziol's studies (cited in note 228 above) on the complicated political relations between King Charles the Simple and Saint-Germain's lay abbot, Robert.

than to convert. Such an approach enabled him to frame the faithful and especially clerics and monks as the suffering, sacred city of God—the victims of Christianity's wicked enemies, including both pagans and robbing pseudo-Christians. In this fashion, Abbo cast these perpetrators and victims respectively as participants in the long history of Christianity's war against sin and evil. Abbo's text consists of two parts, which work together to reveal the historical and unearthly aspects of Christians as victims. The first characterizes Christianity's foundation with Christ's suffering and its growth through the apostles' martyrdom, while the second section details how Christianity was threatened by plunderers in the time of the Viking attacks.[260]

Let us begin with the first part. In his opening, Abbo called upon his hearers to contemplate how "holy Christianity" (*sancta christianitas*)—the "sacred religion" (*sacra religio*) and the "city of God" (*civitas Dei*)—was built with a greater labor than any kingdom or city; in this process, it "gloriously conquered and threw right down into the dust superstition and heathenism's death-bearing idolatry" though it did so with "vexation unspeakable to relate" and "which daily our depraved life destroys."[261] The creation of the city of God, therefore, was that of a realm won through conquest, which nevertheless remained under constant threat.[262] Its holy success meant the downfall of the lethal forces of superstition, heathenism, and idolatry. Christ's suffering, Abbo wrote, was the grim foundation of the church's future victories:

[260] Nagy, "La notion de Christianitas," 4.

[261] Abbo, *Sermo* ⌈14⌉ *De fundamento et incremento Christianitatis*, cc. 1-2, ed. Önnerfors, 133, including the quoted passages: "nostra cotidie prava destruit vita… cum molestia dictu ineffabili, omnem utique supersticionem et mortiferam gentilitatis idololatriam gloriose vicit et ad pulverem usque prostravit."

[262] Nagy, "La notion," 4-7 discusses Abbo's characterization of the church.

> Oh how great was the labor of building Christianity! Notice, you God-worshippers, how our Lord in death's indescribable torment established the church of Christianity, which those hating justice evilly demolish. And for the sake of founding it, but also strengthening it through the different regions of the world, the benign Jesus underwent the Devil's temptations, the reproaches of human beings, spit, the crown of thorns, at last the truly terrible death of the cross, nails dreadfully in his gentle hands and feet, and at the same time the holy Christ bore the lance in his holy side.[263]

Here the allusions to contemporary unjust forces reminded the audience that they remained a danger despite Christ's sacrifice. If the Christian church was a spiritual empire built through just conquest, then "those hating justice" sought its destruction even in the present. Furthermore, Abbo detailed the horrors of Christ's humiliation and death to emphasize that it was through such suffering that sacred Christianity was founded. In this fashion, Abbo's interpretation of that religion as the city of God thus laid the historical groundwork for distinguishing its members—like their founder—throughout time and beyond as the victims of their enemies' cruelty and injustice.

Abbo continued on this trajectory when he discussed the Apostles' martyrdom. He stressed the evil qualities of their

[263] Abbo, *Sermo* ⌈14⌉ *De fundamento et incremento Christianitatis*, cc. 4-5, ed. Önnerfors, 133-134: "O quantus labor edificande christianitatis! Animadvertite vos, deicole, quam inenarrabili tormento mortis stabilivit noster Dominus eclesiam christianitatis, quam exosi iusticiam male dissipant. ⌈5⌉ Ac pro ea fundanda sed et stabilienda per diversa mundi clymata sustinuit benignus Ihesus zabuli temptamenta, hominum obprobria, sputa, spineam coronam, tandem vero terribilem crucis necem inque manibus ac pedibus clavos formidolose molis simulque sanctus in sancto Christus latere ultro lanceam suscepit."

persecutors, while casting the spread of Christianity as a war against blasphemous forces immune to its transformative, healing powers. First, however, he reminded his listeners again that evil enemies remained a danger in the present. For Christ had established a stable Christianity, he said, "which judges of iniquity ceaselessly overturn with blind cupidity;" this was despite the fact that Christ had handed over his healing body to the sepulcher in order to bury humanity's every sacrilegious desire with him where it should remain forever silent.[264] The vague accusations of greed, iniquity and sacrilege were directed at contemporary villains rather than the Apostles' persecutors, enabling the audience to link their current troubles with the church's early history. Abbo then said the Apostles' martyrdom was undertaken in emulation of Christ's as part of the spiritual wars involved in Christianity's spread.[265] Christ sent the apostles out to be sheep "against the wolves," investing them "with the arms of Christianity" in order that they could "mightily fight its battles;" he recounted the sufferings of the Apostles, who spread Christianity with great "labor" and so many "tribulations" "in spite of the princes of the world, who are called wolves and are Hell's firebrands."[266] Thus did they

[264] Abbo, *Sermo* ⌈14⌉ *De fundamento et incremento Christianitatis*, c. 11, ed. Önnerfors, 135: "quam judices iniquitatis caeca cupidine incessanter evertunt. Christus Deus idcirco suum corpus salutiferum sepulture tradidit, quo omnis sacrilega cupiditas in eternum sepulta iaceret sicque muta iugiter quiesceret." On the Carolingian tradition concerning unjust judges, see Miriam Czock, "Rechtsformung vor eschatologischen Hintergrund: Das gerechte Urteil in der *Collectio Canonum Hinbernensis*," *Zeitschrift der Savigny-Stiftung für Rechtsgeschichte, Kanonistische Abteilung* 99 (2013), 347-360; and Gillis, *Heresy and Dissent in the Carolingian Empire*, 70-74.

[265] Abbo, *Sermo* ⌈14⌉ *De fundamento et incremento Christianitatis*, c. 10, ed. Önnerfors, 135.

[266] Abbo, *Sermo* ⌈14⌉ *De fundamento et incremento Christianitatis*, cc. 12-13, ed. Önnerfors, 135-136: "⌈12⌉ Caeterum omnipotens vita Christus a mortuis resurrexit, apostolos firmavit, in vastum orbem contra lupos ut oves destinavit. Illos quoque primos armis vere christianitatis vestivit suaque

endure crucifixion, beheading, stoning, and being pierced through with lances in order to build the "city of God." [267]

Scholars of late antiquity have revealed how early Christian authors developed a new subjectivity for their readers based on positive notions of suffering, while simultaneously amplifying the horrors of martyrdom after the period of persecution in order to protect the institutional church. [268] As noted previously, these ideas flourished in the ninth century, when elaborate martyrologies were developed—including the one already mentioned by Abbo's predecessor, Usuard from Saint-Germain—to help believers meditate daily on the gory history of the persecuted church. [269] Abbo's own description of the soldiers martyred in Paris by the Northmen in his epic followed this tradition. Working in this vein, Abbo stressed here how the Apostles were uncannily heroic victims, sheep, who defeated wolfish persecutors by being slaughtered at their hands following Christ's example. Likewise, he emphasized the spiritual identity of both sides, the citizens of God against Hell's firebrands. This particular term—*titiones inferni*—seems to be Abbo's invention, though it calls to mind Gospel passages about the wicked as dried kindling or trees cut down for the fire; likewise, in his commentary on Matthew's Gospel, Paschasius Radbertus described evil people as those whose crimes made them like "firebrands prepared from burning for

prelia, quo fortiter pugnarent, cum benedictione precepit. [13] Ita perpendite, fratres, quanto labore quantisque tribulationibus propagaverunt apostoli, id est arbores paradysi et columnae, christianitatem celi et regnum celorum in terris et sedem Dei edificaverunt, invitis principibus orbis qui appellantur lupi et sunt titiones inferni."

[267] Abbo, *Sermo* [14] *De fundamento et incremento Christianitatis*, cc. 13-24, ed. Önnerfors, 135-139.

[268] Perkins, *The Suffering Self*, 4-14; and Moss, *The Myth of Persecution*, including 206-207 on the desire for vengeance, and 215-246 on the creation of the notion of the persecuted church, which was a post-Constantine invention.

[269] See the references in note 178.

destruction." [270] Abbo linked his characterization of these ancient, historical villains with their future judgment and eternal punishment by calling them Hell's firebrands. Doing so would then provide a framework for his discussion of the present-day city of God's victimization at the hands of robbers.

Abbo then took up the task of condemning church plunderers, which formed the second half of his sermon. As we have seen, the Council of Quierzy (857) cast such criminals as guilty of sacrilege (*sacrilegium*) and murder (*homicidium*), which became the common understanding of the crime.[271] Abbo began this part of his sermon by lamenting the contrast between the "pious kings and their religious nobles," who in the time of the confessors endowed churches and monasteries, and the present day "princes of the world" and their numerous agents who everyday "dissipate" (*dissipare*) the Christian religion by stealing "with perverse cunning" the goods which supported the lives of bishops, monks and canons.[272] Such "usurpers of the church" robbed and defrauded episcopal sees and monasteries by violence and with "diverse deceptions and frauds," including "deceitful entreaties" and "unjust precarial grants," thereafter illicitly transferring "Christ's property" to themselves as

[270] Paschasius Radbertus, *Expositio in Matheo*, X, lines 1374-1380, ed. Bedae Paulus, *CCCM* 56B (Turnhout, 1984), 1117-1118, with the quotation on lines 1376-1378, 1118: "Quod et adhuc hodie isti faciunt qui remanserunt ac si titiones ex incendio parati ad interitum." See also Mt 3:10 "iam enim securis ad radicem arborum posita est/ omnis ergo arbor quae non facit fructum bonum exciditur et in ignem mittitur;" Mt 7:19: "omnis arbor quae non facit fructum bonum exciditur et in ignem mittitur;" Lc 3:9: "iam enim securis ad radicem arborum posita est/ omnis ergo arbor non faciens fructum exciditur et in ignem mittitur;" and Jo 15:6: "si quis in me non manserit mittetur foras sictu palmes et aruit/ et colligent eos et in ignem mittunt et ardent." On Abbo's term, see Önnerfors, *Abbo von Saint-Germain*, 270-271.

[271] See note 26 above.

[272] Abbo, *Sermo* [14] *De fundamento et incremento Christianitatis*, cc. 25-28, ed. Önnerfors, 139-140; and Amos, *The Origin and Nature*, 331.

"sacrilegious possessors."[273] As he had indicated earlier, sacrilegious desires were supposed to be buried with Christ in the sepulcher and remain there, thus revealing that the evil princes of the world were not true Christians. Instead, these robbers—now including not just soldiers and their commanders but even rulers—seized Christ's property as destroyers of the Christian religion. They thereby rejected the church's healing powers which originated in Christ's tomb and transformed Christians in the past and present for the future judgment.

Abbo next addressed the second aspect of church robbery: murder. He did so by associating robbers with the villains of antiquity, stressing their horrible punishment in the afterlife:

> Therefore, what else are such sacrilegious plunderers, violent robbers except the firebrands of Hell and the food of the Devil, and expropriators of paradise, which is the church of Christ? Truly the devils eat no other food in Hell except the souls of those who laying waste and unjustly possessing [it] devour the property of God's churches. Certainly, at every hour after the end of this present life demons devour and will devour their souls in eternity. Woe to you plunderers, pillagers of churches and their poor! Indeed, every day the poor come to the tombs of the saints crying out that they are killed by plunderers from hunger and nakedness. But what

[273] Abbo, *Sermo* [14] *De fundamento et incremento Christianitatis*, c. 29, ed. Önnerfors, 140: "[29] Diversis plane dolis et fraudibus predicti invasores ecclesiae destruunt presidia christianitatis, hoc est sedes episcopales et monasteria, predis scilicet, rapinis, precariis falsidicis, manufirmitatibus iniquis habentes enim eas, inscriptum contemnunt reddere censum. Sic autem res Christi transferunt sibi in predium et alodium possessores sacrilegi. Interdum vero violenter easdem res ecclesiae diripiunt sibique illicite possident." See also Nagy, "La notion," 7 on Abbo's description of the church's destruction.

> will it be for those doing such evils to the churches and their ministers and their servants? True and perpetual punishment.[274]

Here Abbo highlighted the saints as the robbers' enemies as he had previously done in Sermon 11. Eerily, he also presented the robbers as *already* condemned, like Christianity's ancient enemies, Hell's firebrands who harmed the church. Here their punishment reflected the worm theologies discussed above, very much echoing the sentiments of the hymn *Dominus, caeli rex et conditor* and theologians such as Haimo of Auxerre. Abbo himself described the wicked's fate in another sermon in these terms: "Then evil human beings will receive Hell's eternal punishments, where the fire is never extinguished and there are those worms, which devour the souls of the impious and will never die."[275] Accordingly, the robbers' punishment would be a fitting inversion of their crimes—their souls would be devoured by demons, since they had devoured the church's resources, killing the poor including, of course, the saints' ministers and servants, who lamented their suffering at their holy tombs. In this way, Abbo connected the church's current persecutors with

[274] Abbo, *Sermo* ⌈14⌉ *De fundamento et incremento Christianitatis*, cc. 30-32, ed. Önnerfors, 140: "⌈30⌉ Quam ob rem multa iam scimus et videmus monasteria a clericis derelicta propter res quippe unde vivere deberent illis ablatas. Ergo quidnam sunt aliud tales sacrilegi predones violenti raptores nisi titiones inferni et escae d⌈i⌉aboli et explantatores paradysi qui est ecclesia Christi? ⌈31⌉ Prorsus nullum alium comedunt cibum diaboli in inferno nisi animas eorum qui res ecclesiarum Dei devorant depopulantes vel injuste possidentes. Certe eorum animas omnibus horis post terminum presentis vitae devorant demones et devorabunt in eternum. Ve vobis predones, raptores ecclesiarum et pauperum earum! ⌈32⌉ Revera cotidie veniunt illi pauperes ad tumulos sanctorum clamantes se occidi a predonibus fame et nuditate. Sed quid erit illis talia facientibus mala eclesiis earumque ministris atque vernaculis? Vera et perpetua pena."

[275] Abbo, *Sermo* ⌈3⌉ *Dominica in septuagesima, evangelium secundum Matheum*, 19, ed. Önnerfors, 82-83: "Tunc accipient mali homines eternas penas inferni, ubi est focus qui non extinguetur umquam et ibi sunt illi vermes qui devorant animas impiorum et non morientur umquam."

its ancient enemies, as well as the clerics and monks with their saintly predecessors. He then announced to his listeners that they would receive eternal glory, if they endured such adversities "patiently," adding: "Therefore, brothers, who are true Christians, do not fear the pseudo-Christians grievously oppressing you every day."[276] Indeed, he continued, the church as the city of God and the bride of the Lamb, "fearing God" rather than their enemies, must desire celestial and spiritual things instead of "vile" transitory ones in order to rejoice at inheriting God's kingdom.[277]

Abbo then revealed how such pseudo-Christians were worse than the pagans in their attempts to destroy Christianity. He wrote: "Truly this city of God the unjust and sacrilegious lovers of this world struggle everyday utterly to destroy by pillaging and afflicting [it] with every scourge. Who then are these ravening wolves who persecuting without cessation devour and tear the clothes away from Christianity?"[278] He declared that the pseudo-Christians were more wicked than all of ancient Israel's pagan oppressors, as well the Northmen, Danes and the "most impious nation of Hungarians."[279] "And crueler than all of these peoples are ours," Abbo continued, "who under the false name of Christians do not cease at every hour to kill the people

[276] Abbo, *Sermo* [14] *De fundamento et incremento Christianitatis*, cc. 32-33, ed. Önnerfors, 140-141, with the quotation on 141: "Ergo, fratres, qui veri estis christiani, nolite pseudochristianos timere graviter vos cotidie opprimentes."

[277] Abbo, *Sermo* [14] *De fundamento et incremento Christianitatis*, cc. 34-48, ed. Önnerfors, 141-144.

[278] Abbo, *Sermo* [14] *De fundamento et incremento Christianitatis*, c. 49, ed. Önnerfors, 145: "[49] Istam profecto civitatem Dei cotidie certant penitus destruere huius seculi amatores iniusti et sacrilegi predando omnibusque flagellis affligendo. Quidnam sunt isti rapaces lupi qui sine cessatione persequentes devorant et depannant christianitatem?"

[279] Abbo, *Sermo* [14] *De fundamento et incremento Christianitatis*, c. 50, ed. Önnerfors, 145: "et impiissima Tungrorum natio." See also Amos, *The Origin and Nature*, 338-339.

of Christ with hunger and cold, meaning by eating up their food and drinking away the clothing of the poor." [280] Such persecutors were friends of the world rather than of God, even loving their horses and dogs more than the poor redeemed by Christ's blood.[281] "Clearly," Abbo continued, "the pillagers and rapacious ones destroy Christianity of their own free will and forsake disdainfully to inhabit the city of the divine emperor. And therefore they become less citizens and dwellers in God's house, than the Devil's and Hell's firebrands."[282]

Here Abbo clarified that the robbers—Christianity's false members—were intentionally rejecting their salvation and preparing themselves for a harsh divine judgment. They were reprobates-in-the-making, who strangely appeared *already* damned for killing Christians. He then appealed to his listeners with great passion, linking their suffering with their understanding of themselves:

> Therefore, oh church of God, oh city of God, patiently bear these wolves devouring you as lambs of Christ. Indeed, this evil which our adversaries deem to do to you, much more do they heap upon themselves. For no one can harm another ⌈without⌋ first himself. Regarding these wolves, the Lord so suffering with us said through the prophet: 'All who operate iniquity in this way devour my people like

[280] Abbo, *Sermo* ⌈14⌋ *De fundamento et incremento Christianitatis*, c. 50, ed. Önnerfors, 145: "Necnon crudeliores his omnibus gentibus nostri qui sunt falso nomine christiani non cessant omnibus horis plebem Christi occidere fame et frigore scilicet manducando escas et bibendo vestes pauperum."

[281] Abbo, *Sermo* ⌈14⌋ *De fundamento et incremento Christianitatis*, c. 51, ed. Önnerfors, 145.

[282] Abbo, *Sermo* ⌈14⌋. *De fundamento et incremento Christianitatis*, c. 51, ed. Önnerfors, 145: "Huiusmodi plane predones et rapaces propria sponte destruunt christianitatem et deserunt contempnentes habitare divini imperatoris civitatem. Et propterea minus fiunt cives et domestici Dei sed diaboli et titiones inferni."

> bread' ⌈Ps 52:5⌉. Whence our same shepherd Christ Lord comforts us with benign consolation saying: 'Do not fear my tiny flock, because it pleased our Father to give you the kingdom' ⌈Lc 12:32⌉.[283]

In this passage, Abbo unmistakably coupled his audience's suffering and death by wolfish enemies with their inheritance in eternity. In contrast to their foes, they were wondrously the elect-in-the-making, being spiritually prepared in the world as victims to receive divine reward in the future judgment and enjoy it thereafter in eternity. Therefore, as Miriam Czock argued, time and eternity were mystically entwined.[284] To make this division between the elect and the reprobate both historically and beyond time, Abbo stressed as he had in his other sermons that the robbers' crimes were spiritually so horrific that they amounted to eating human flesh. Such offences sealed the robber's infernal fate, while bringing forth Christ's untimely message that God will grant his suffering flock the kingdom. The robbers had no hope of being corrected

[283] Abbo, *Sermo* ⌈14⌉ *De fundamento et incremento Christianitatis*, c. 52-53, ed. Önnerfors, 146: "⌈52⌉ Itaque, o eclesia Dei, o civitas Dei, pacienter hos fer lupos devorantes vos Christi agnos. Siquidem hoc malum quod vobis estimant nostri facere adversarii, multo magis sibi illud ingerunt. Nemo enim alteri prius quam sibi nocere potest. De quibus lupis conpatiens vobis sic inquid Dominus per prophetam: 'Omnes qui operantur iniquitatem sic devorant plebem ut cybum panis.' ⌈53⌉ Vnde et pius idem pastor noster Christus Dominus benigna consolatione nos confortat dicens: 'Noli metuere pusillus grex quia complacuit Patri nostro dare vobis regnum.'" For a possible patristic influence on this part of Abbo's sermon, see Hilary of Poitiers, *Tractatus super psalmos*, ps. 52, par. 13-15, ed. Jean Doignon, *CCSL* 61 (Turnhout, 1997), 120-123.

[284] Miriam Czock, "Creating Futures through the Lens of Revelation in the Rhetoric of the Carolingian Reform, ca. 750 to ca. 900," in *Apocalypse and Reform from Late Antiquity to the Middle Ages*, ed. Matthew Gabriele and James Palmer (New York, 2019), 101-119; and ead., "Arguing for Improvement: The Last Judgment, Time and the Future in Dhuoda's *Liber manualis*," in *Cultures of Eschatology*, ed. Veronika Wieser, Vincent Eltschinger, and Johann Heiss (Oldenbourg, 2020), 509-527.

and saved—their fate was set. By assuming the role of persecutors, their crimes insured the city of God's salvation through its patience.

Abbo finished his sermon by urging his listeners to endure their enemies, and with Christ's help to honor and adorn with pious morals the city of God, "which is in us."[285] In this way, Abbo's audience understood that being willing, suffering victims established the city of God in them now in the present, at the last judgment and in eternity.[286] As such, they were both historical and beyond time, sacred and untimely. Enduring their enemies' violence thus framed their subjectivity as Christ's worshippers and venerators of the martyrs. Abbo's sermon also revealed that uncannily his sacrilegious, persecuting enemies—whose own historical and untimely character paralleled that of his audience—made possible the process of becoming the city of God. The spiritual consolation coming from these revelations could offer also a sense of satisfaction that the divinely-sanctioned order rendered a fitting punishment for their persecutors, who raged as monsters in time and would suffer monstrously in eternity.[287]

Abbo's sermon collection offered a series of strikingly different approaches to the problem of robbing soldiers and the Northmen's attacks. Drawing from the various strands of spiritualized thinking about soldiers, he repeatedly condemned their monstrous crimes as tantamount to devouring fellow Christians. Such sins led only to perdition. Yet Abbo also encouraged soldiers in one text to convert back to Christ so they might become his heroic fighters, charging into battle to terrify and slaughter Satan's minions. In waging God's war against the pagans, they would either triumph or die gloriously

[285] Abbo, *Sermo* [14] *De fundamento et incremento Christianitatis*, c. 53-54, ed. Önnerfors, 146: "…civitatem Dei que est in nobis…"

[286] For analysis of a similar example from the 840s, see Gillis, "Pleasures of Horror."

[287] Nagy, "La notion," 7-8 discusses Abbo's theology of consolation.

as martyrs. In another sermon, Abbo adapted King Carloman's prologue to reveal the utter horror of their crimes. As abject perversions, they were equally as evil as the Northmen whom they could not defeat. The saints complained about their offenses against the church to God, who denied them any aid. Their only hope was to accept correction and abandon their sins. In this fashion, Abbo sought to inspire or reform fallen soldiers and their commanders in different contexts. Yet he also addressed their victims, praising them for their patience as the elect-in-the-making who constituted the city of God, while condemning their oppressors as Hell's firebrands, irredeemable reprobates-in-the-making. Such soldiers, nobles and rulers were pseudo-Christians, whose activities placed them squarely within the forces of evil who sought to destroy the church. Furthermore, the uncanny logic of sin meant not only that these evil persecutors lost their battles against the pagans, but also that as devourers of God's servants they would appropriately be devoured alive by Gehenna's worms and demons for all eternity. Nevertheless, enduring their wickedness patiently insured the salvation of their victims within the church. Collectively, these sermons provided western Francia's clergy with ways of unveiling how in the church's ongoing cosmic war against evil some of its most dangerous foes were Christians.

As a form of religious reflection and theological expression, Abbo's reinterpretation of King Carloman's monstrous robbers ultimately articulated two sets of thoughts and emotions: first, the hope that the sinful predators could be corrected and transformed into heroes; second, the anger and resentment directed at their crimes and military failings, which made robbers more than anyone blameworthy for the realm's disasters. That Abbo developed his monster theology at the behest of the bishops of Poitiers and Paris suggests that church authorities sought increasingly more powerful spiritual weapons to employ against predatory nobles and soldiers

during the turbulent 920s. While particular to its time and place, this arsenal formed part of a long-standing tradition of moralist authors writing against Christians who preyed on their fellow Christians, such as Gildas the Wise,[288] Gregory of Tours and various seventh-century hagiographers, [289] numerous Carolingian reformers and moralists,[290] the Peace of God movement,[291] and Wulfstan of York, who also wrote about the problems of sin in the time of Danish attacks and invasions.[292] The evidence examined in this study suggests that medieval rhetoric of correction and condemnation might generally be regarded as a form of spiritual warfare that authorities waged against Christians, whose sins and crimes

[288] Gildas, *De excidio Britonum*, ed. Michael Winterbottom (London, 1978), 87-142, which is drawn from the critical edition by Gildas, *De excidio Britonum*, ed. Theodor Mommsen, *MGH SS AA* 13 (Berlin, 1898), 25-88; and Nicholas Higham, *The English Conquest: Gildas and Britain in the Fifth Century* (Manchester, 1994). Gildas, *De excidio*, c. 31, ed. Winterbottom, 101 does describe Hell to villainous soldiers in the following terms that resonate with Abbo's sermon: "Aliquin vermis tortionis tuae non morietur et ignis ustionis tuae non extinguetur."

[289] Gregory, *Libri Decem Historiarum*, esp. praef. prima and V, praef., ed. Krusch and Levison, 1 and 193-194, where he includes a citation to Gal 5:15; Martin Heinzelmann, *Gregory of Tours: History and Society in the Sixth Century*, trans. Christopher Carroll (Cambridge, 2001), 175-191; Fouracre, "Why Were so Many Bishops Killed," 13-35; Sarti, *Perceiving War*, 86-90; Helmut Reimitz, *History, Frankish Identity and the Framing of Western Ethnicity, 550-850* (Cambridge, 2015), 65-73; and Dobschenzki, *Von Opfern und Tätern*, 94-134 regarding murderers in seventh-century Merovingian sources.

[290] See, for example, Dutton, *The Politics of Dreaming*, 81-156; de Jong, *The Penitential State*, 112-147; Romig, *Be a Perfect Man*, 98-131; and de Jong, *Epitaph for an Era*.

[291] On the Peace of God, see Koziol, *The Peace of God*, 43-81, and the essays in *The Peace of God: Social Violence and Religious Response in France around the Year 1000*, ed. Thomas Head and Richard Landes (Ithaca, 1992).

[292] Wulfstan of York, *Sermo ad Anglos*, in *The Homilies of Wulfstan*, ed. Dorothy Bethurum (Oxford, 1957), 255-260; and Joyce Tally Lionarons, *The Homiletic Writings of Archbishop Wulfstan* (Woodbridge, 2010), 147-171.

endangered the church. The horror rhetoric of the late ninth and early tenth century stands out as fascinating development in this tradition. As in the case of other moments of reform, we cannot know for certain how the accused responded to the warnings and judgments levied against them. Yet one can reasonably imagine that such arresting words must have left even those, who rejected being characterized as the church's monstrous enemies, wrestling with the fact that authorities possessing the power to curse and condemn them disagreed.

It is not difficult to see that Abbo's ideas about God's war shared some commonalities with later Christian notions of holy war, when Pope Urban II and others called for vengeance against the wrongs done to Jerusalem, offering soldiers both the foes' plunder and the remission of their sins as rewards.[293] In his epic, Abbo heroized Christian warfare, revealing how Christ's champions overcame their fear of death amid battle's terrors before slaughtering their foes. Furthermore, he celebrated the martyrdom of those heroes butchered as the Northmen's defenseless prisoners, articulating a new vision of warfare against non-Christians in Francia at the end of the ninth century. His war sermon from the 920s then focused on the issues facing Frankish authorities in the early tenth century. These included: the monstrous soldiers' sins that caused the disasters at home, the need to correct and convert these military men so that they might be victorious in battle, and the possibility of commemorating all fallen soldiers as martyrs. Such ideas constituted part of the church's ongoing struggle against sin and evil in which concepts could lay dormant for a time only to resurface subsequently in altered form. So while tenth-century monastic audiences familiar with Odo of Cluny's life of the non-violent layman, Gerald of Aurillac, identified a strong divide separating worldly elites

[293] Rubenstein, *Armies of Heaven*, esp. 17-32; Madden, *The Concise History of the Crusades*, 1-34; and Frankopan, *The First Crusade*, 1-12 on preaching the Crusade.

from the cloister's pious life, some military-type martyrs were also memorialized between Abbo's day and Urban II's.[294] These included Abbo of Fleury's Saint Edmund, an East Anglian king slain in 869 by Danish arrows while he was tied to a tree, and Dudo of Saint-Quentin's William Longsword, who ironically was a baptized Norman leader killed by Frankish enemies in an ambush in 942.[295] Therefore, it seems reasonable to wonder whether Odo of Châtillon (the future Urban II)—who served as canon and archdeacon in Rheims after being educated there—was not echoing, however distantly, Abbo's message about soldier martyrdom and God's war, when he delivered his call to arms for Jerusalem in 1095.[296]

[294] Romig, *Be a Perfect Man*, 144-154; and Matthew Kuefler, *The Making and Unmaking of a Saint: Hagiography and Memory in the Cult of Gerald of Aurillac* (Philadelphia, 2014), 44-67.

[295] Regarding Saint Edmund, see Abbo of Fleury, *Vita Edmundi*, in *Three Lives of English Saints*, ed. Michael Winterbottom (Toronto, 1972), 67-87; Susan Ridyard, *The Royal Saints of Anglo-Saxon England* (Cambridge, 1988), 61-73 and 211-233; and Noth, *Heiliger Krieg*, 99-103. On William, see Dudo of Saint-Quentin, *De moribus et actis primorum Normanniae ducum*, III, 62-64, ed. Jules Lair (Caen, 1865), 206-209; Pierre Bouet, "Dudon de Saint-Quentin et le martyre de Guillaume Longue-Epée," in *Les saints dans la Normandie médiévale*, ed. Pierre Bouet and François Neveux (Caen, 2000), 237-258; and Mark Hagger, *Norman Rule in Normandy, 911-1144* (Woodbridge, 2017), 199.

[296] Alfons Becker, *Papst Urban II. (1088-1099)*, 3 vols. (Stuttgart, 1964-2012), here vol. I, 24-41.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I owe many thanks to Teodora Artimon for kindly encouraging me to begin this book series and to publish this volume as a way of getting it off the ground. Both have proved exciting undertakings. My gratitude also goes to the University of Tennessee's History Department, the Humanities Center, and the Office of Research, Innovation and Economic Development for a subvention to cover this book's Open Access fees. Researching and writing about horror has been uncannily rewarding, and an experience greatly enhanced by my interactions with generous and exceptional colleagues. I am deeply grateful to the advice and suggestions from the anonymous readers, Monica Black, Eric Goldberg, Andy Romig, and the late Miriam Czock, who all commented on the manuscript over the course of its development. Their insights and recommendations richly improved this study. Furthermore, many others shared their valuable ideas with me over the years, including: Stuart Airlie, Noah Blan, Richie Corradini, Courtney Booker, Scott Bruce, Cullen Chandler, Celia Chazelle, Lynda Coon, Jenny Davis, Mayke de Jong, Albrecht Diem, Max Diesenberger, Paul Edward Dutton, Stefan Esders, Robert Evans, Abigail Firey, Ernie Freeberg, Matt Gabriele, Val Garver, Luke Harlow, Gregor Kalas, Katie Kleinkopf, Geoffrey Koziol, Rutger Kramer, Maura Lafferty, Anne Latowsky, Conrad Leyser, Michael Moore, James Palmer, Brad Phillis, Martha Rampton, Helmut Reimitz, Jay Rubenstein, Laury Sarti, Josh Timmermann, and Charles West. I am also thankful to my undergraduate and graduate students,

with whom I have discussed many of these issues in the classroom. Those conversations helped to grow this project. Finally, this book is dedicated to my magnificent partner, Monica Black, who accompanied me upon these strange, Dark Age pathways.

ABBREVIATIONS

CCCM	*Corpus Christianorum, Continuatio Mediaevalis*
CCSL	*Corpus Christianorum, Series Latina*
CSEL	*Corpus Scriptorum Ecclesiasticorum Latinorum*
MGH	*Monumenta Germaniae Historica*
MGH Cap.	*Monumenta Germaniae Historica, Capitularia*
MGH Conc.	*Monumenta Germaniae Historica, Concilia*
MGH Ep.	*Monumenta Germaniae Historica, Epistolae*
MGH SS	*Monumenta Germaniae Historica, Scriptores*
MGH SS AA	*Monumenta Germaniae Historica, Auctores Antiquissimi*
MGH SSM	*Monumenta Germaniae Historica, Scriptores rerum Merovingicarum*
PL	*Patrologia Latina*
PLAC	*Monumenta Germaniae Historica, Poetae Latini aevi Carolini*

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Manuscripts

Bibliothèque municipale de Valenciennes 150.

Bruxelles 5666.

Paris, BN, MS lat. 13833.

Primary Sources

Abbo of Fleury. *Vita Edmundi.* In *Three Lives of English Saints*, ed. Michael Winterbottom. Toronto, 1972, 67-87.

Abbo of Saint-Germain-des-Prés. *Bella parisiacae urbis*, ed. Paul von Winterfeld. *PLAC* IV, 1. Berlin, 1899 (for translations see Secondary Works), 72-122.

——. *Sermons.* In *Abbo von Saint-Germain-des-Prés 22 Predigten*, ed. Ute Önnerfors. Frankfurt am Main, 1985.

Ambrosius Autpertus. *Sermo de cupiditate*, ed. Robert Weber. *CCCM* 27B. Turnhout, 1979, 963-981.

Angelbert. *Rhythmi de pugna Fontanetica*, ed. Peter Godman. *Poetry of the Carolingian Renaissance.* Norman, 1985, 262-264.

Annales Bertiniani, ed. Félix Grat, Jeanne Vielliard and Suzanne Clémencet with introduction and notes by Léon Levillain. Paris, 1964.

Annales Fuldenses, ed. Friedrich Kurze. *MGH Scriptores rerum germanicarum in usum scholarum separatim editi* 7. Hannover, 1891.

Annales Vedastini, ed. Bernhard von Simson. *MGH scriptores rerum Germanicarum in usuam scholarum separatim editi* 12. Hannover, 1909.

Augustine. *Adnotationes in Iob*, ed. Joseph Zycha. *CSEL* 28. Vienna, 1895.

——. *Enarrationes in Psalmos*, ed. Eligius Dekkers and Johannes Fraipont. *CCSL* 39, 2nd ed. Turnhout, 1990.

Capitularia regum Francorum, ed. Alfred Boretius and Viktor Krause. *MGH Cap.* 1-2. Hannover, 1883-97.

Christian of Stavelot. *Expositio super librum generationis*, ed. Robert Huygens. *CCCM* 224. Turnhout, 2008.

Decretales pseudo-isidorianae et capitula Agilramni. ed. Paul Hinschius. Leipzig, 1863.

Dominus, caeli rex et conditor, ed. Paul von Winterfeld, "Rhythmen- und Sequenzenstudien. 1. Die lateinische Eualiensequenz und ihre Sippe." *Zeitschrift für deutsches Altertum und deutsche Literatur* 45 (1901): 133-149.

Dudo of Saint-Quentin. *De moribus et actis primorum Normanniae ducum*, ed. Jules Lair. Caen, 1865.

Epitaphium Heinrici, ed. Paul von Winterfeld. *PLAC* 4.1. München, 2000.

Epytaphium domni Gozlini epyscopi, ed. Paul von Winterfeld. *PLAC* 4.1. Berlin, 1899, 136-137.

Eusebius-Rufinus. *Historia Ecclesiastica*, ed. Theodor Mommsen (and Eduard Schwartz). In *Eusebius Werke*, vol. 2.1, *Die Kirchengeschichte: Die lateinische Übersetzung des Rufinus.* Leipzig, 1907.

Flodoard. *Historia Remensis ecclesiae*, ed. Martina Stratmann. *MGH SS* 36. Hannover, 1998.

Freculf of Lisieux. *Historiarum libri xii*, ed. Michael Allen. *CCCM* 169A. Turnhout, 2002.

Gildas. *De excidio Britonum*, ed. Theodor Mommsen. *MGH SS AA* 13. Berlin, 1898, 25-88.

——. *De excidio Britonum*, ed. Michael Winterbottom. London, 1978.

Gregory of Tours. *Libri Decem Historiarum*, ed. Bruno Krusch and Wilhelm Levison. *MGH SSM* 1.1 Hannover, 1951.

Gregory the Great. *Moralia in Iob*, ed. Marc Adriaen. *CCSL* 143. Turnhout, 1979.

Haimo of Auxerre. *Annotatio libri Isaiae prophetae*, ed. Roger Gryson. *CCCM* 135C. Turnhout, 2014.

Haimo of Saint-Germain-des-Prés. *De miraculis Sancti Germani. PL* 126: 1027-1050.

Hegesippi qui dicitur historiae libri V, ed. Vincentius Ussani. *CSEL* 66. Vienna, 1960.

Hilary of Poitiers. *Tractatus super psalmos*, ed. Jean Doignon. *CCSL* 61. Turnhout, 1997.

Hildegar of Meaux. *Vita Faronis episcopi Meldensis*, ed. Bruno Krusch. *MGH SRM* 5. Hannover, 1890, 184-203.

Hincmar of Rheims. *De cavendis vitiis et virtutibus exercendis*, ed. Doris Nachtmann. *MGH Quellen zur Geistesgeschichte des Mittelalters* 16. Munich, 1998.

Hrabanus Maurus. *De institutione clericorum*, ed. Detlev Zimpel. *Fontes Christiani* 61.1. Turnhout, 2006.

——. *In Mathaeum*, ed. Bengt Löfstedt. *CCCM* 174. Turnhout, 2000.

Jerome. *Commentarii in Epistolam Pauli Apostoli ad Galatas*, ed. Giacomo Raspanti. *CCSL* 77A. Turnhout, 2006.

——. *Commentarii in Esaiam*, ed. Marc Adriaen. *CCSL* 73. Turnhout, 1963.

Jonas of Orléans. *Instruction des laïcs*, ed. and trans. Odile Dubreucq. 2 vols., *Sources chrétiennes* 549-550. Paris, 2012.

Die Konzilien der karolingischen Teilreiche 843-859, ed. Wilfried Hartmann. *MGH Conc.* 3. Hanover, 1984.

Die Konzilien der karolingischen Teilreiche 875-911, ed. Wilfried Hartmann, Isolde Schröder and Gerhard Schmitz. *MGH Conc.* 5. Hannover, 2012.

Le Martyrologe d'Usuard: text et commentaire, ed. Jacques Dubois. Brussels, 1965.

Odo of Cluny. *Collationum libri tres. PL* 133: 517-638.

Paschasius Radbertus. *Expositio in Lamentationes*, ed. Bedae Paulus. *CCCM* 85. Turnhout, 1988.

——. *Expositio in Matheo*, ed. Bedae Paulus. *CCCM* 56B. Turnhout, 1984.

Paulinus of Aquileia. *Liber exhortationis ad Hericum comitem. PL* 99: 197-282.

——. *Versus*, ed. Dag Norberg. *L'œuvre poétique de Paulin d'Aquilée*. Stockholm, 1979.

Pope John VIII. *Epistola* 150, ed. Societas Aperiendis Fontibus. *MGH Ep.* 7. Berlin, 1928, 126-127.

Pope Leo IV. *Epistola* 28, ed. Societas Aperiendis Fontibus. *MGH Ep.* 5. Berlin, 1899, 601.

Radbod of Utrecht. *In translatione sancti Martini episcopi*, ed. Paul von Winterfeld. *PLAC* 4.1. Berlin, 1899, 163-165.

——. *Metrum anapaesticum ypercatalectum de eodem miraculo*, ed. Paul von Winterfeld. *PLAC* 4.1. Berlin, 1899, 165-165b.

Regino, *Chronicon*, ed. Friedrich Kurze. *MGH scriptores rerum germanicarum in usum scholarum separatim editi* 50. Hanover, 1890 (for the translation see Secondary Works).

Recueil des actes de Louis II le Bègue, Louis III et Carloman II: rois de France (877-884), ed. Félix Grat, Jacques de Font-Reaulx, Georges Tessier and Robert-Henri Bautier. Paris, 1978.

Respice de celo, ed. Karl Strecker. *PLAC* 4.2. Berlin, 1914, 583.

Richer, *Historiae*, ed. Hartmut Hoffmann. *MGH SS* 38. Hannover, 2000.

Sedulius Scottus, viii. *Ad Hartgarium episcopum*, ed. Ludwig Traube. *PLAC* 3. Berlin, 1896, 176-177.

——. lxvi. *De adventu Franconis episcopi*, ed. Ludwig Traube. *PLAC* 3. Berlin, 1896, 220.

Sigloard. *Planctus Fulconis archiepiscopi Remensis*, ed. Paul von Winterfeld. *PLAC* 4.1. Munich, 2000, 174-175.

Summa pia gratia. In Gunilla Iversen, "*Psallite regi nostro, psallite:* Singing 'Alleluia' in Ninth-Century Poetry." In *Sapientia et Eloquentia: Meaning and Function in Liturgical Poetry, Music,*

Drama, and Biblical Commentary in the Middle Ages, ed. Gunilla Iversen and Nicolas Bell. Turnhout, 2009, 9-58.

Translatio sancti Germani Parisiensis, ed. Charles de Smedt, Guilleme van Hooff and Joseph de Backer. *Analecta Bollandiana* 2 (1883): 69-98.

Translatio sancti Germani vetustissima, ed. Bruno Krusch. *MGH SRM* 7. Hannover, 1888, 422-428.

Virginis virginum cantica Mariae, ed. Paul von Winterfeld, "Rhythmen- und Sequenzenstudien. 1. Die lateinische Eualiensequenz und ihre Sippe." *Zeitschrift für deutsches Altertum und deutsche Literatur* 45 (1901): 133-149.

Walahfrid Strabo, *Visio Wettini*, ed. Ernst Dümmler. *PLAC* 2. Berlin, 1884, 301-333.

Wulfstan of York. *Sermo ad Anglos*. In *The Homilies of Wulfstan*, ed. Dorothy Bethurum. Oxford, 1957, 255-260.

Venantius Fortunatus. *Vita Germani*, ed. Bruno Krusch. *MGH SRM* 7. Hannover, 1888, 372-418.

Venantius Fortunatus. *Ad clerum Parisiacum, Carmina*, ed. Leo Friedrich. *MGH AA* 4.1. Berlin, 1881, 38-39.

Virgil. *Georgica*, ed. Gian Biagio Conte. Berlin, 2013.

Secondary Works

Abbo von Saint-Germain-des-Prés, Bella Parisiacae urbis. *Buch I: Lateinischer Text, deutsche Übersetzung und sprachliche Bemerkungen*, ed. and trans. Anton Pauels. Frankfurt am Main, 1984.

Adams, Anthony. *Heroic Slaughter and Versified Violence: A Reading of Sacrifice in Some Early English and Carolingian Poetry of War* (Dissertation, University of Toronto, 2008).

—— and A.G. Rigg, "A Verse Translation of Abbo of St. Germain's *Bella Parisiacae urbis*." *The Journal of Medieval Latin* 14 (2004), 1-68.

Amos, Thomas. *The Origin and Nature of the Carolingian Sermon*. Dissertation, Michigan State University, 1983.

Bachrach, Bernard. *Early Carolingian Warfare: Prelude to Empire*. Philadelphia, 2001.

Bachrach, David. *Religion and the Conduct of War, c. 300-c. 1215*. Woodbridge, 2003.

Bauduin, Pierre. *Le monde franc et les vikings, VIIIe-Xe siècle*. Paris, 2009.

Beal, Timothy. *Religion and its Monsters*. New York, 2002.

Becker, Alfons. *Papst Urban II. (1088-1099)*, 3 vols. Stuttgart, 1964-2012.

Berger, Roger, and Annette Brasseur. *Les séquences de sainte Eulalie*. Geneva, 2004.

Bildhauer, Bettina and Robert Mills (eds.). *The Monstrous Middle Ages*. Toronto, 2003.

Bischoff, Bernhard. *Katalog der festländischen Handshriften des neunten Jahrhunderts (mit Ausnahme der wisigotischen). Teil III: Padua-Zwickau*. Wiesbaden, 2014.

Blurton, Heather. *Cannibalism in High Medieval English Literature*. New York, 2007.

Bouet, Pierre. "Dudon de Saint-Quentin et le martyre de Guillaume Longue-Epée." In *Les saints dans la Normandie médiévale*, ed. Pierre Bouet and François Neveux. Caen, 2000, 237-258.

Bouillart, Jacques. *Histoire de l'abbaye royale de Saint Germain des Prez*. Paris, 1724.

Boyarin, Daniel. *Dying for God: Martyrdom and the Making of Christianity and Judaism*. Stanford, 1999.

Bradley, D.R. "The Glosses on *Bella Parisiacae Urbis* I and II." *Classica et mediaevalia* 28 (1967): 344-356.

Brasseur, Annette, see: Berger, Roger.

Brennan, Brian. "The Image of the Merovingian Bishop in the Poetry of Venantius Fortunatus." *Journal of Medieval History* 18 (1992): 115-127.

Brown, Peter. *The Cult of Saints: Its Rise and Function in Latin Christianity*, 2nd ed. Chicago, 2015.

Buc, Philippe. *Holy War, Martyrdom, and Terror: Christianity, Violence, and the West*. Philadelphia, 2015.

Bührer-Thierry, Geneviève. "Bishops as City Defenders in Early Medieval Gaul and Germany." In *Between Sword and Prayer: Warfare and Medieval Clergy in Cultural Perspective*, ed. Radosław Kotecki, Jacek Maciewski, and John Ott, 24-45. Leiden, 2018.

Carroll, Noël. *The Philosophy of Horror, or Paradoxes of the Heart*. New York, 1990.

Choy, Renie. *Intercessory Prayer and the Monastic Ideal in the Time of the Carolingian Reforms*. Oxford, 2017.

Cohen, Jeffrey Jerome (ed.). *Monstery Theory: Reading Culture*. Minneapolis, 1996.

——. *On Giants: Sex Monsters, and the Middle Ages*. Minneapolis, 1999.

Coupland, Simon. "The Rod of God's Wrath or the People of God's Wrath?" *The Journal of Ecclesiastical History* 42 (1991): 535-554.

——. "From Poachers to Gamekeepers: Scandinavian Warlords and Carolingian Kings." *Early Medieval Europe* 7 (1998): 85-114.

——. "Frankish Tribute Payments to the Vikings and their Consequences." *Francia* 26 (1999): 57-75.

——. "The Vikings on the Continent in Myth and History." *History* 88 (2003): 186-203.

——. "The Carolingian Army and the Struggle Against the Vikings." *Viator* 35 (2004): 49-70.

——. "Holy Ground? The Plundering and Burning of Churches by Vikings and Franks in the Ninth Century." *Viator* 45 (2014): 73-97.

Czock, Miriam. "Rechtsformung vor eschatologischen Hintergrund: Das gerechte Urteil in der *Collectio Canonum Hinbernensis*." *Zeitschrift der Savigny-Stiftung für Rechtsgeschichte, Kanonistische Abteilung* 99 (2013): 347-360.

——. "Creating Futures through the Lens of Revelation in the Rhetoric of the Carolingian Reform, ca. 750 to ca. 900." In *Apocalypse and Reform from Late Antiquity to the Middle Ages*, ed. Matthew Gabriele and James Palmer, 101-119. New York, 2019.

——. "Arguing for Improvement: The Last Judgment, Time and the Future in Dhuoda's *Liber manualis*." In *Cultures of Eschatology*, ed. Veronika Wieser, Vincent Eltschinger, and Johann Heiss, 509-527. Oldenbourg, 2020.

Dass, Nirmal. "Temporary Otherness and Homiletic History in the Late Carolingian Age: A Reading of the *Bella Parisiacae urbis* of Abbo of Saint-Germain-des-Prés." In *Difference and Identity in Francia and Medieval France*, ed. Meredith Cohen, 99-114. Farnham, UK, 2010.

Davidson, H.R. Ellis. *Gods and Myths of Northern Europe*. Harmondsworth, 1964.

de Jong, Mayke. *The Penitential State: Authority and Atonement in the Reign of the Louis the Pious*. Cambridge, 2009.

——. *Epitaph for an Era: Politics and Rhetoric in the Carolingian World*. Cambridge, 2019.

de Nie, Giselle. "History and Miracle: Gregory's Use of Metaphor." In *The World of Gregory of Tours*, ed. K. Mitchell and Ian Wood, 261-279. Leiden, 2002.

Devisse, Jean. *Hincmar archevêque de Reims, 845-882*, 3 vols. Geneva, 1975.

D'Haenens, Albert. *Les invasions normandes en Belgique au IXe siècle: Le phénomène et sa répercussion dans l'historiographie médiévale*. Louvain, 1967.

Diesenberger, Maximilian. *Predigt und Politik im frühmittelalterlichen Bayern: Karl der Große, Arn von Salzburg und die Salzburger Sermones-Sammlung*. Berlin, 2015.

——. "An Admonition Too Far? The Sermon *De cupiditate* by Ambrose Autpertus." In *Religious Franks: Religion and Power in the Frankish Kingdoms: Studies in Honour of Mayke de Jong*, ed. Rob Meens, Dorine van Espelo, Bram van den Hoven van

Genderen, Janneke Raaijmakers, Irene van Renswoude and Carine van Rhijn, 202-220. Manchester, 2016.

Dobschenzki, Jennifer Vanessa. *Von Opfern und Tätern: Gewalt im Spiegel der merowingischen Hagiographie des 7. Jahrhunderts.* Stuttgart, 2015.

Düchting, Reinhard. *Sedulius Scottus: Seine Dichtungen.* Munich, 1968.

Dumézil, Bruno, and Anne Wagner. "Saint Germain, évêque de Paris, un évêque chez les barbares?" In *Les Saints face aux barbares au haut Moyen Âge: Réalités et légendes*, ed. Edina Bozoky, 69-80. Rennes, 2017.

Dutton, Paul Edward. *The Politics of Dreaming in the Carolingian Empire.* Omaha, 1994

Ebenbauer, Alfred. *Carmen Historicum: Untersuchungen zur historischen Dichtung im karolingischen Europa.* Vienna, 1978.

Elmshäuser Konrad, and Andreas Hedwig. *Studien zum Polyptychon von Saint-Germain-des-Prés.* Cologne, 1993.

Erdmann, Carl. *Die Entstehung des Kreuzzugsgedankens.* Stuttgart, 1965.

Estèves, Aline. *Poétique de l'horreur dans l'épopée et l'historiographie latines.* Bordeaux, 2020.

Evans, Robert. "Frankish Leadership and the Viking Raids." M.A. Thesis, Cambridge, 2012.

Favre, Édouard. *Eudes. Comte de Paris et roi de france (882-898).* Paris, 1893.

Firey, Abigail. *A Contrite Heart: Prosecution and Redemption in the Carolingian Empire.* Leiden, 2009.

Fouracre, Paul. "Why Were so Many Bishops Killed in Merovingian Francia?" In *Bischofsmord im Mittelalter*, ed. N. Fryde and D. Reitz, 13-35. Göttingen, 2003.

Frankopan, Peter. *The First Crusade: The Call from the East.* Cambridge, MA, 2012.

Friedman, John Block. *The Monstrous Races in Medieval Art and Thought.* Syracuse, 2000.

Gabriele, Matthew. *An Empire of Memory: The Legend of Charlemagne, the Franks, and Jerusalem before the First Crusade*. Oxford, 2011.

Gaddis, Michael. *There is No Crime for Those Who Have Christ: Religious Violence in the Christian Roman Empire*. Berkeley, 2005.

Gaposchkin, Cecilia. *Invisible Weapons: Liturgy and the Making of Crusade Ideology*. Ithaca, 2017.

Garrison, Mary. "The *Missa pro principe* in the Bobbio Missal." In *The Bobbio Missal: Liturgy and Religious Culture in Merovingian Gaul*, ed. Yitzhak Hen and Rob Meens, 187-205. Cambridge, 2004.

Gillmor, Carroll. "War on the Rivers: Viking Numbers and Mobility on the Seine and Loire, 841-886." *Viator* 19 (1988): 79-109.

——. "Aimon's *Miracula Sancti Germani* and the Viking Raids on St. Denis and St. Germain-des-Prés." in *The Normans and their Adversaries at War*, ed. Richard Abels and Bernard Bachrach, 103-128. Woodbridge, 2002.

Gillis, Matthew Bryan. *Heresy and Dissent in the Carolingian Empire: The Case of Gottschalk of Orbais*. Oxford, 2017.

——. "Pleasures of Horror: Florus of Lyons's *Querela de divisione imperii*." In *Carolingian Experiments*, ed. Matthew Bryan Gillis. Turnhout, forthcoming.

——. "The Worm and the Corpse: Carolingian Visions of Gehenna's Undead Cemetery." *Journal of Medieval History* (forthcoming).

——. "Dreaming of Saint Germain: Violence, Visions and Holy Vengeance in the *Translatio sancti Germani Parisiensis*." In *In this Modern Age: Medieval Studies in Honour of Paul Edward Dutton*, ed. Courtney Booker and Anne Latowsky. Budapest, forthcoming.

Glatthaar, Michael. *Bonifatius und das Sakrileg: Zur politischen Dimension eines Rechtsbegriffs*. Frankfurt am Main, 2004.

Godman, Peter. *The Poetry of the Carolingian Renaissance.* Norman, 1985.

Goldberg, Eric. "Hincmar of Reims, Carloman II, and the *De ordine palatii*," (unpublished paper).

——. *In the Manner of the Franks: Hunting, Kingship, and Masculinity in Early Medieval Europe.* Philadelphia, 2020.

Graus, František. *Volk, Herrscher und Heiliger im Reich der Merowinger* (Prague, 1965).

Grounds, Duard. *Miracles and Punishment and the Religion of Gregory of Tours and Bede.* Vienna, 2015.

Gübele, Boris. *Deus vult, Deus vult. Der christliche heilige Krieg im Früh- und Hochmittelalter.* Ostfildern, 2018.

Hagger, Mark. *Norman Rule in Normandy, 911-1144.* Woodbridge, 2017.

Hartmann, Wilfried. *Kirche und Kirchenrecht um 900: Die Bedeutung der spätkarolingischen Zeit für Tradition und Innovation im kirchlichen Recht.* Hannover, 2008.

Head, Thomas. *Hagiography and the Cult of Saints: The Diocese of Orleans, 800-1200.* Cambridge, 1990.

Hedeager, Lotte. *Iron Age Myth and Materiality: An Archeology of Scandinavia, AD 400-1000.* New York, 2011.

Hedwig, Andreas, see: Elmshäuser Konrad.

Heinzelmann, Martin. *Gregory of Tours: History and Society in the Sixth Century*, trans. Christopher Carroll. Cambridge, 2001.

Higham, Nicholas. *The English Conquest: Gildas and Britain in the Fifth Century.* Manchester, 1994.

History and Politics in Late Carolingian and Ottonian Europe: The Chronicle *of Regino of Prüm*, trans. Simon MacLean. Manchester, 2009.

Iversen, Gunilla. "*Psallite regi nostro, psallite:* Singing 'Alleluia' in Ninth-Century Poetry." In *Sapientia et Eloquentia: Meaning and Function in Liturgical Poetry, Music, Drama, and Biblical Commentary in the Middle Ages*, ed. Gunilla Iversen and Nicolas Bell, 9-58. Turnhout, 2009.

——. *Laus angelica: Poetry in the Medieval Mass.* Turnhout, 2010.

Jaser, Christian. *Ecclesia maledicens: Rituelle und zeremonielle Exkommunikationsformen im Mittelalter*. Tübingen, 2013.

Kalmanofsky, Amy. *Terror All Around: The Rhetoric of Horror in the Book of Jeremiah*. New York, 2008.

Keefe, Susan. *Water and Word: Baptism and the Education of the Clergy in the Carolingian Empire*, 2 volumes. Notre Dame, 2002.

Kershaw, Paul. *Peaceful Kings: Peace, Power and the Early Medieval Political Imagination*. Oxford, 2011.

Koeniger, Albert Michael. *Die Militärseelsorge der Karolingerzeit. Ihre Recht und ihre Praxis*. Munich, 1918.

Koziol, Geoffrey. "Charles the Simple, Robert of Neustria, and the *vexilla* of Saint-Denis." *Early Medieval Europe* 14 (2006): 355-390.

——. "Is Robert I in Hell? The Diploma for Saint-Denis and the Mind of a Rebel King (Jan. 25, 923)." *Early Medieval Europe* 14 (2006): 233-267.

——. *The Politics of Memory and Identity in Carolingian Royal Diplomas: The West Frankish Kingdom (840-987)*. Turnhout, 2012.

——. *The Peace of God*. Leeds, 2018.

Kristeva, Julia. *The Powers of Horror: An Essay on Abjection*, trans. Leon Roudiez. New York, 1982.

Kuefler, Matthew. *The Making and Unmaking of a Saint: Hagiography and Memory in the Cult of Gerald of Aurillac*. Philadelphia, 2014.

Lapidge, Michael. "The Hermeneutic Style in Tenth-Century Anglo-Latin Literature." *Anglo-Saxon England* 4 (1975): 67-111.

Leclercq, Jean. "Le florilège d'Abbon de Saint-Germain." *Revue du Moyen Âge latin* 3 (1947): 113-140.

Lendinara, Patrizia. "The Third Book of the *Bella Parisiacae urbis* by Abbo of Saint-Germain-des-Prés and its Old English Gloss." *Anglo-Saxon England* 15 (1986): 73-89.

——. "A Difficult School Text in Anglo-Saxon England: the Third Book of Abbo's *Bella Parisiacae urbis*." *Leeds Studies in English* n.s. 37 (2006): 321-342.

——. "Glossing Abbo in Latin and the vernacular." in *Rethinking and Recontextualizing Glosses: New Perspectives in the Study of Late Anglo-Saxon Glossography*, ed. ead., Loredana Lazzari and Claudia di Sciacca, 475-508. Porto, 2011.

Lionarons, Joyce Tally. *The Homiletic Writings of Archbishop Wulfstan*. Woodbridge, 2010.

Little, Lester. *Benedictine Maledictions: Liturgical Cursing in Romanesque France*. Ithaca, 1993.

Lösslein, Horst. *Royal Power in the Late Carolingian Age: Charles III the Simple and His Predecessors*. Cologne, 2019.

MacLean, Simon. *Kingship and Politics in the Late Ninth Century: Charles the Fat and the End of the Carolingian Empire*. Cambridge, 2003.

Madden, Thomas. *The Concise History of the Crusades*, 3rd ed. New York, 2013.

Magnou-Nortier, Elisabeth. "The Enemies of the Peace: Reflections on a Vocabulary, 500-1100." In *The Peace of God. Social Violence and Religious Response in France around the Year 1000*, ed. Thomas Head and Richard Landes, 58-79. Cornell, 1992.

Manitius, Max. *Geschichte der lateinischen Literatur des Mittelalters: Erster Band: Von Justinian bis zur Mitte des zehnten Jahrhunderts*. Munich, 1965, reprint of 1911 edition.

McCormick, Michael. *Triumphal Rulership in Late Antiquity, Byzantium and the Early Medieval West*. Cambridge, 1986.

——. "The Liturgy of War in the Early Middle Ages: Crisis, Litanies, and the Carolingian Monarchy." *Viator* 15 (1984): 1-23.

Meens, Rob. *Penance in Medieval Europe, 400-1050*. Cambridge, 2014.

Meyers, Jean. *L'Art de l'emprunt dans la poésie de Sedulius Scottus*. Paris, 1986.

Mills, Robert. See Bildhauer, Bettina.

Moss, Candida. *The Myth of Persecution: How Early Christians Invented a Story of Martyrdom*. New York, 2013.

Nagy, Piroska. "La notion de Christianitas et la spatialisation du sacré au Xe siècle: un sermon d'Abbon de Saint-Germain." *Médiévales* 49 (2005): 1-15.

Nelson, Janet. "The Church's Military Service in the Ninth Century: A Contemporary Comparative View?" In *Politics and Ritual in Early Medieval Europe*, ead., 117-132. London, 1986.

——. *Charles the Bald*. New York, 1992.

——. "The Franks, the Martyrology of Usuard, and the Martyrs of Cordoba." In *Martyrs and Martyrologies*, ed. Diana Wood, 67-80. Oxford, 1993.

Noth, Albrecht. *Heiliger Krieg und Heiliger Kampf in Islam und Christentum. Beiträge zur Vorgeschichte und Geschichte der Kreuzzüge*. Bonn, 1966.

Paderborner Repertorium des deutschsprachigen Textüberlieferung des 8. bis 12. Jahrhunderts at www.handschriftencensus.de/7591 (accessed on September 2, 2019).

Page, Christopher. *The Christian West and its Singers: The First Thousand Years*. Yale, 2010.

Palmer, James. *The Apocalypse in the Early Middle Ages*. Cambridge, 2014.

——. *Early Medieval Hagiography*. Leeds, 2018.

The Peace of God: Social Violence and Religious Response in France around the Year 1000, ed. Thomas Head and Richard Landes. Ithaca, 1992.

Perkins, Judith. *The Suffering Self: Pain and Narrative Representation in the Early Christian Era*. New York, 1995.

Phelan, Owen. *The Formation of Christian Europe: The Carolingians, Baptism, and the* Imperium Christianum. Oxford, 2014.

Poupardin, René. *Recueil des chartes de l'abbaye de Saint-Germain-des Prés*, 2 vols. Paris, 1901-1932.

Price, Merrall Llewelyn. *Consuming Passions: The Uses of Cannibalism in Late Medieval and Early Modern Europe*. New York, 2003.

Price, Neil. *The Vikings in Brittany*. London, 1989.

Prinz, Friedrich. *Klerus und Krieg im früheren Mittelalter*. Stuttgart, 1971.

Quentin, Henri. *Les martyrologes historiques du Moyen Âge*, 2nd ed. Paris, 1908.

Reimitz, Helmut. *History, Frankish Identity and the Framing of Western Ethnicity, 550-850*. Cambridge, 2015.

Ridyard, Susan. *The Royal Saints of Anglo-Saxon England*. Cambridge, 1988.

Rigg, A.G., see Adams, Anthony.

Roberts, Michael. *The Humblest Sparrow: The Poetry of Venantius Fortunatus*. Ann Arbor, 2009.

Romig, Andrew. *Be a Perfect Man: Christian Masculinity and the Carolingian Aristocracy*. Philadelphia, 2017.

Rosenwein, Barbara. "Feudal War and Monastic Peace." *Viator* 2 (1972): 129-158.

——. *Emotional Communities in the Early Middle Ages*. Ithaca, 2006.

——. *Generations of Feeling: A History of Emotions, 600-1700*. Cambridge, 2015.

Rubenstein, Jay. *Armies of Heaven: The First Crusade and the Quest for Apocalypse*. New York, 2011.

——. *The First Crusade: A Brief History with Documents*. New York, 2015.

Sarti, Laury. *Perceiving War and the Military in Early Christian Gaul (ca. 400-700 A.D.)*. Leiden, 2013.

——. "Der merowingisiche Heilige als Krieger." In *Die Militarisierung der Heiligen in Vormoderne und Moderne*, ed. Liliya Berezhnaya, 83-99. Berlin, 2020.

Scharff, Thomas. *Die Kämpfe der Herrscher und der Heiligen. Krieg und historische Erinnerung in der Karolingerzeit.* Darmstadt, 2002.

——. "Karolingerzeitliche Vorstellungen vom Krieg vor dem Hintergrund der romanischen-germanischen Kultursynthese." In *Probleme einer germanisch-romanischen Kultursynthese in Spätantike und frühem Mittelalter*, ed. Dieter Hägermann, Wolfgang Haubrichs and Jörg Jarnut with Claudia Giefers, 473-490. Berlin, 2004.

——. "Die Heiligen im Kampf gegen die Normannen." In *Die Militarisierung der Heiligen in Vormoderne und Moderne*, ed. Liliya Berezhnaya, 101-125. Berlin, 2020.

Schneider, Gerhard. *Erzbischof Fulco von Reims (883-900) und das Frankenreich.* Munich, 1973.

Le siége de Paris par les Normands: poème du IXe siècle, ed. and trans. Henri Waquet, 2nd ed. Paris, 1964.

Silvestre, Hubert. "Un second témoin manuscrit de la séquence 'Dominus caeli rex.'" *Revue bénédictine* 91 (1981): 169-171.

Sizgorich, Thomas. *Violence and Belief in Late Antiquity: Militant Devotion in Christianity and Islam.* Philadelphia, 2009.

Smith, Katherine Allen. *War and the Making of Medieval Monastic Culture.* Woodbridge, 2011.

Sot, Michel. *Un historien et son Èglise au Xe siècle: Flodoard de Reims.* Paris, 1993.

Stone, Rachel. *Morality and Masculinity in the Carolingian Empire.* Cambridge, 2012.

Szarmach, Paul. "The (Sub-) Genre of the Battle of Maldon." In *The Battle of Maldon. Fiction and Fact*, ed. J. Cooper, 43-61. London, 1993.

Taylor, Anna. *Epic Lives and Monasticism in the Middle Ages, 800-1050.* Cambridge, 2013.

Throop, Susanna. *Crusading as an Act of Vengeance, 1095-1216.* Farnham, 2011.

Tudor, Andrew. "Why Horror? The Peculiar Pleasures of a Popular Genre." In *Horror, The Film Reader*, ed. Mark Jancovich, 47-56. New York, 2002.

van der Lugt, Maaike. *Le ver, le démon et la vierge. Les théories médiévales de la génération extraordinaire. Une étude sur les rapports entre théologie, philophie naturelle et médecine.* Paris, 2004.

van Rhijn, Carine. *Shepherds of the Lord: Priests and Episcopal Statutes in the Carolingian Period.* Turnhout, 2007.

Viking Attacks on Paris: The Bella parisiacae urbis *of Abbo of Saint-Germain-des-Prés*, ed. and trans. Nirmal Dass. Paris, 2007.

Vikingerne i Paris, trans. Niels Skyum-Nielsen. Munksgaard, 1967.

Vogel, Walther. *Die Normannen und das fränkische Reich bis zur Gründung der Normandie (799-911).* Heidelberg, 1906.

Wagner, Anne, see: Dumézil, Bruno.

Werner, Karl Ferdinand. "Adelsfamilien im Reich Karls des Großen," in *Vom Frankenreich zur Entfaltung Deutschlands und Frankreichs: Ursprünge—Strukturen—Beziehungen. Ausgewählte Beiträge.* Sigmaringen, 1984.

——. "Gauzlin von Saint-Denis und die westfränkische Reichsteilung von Amiens (März 880). Ein Beitrag zur Vorgeschichte von Odos Königtum." In *Vom Frankenreich zur Entfaltung Deutschlands und Frankreichs: Ursprünge—Strukturen—Beziehungen. Ausgewählte Beiträge*, 157-224. Sigmaringen, 1984.

West, Charles. "'Fratres, omni die videtis cum vadit istud regnum in perdicionem': Abbo of Saint-Germain and the Crisis of 888." In *The Collapse of the Early Medieval European Kingdoms (8th-9th Centuries)*, ed. Iñaki Martín Viso, *Reti Medievali Rivista* 17 (2016): 301-317.

Zettel, Horst. *Das Bild der Normannen und der Normanneneinfälle in westfränkischen, ostfränkischen und angelsächsichen Quellen des 8. bis 11. Jahrhunderts.* Munich, 1977.

INDEX